



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

Becoming cornered

Migration, masculinities and marginalisation in inner-city Johannesburg

Musariri, L.

Publication date

2021

Document Version

Other version

License

Other

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Musariri, L. (2021). *Becoming cornered: Migration, masculinities and marginalisation in inner-city Johannesburg*. [Thesis, externally prepared, Universiteit van Amsterdam].

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, P.O. Box 19185, 1000 GD Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

UNIVERSITEIT VAN AMSTERDAM



BECOMING CORNERED:

migration, masculinities & marginalisation
in inner-city Johannesburg

Linda Musariri

Becoming Cornered: Migration, Masculinities and Marginalisation in Inner-City Johannesburg

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus
prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,
in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel
op woensdag 17 februari 2021, te 13.00 uur

door Linda Musariri
geboren te Harare

Promotiecommissie

Promotor:	dr. E.M. Moyer	Universiteit van Amsterdam
Copromotores:	prof. dr. L.H. Manderson dr. K. Krause	University of the Witwatersrand Universiteit van Amsterdam
Overige leden:	prof. dr. A. Mol prof. dr. F.B. Nyamnjoh prof. dr. R.K. Jaffe prof. dr. W. Janssens dr. R.P.M. Gerrets dr. D.V. Vigneswaran	Universiteit van Amsterdam University of Cape Town Universiteit van Amsterdam Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam Universiteit van Amsterdam Universiteit van Amsterdam

Faculteit der Maatschappij - en Gedragwetenschappen

Becoming Cornered: Migration, Masculinities and Marginalisation in Inner-City Johannesburg

Copyright © 2021 Linda Musariri

All rights reserved. No part of this thesis may be reproduced, stored or transmitted in any way or by any means without the prior permission of the author, or when applicable, of the publishers of the scientific papers.

The financial assistance of the National Research Foundation (NRF) (UID104618) towards this research is hereby acknowledged. Opinions expressed and conclusions arrived at, are those of the author and are not necessarily to be attributed to the NRF.

Cover Design: Collage by Chiratidzo Chiweshe-Saruro | @StudioChiratidzo

Design and Layout: Chiratidzo Chiweshe-Saruro | @StudioChiratidzo

(Cover Images Source: @mwangi-gatheca | Unsplash.com)

UNIVERSITEIT VAN AMSTERDAM

**BECOMING
CORNERED:**

migration, masculinities & marginalisation
in inner-city Johannesburg

Linda Musariri

Dedication

For my daughter Kiara Nokutenda. Who told you, you couldn't? Gen 3:11

In memory of my brother Tendai Musariri and Apostle Paul Kamba (migrant men who lost their lives in South Africa during the course of this study). Both their lives serve as a testimony to the reality of the multifaceted everyday violence in South Africa.

To the memory of my grandfather Mereki Nyahasha, who died in South Africa in the 1970s having been one of the many migrant men scouted by the Witwatersrand Native Labour Association (WNLA) from Rhodesia to work in the mines so as to raise money to pay hut tax. These men's sweat, blood and tears remain the formidable foundation upon which Johannesburg, the City of Gold, now majestically stands.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements

xii

Chapter 1: Introduction

Violence in South Africa _____	3
Aim and main argument of the study _____	4
Study questions _____	7
Situating the study and its contribution _____	8
The double crisis: masculinities and migration in post-apartheid South Africa _____	9
Masculinities, crisis and gender-based violence in South Africa _____	13
Masculinities, crisis and alternatives to violence _____	16
Migrant men's contribution to masculinity scholarship in South Africa _____	17
Study context: masculinities in Johannesburg's inner city _____	19
Study sites _____	22
Chapter outline _____	22

Chapter 2: Emergent ethnography: fieldwork reflections, context and methods

Introduction _____	27
Going into the field, study design and becoming cornered _____	29
Finding new possibilities: Kukiya kiya methodology _____	33
Fear and familiarity in Johannesburg inner city: locating myself, selecting my research sites and recruiting participants _____	34
Blurring the lines: researching the familiar, going native _____	39
Migrant studying migrants: research subjects _____	41
Legal, social and economic status of study participants _____	42
Legal papers and the paradox of belonging _____	43
'Migrant woman studying men in a dangerous place'? _____	44
Data collection methods _____	48
Ethical considerations _____	49
Conclusion _____	51

Chapter 3: Theorising becoming cornered: masculinities and structural violence

Introduction _____	55
Becoming cornered and structural violence _____	58
Masculinities _____	60
» Hegemonic masculinities: problematic and positive masculinities	61
Disrupting hegemonic masculinities _____	61
Beyond hegemonic masculinities: conceptualising cornered masculinities _____	63
» Street-corner masculinities	64
» Masculinities and space	65
Becoming creative in corner spaces: Kukiya Kiya _____	69
» Anthropology of becoming and frontier Africans	72
» Becoming cornered	74
Conclusion _____	75

Chapter 4: 'A black man is a cornered man': unpacking structural violence among migrants in Johannesburg's inner city

Finding Uncle Kofi's Corner _____	79
Introducing Uncle Kofi's Corner _____	81
Using Uncle Kofi's Corner to conceptualise cornered masculinities _____	82
The corner as a site of becoming _____	83
Case Studies _____	84
» Case 1: 'This is what our government has reduced us to'	84
» Case 2: The corner becoming home	87
» Case 3: You are just thrown, you have to swim'	90
Discussion _____	92
» Defining a man	92
» Becoming cornered: exploring structural violence among migrant men	94
» Redefining masculinities using kukiya kiya	97
» Redefining 'respectability' and 'responsibility'	98
» Constructing distinguished masculinities	99
» Becoming morally respectable men	100
» Redefining Conditions in Intimate Relationships Conclusion	102
Conclusion _____	102

Chapter 5: 'Becoming a good man': interventions, gender-based violence and HIV

Introduction _____	107
Towards a gender-transformative approach _____	110
Case Studies _____	113
» Case Study 1: Solving problems: engaging boys in a gender-transformative community dialogue	113
» Case Study 2: Becoming the new man: unpacking the process of transformation..	121
» Becoming the role model	125
» The role of knowledge in becoming a role model	126
» Becoming positioned to access resources	128
» Negotiations and inconsistencies: the journey of becoming	129
Discussion _____	133
Conclusion _____	135

Chapter 6: 'All men are considered rapists': gender-based structural aiolence among migrants

Introduction _____	141
Background _____	143
» Gender-based violence in South Africa: what quantitative data show	144
» Sexual offences	146
» Murder	147
'You can't leave women out of the equation': provision woes as gendered violence _____	149
On love and the law _____	153
When 'perpetrator' becomes victim _____	156
'It's just [like] any other crime': gendered violence as an outcome of structural inequalities _____	158
Intersection of gender-based violence and class among migrants _____	159
Migration and the patriarchal dividend _____	162
Becoming spiritual: the demonisation of violence _____	163
Conclusion _____	167

Chapter 7: 'A man with a woman's heart': friendship, kinship and belonging among cornered migrants

Introduction _____	171
Care and gender _____	175
Care, masculinities and migration _____	177
Care, crisis and corner citizenship _____	178
Case 1: 'These are my people, they have been good to me' – Uncle Kofi's Corner as a caring community _____	180
Case 2: 'I became his brother': redefining kinship in a 'foreign' land _____	182
Case 3: 'It's difficult to make other friends': redefining kinship in a foreign land _____	184
Case 4: When culture is irrelevant _____	187
Discussion _____	189
» Unpacking the complexity of care	189
» Beyond gender transformation: care and corner citizenship	191
» Migration and understanding of masculinities	193
Conclusion _____	195

Chapter 8: Conclusion

Introduction _____	199
Associations between marginalisation and gendered violence in migrant populations _____	202
Masculinities, marginalisation and alternatives to violence _____	205
» Understanding practices of violence and care as processes	207
Concluding remarks _____	211

References	215
-------------------	-----

Annexes	228
----------------	-----

Summary	232
----------------	-----

Samenvatting	240
---------------------	-----

Acknowledgements

This journey has not been easy; it was marked by so many ups and downs, going back and forth. I couldn't have made it had it not been for a formidable team of individuals who held my hand emotionally, professionally, financially and spiritually. I want to acknowledge those who encouraged and strengthened me along the way. My family and friends who began calling me Dr. the very day I enrolled for my studies. All throughout they had addressed me as such making me feel like a fraud while at the same time reminding me there was no going back.

Firstly, I acknowledge the support given by the National Research Foundation of South Africa for the financial support through the Freestanding, Innovation and scarce skills Award that fully funded the 4 years of my PhD studies. I also acknowledge the Amsterdam Institute of Social Science Research for the financial and administrative support.

I want to appreciate my supervisor Prof. Eileen Moyer for affording me this opportunity for starters and then holding my hand all the way. Your encouragement, support always garnished with dashes of humor made it easy for me. You brought opportunities my way that seemed bigger than me. But those comments e.g. 'just be yourself' always left me wondering if you really knew me. Feeling like an impostor, I was afraid of being caught out. But your consistency and unwavering support made me believe that maybe you actually saw something in me that I never saw. You convinced me to believe in myself which became the greatest asset I walk away with from this journey. An example of such an opportunity is you linking me up with Prof. Lenore Manderson. When I googled her and so how a big name she is, I felt so small. I couldn't bear the thought of embarrassing myself. But a big thank you to Lenore Manderson, my co-supervisor, you never made me feel small. You loved the idea of 'becoming cornered' the very first time I told you the story when I was still in the field. And through your support and your meticulous eye we worked on the idea to its maturation. I also want to thank my co-supervisor Dr. Kristine Krause. After our first meeting, I thought you were going to write an email to Eileen pulling out as my supervisor. During that meeting you had asked me if I read all the 'must reads' for anyone doing research in Africa. I had read none of it and you asked me 'what have you read?' and I went blank. You were with me from that blank state and you were actively involved in every step right to the very end. I am grateful to all my three supervisors for this faith in me.

I also thank my defense committee, for taking time to review my dissertation. I appreciate your efforts and valuable comments; Prof. Annemarie Mol, Prof. Francis Nyamnjoh, Prof. Rivke Jaffe, Prof. Wendy Janssen, Dr. Rene Gerrets, Dr. Vigneswaran.

This manuscript would not be in existence had it not been for the many men and women who participated in this study. I do not take for granted the time you gave me and how you opened up your lives and families to me. A big thanks to Uncle Kofi, Roby, Malume, Kuda, Claude, Josh, Santos, Africa, Linda, Precious and Michael. I am indebted to 'Cousin Tino', Mabhena, Pancho, Zunza, Mary, TK and many others that I cannot mention.

I also want to acknowledge the Becoming Men team, for being part of this journey right from conception. The constructive criticism, pomodoros, friendships, cook outs, sisterhood and doodling were the needed ingredients to make this worthwhile. Jasmine Shio (my day one roommate who became my sister in law, the long walks and talks and Sunday times at church were all too precious). Carolyne Egesa, (my midnight friend always ready to lend a hand and an ear during the long walks from UvA), Sarita Fae (I appreciate the random love funny stickers, long walks and deep conversations), David Bukusi (Daktari- always stretching my brain as we reflect on various issues of life.), Jeroen Lorist (Rra! I appreciate those deep talks, faith, NGOs and of course Deleuze) Lucy Mungai (for bringing that warmth and the professional feel to the group), Katlego (for always brightening the room) - thank you all for the friendships and asides. A big thank you to our senior members who were always encouraging and supportive Dr. Gavaza Maluleke, Dr. Danya Fast, Dr. Emma Kageha, Dr. Chris Wasike. A big thank you to Kathleen for keeping this assemblage going. Always nice and quick to assist. Thank you to Erin for bringing warmth and love even in your edits.

I also acknowledge the Becoming Men adopted 'kids', my friends who became sisters Amisa Bakuri (my constant voice of reason and encouragement) and Yvette Ruzibiza (your genuineness and honesty provided that safe space to be vulnerable). Where would I be without 'Write that Thesis', and Dilys Amoabeng my family of choice. You guys read and commented on every one of my chapters. What began as an academic platform became a space to share everything else but school, which was very necessary to provide the needed balance. I also acknowledge my PhD colleagues, neighbours (Jacques Veltmanstraat) and friends at AISSR Lieve de Cock, Shahana Siddiqui, Dina Zbeidy, Eva Eon. A big thank you to all friends and colleagues who read parts of manuscripts in different stages i.e. Writing Care group and those helped prepare for my defense: Dina Zbeidy, Danya Fast, Mercilene Machisa, Apostolos Andrikopoulos, Gavaza Maluleke, Amisah Bakuri, Carol Egesa, Jasmine Shio, Carole Amman, Yvette Ruzibiza, Jeoren Lorist, Dilys Amoabeng, A special thank you to my paranymphs Amisa and Sarita, for being there for me. I appreciate you.

To Rene Gerrets, thank you for being a constant support from the beginning. Annemarie Mol and Jean Comaroff, that one email of encouragement had an impact that lasts a lifetime. To AISSR staff, Muriel Kiesel, Janus Oomen, Marc van Steekelenburg and to the NRF team Nelson Komane, Zodwa Mahlangu, thank you

for being ever efficient and willing to help at all times. I acknowledge Wits School of Public Health, for accommodating me during my fieldwork. I also acknowledge Chiratidzo Chiweshe-Saruro (my name sake) for the amazing design. Thanks, so much Chi for visually interpreting my ideas.

My core support came from my family. When I had felt like packing my bags and go back to (South) Africa and I realised it wasn't only my bag that I needed to pack, I had 4 other human beings that I had uprooted and dragged along. Feeling cornered I realised the best and fair option was to stay and push through. It ceased to be about me and indeed this journey proved to be more of a collective pursuit than it was my personal baby. So firstly, I thank my family, my kids Kupa, Tare and Kiara, for being my number 1 reason of soldiering on and for being highly independent. I could not have pulled through had you been 'high maintenance' kids. I cannot thank my husband, enough. Thank you, Remo, for holding the fort, taking care of the kids and the household while I went out into the woods to hunt. Indeed, you are a model of positive masculinities though you adamantly refused my theory of you as a gender equitable man. Thank you for enduring having to read my very first rough drafts of things that didn't make sense to me... let alone you. Of course, this could not have been possible without the continued support and love of my mother in law. You even made that long trip from Zimbabwe to Netherlands to come and babysit while I do my fieldwork. I am also grateful to my father in law for the same support and to my brother in law and my other kids: Tanya, Brandon and Mbali. To the Rueb family, thank you for making us part of your family. You made our settling into this country a lot easier as you showed us the ropes and welcoming us into your lives just like that. I appreciate you.

I am grateful to you my brothers, Tendai, you have been my pillar from the beginning of this journey, you took us to the airport the very first time we left South Africa for the Netherlands, you were the one always coming to pick me up from the airport, you drove me around as I did my fieldwork. You ran my never-ending errands while I was away, you fixed and looked after my house, you did everything I asked of you without complaining. Until that fateful day you left us (27 June 2020). Forever great for your life, mwana wamai. You finished your race well. To my second brother Farai, you were my right-hand man throughout this project, accompanying me to the field as my body guard that you had always been from childhood. You had always looked out for me and your faith in me astounds me. To Aleck my first best friend, you remain the constant support in my life. Your humor lightens my mood and reminds me to look on the brighter side of life. To my young brother Herbert, I hope I have inspired you to want better for your life. To my sisters, Sis Mai Simba, Sis Rosa, Sis Christiana, Sis Blessing, Sis Patricia, Mashie, not only are you supportive sisters, you are also my prayer partners. What a blessing that is. I also acknowledge ana mai vangu (my mothers) Mai Chipo, Sekuru Nyahasha and Sekuru Philip.

To my sisters in love Mai Clara, Mai 2 and Mai Mutsa, thank you so much for being there. To, my many nephews and nieces, just knowing I have a whole tribe looking up to me motivates me to keep going. Simba (sonny-my driver and runner), Tariro, Marian, Kuda, Oscar, Clara, Kuzi, Jo, Pau, Rumbi, Kudzi, Kuda, Farai Jr, Mutsa, Miki, Aleck Jr, Yeukai, Chelsea, Charlize, Simba Kandiye, Simba Nzuwa, Ashy, Kiri (hama yangu), Rudo (for the time we spent during my fieldwork).

I also want to thank my friends for the emotional support and for reminding me there is more to life than PhD. My all-time friends, Sindiso, Elder Christine, Gloria, Tsitsi, Tumisang, Olivia, Trish, Rumbidzai, Shamiso, Lucia, Mwenda, Linna, RuTendo, Christine, Sekai, Jolanda.

I could not have done this without the spiritual stamina needed for such a draining journey. There are many who stood with me spiritually, my mentor, the Prayer Coach Apostle Samuel Tegule and the Watchmen Family. Pastor Stanley and Maranatha Ministries provided the needed weekly dose of the Word of God and accompanying spiritual energy. Elder, Glo, Charlize – my prayer partners. The Praying Sisters, this is one testimony emanating from our altar. To God be the glory!

Above all else to God be the glory who by his grace has chosen me in my weaknesses to manifest his strength. My source of wisdom, the giver of all knowledge and understanding, the sustainer of life. Without, him I am nothing. And for him I cast down my crown and I forgo all titles to the glory of his name forever more!