



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

Lifecycles of cultural heritage in conflict

Destruction, reconstruction and representation in Syria and Iraq

Munawar, N.A.

Publication date

2021

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Munawar, N. A. (2021). *Lifecycles of cultural heritage in conflict: Destruction, reconstruction and representation in Syria and Iraq*. [Thesis, fully internal, Universiteit van Amsterdam].

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, P.O. Box 19185, 1000 GD Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.



LIFECYCLES OF CULTURAL HERITAGE IN CONFLICT
Destruction, Reconstruction and Representation in Syria and Iraq



Nour Allah MUNAWAR

LIFECYCLES OF CULTURAL HERITAGE IN CONFLICT
Destruction, Reconstruction and Representation in Syria and Iraq

Nour Allah MUNAWAR

LIFECYCLES OF CULTURAL HERITAGE IN CONFLICT

Destruction, Reconstruction and Representation
in Syria and Iraq

Nour Allah MUNAWAR

Lifecycles of cultural heritage in conflict
Destruction, Reconstruction and Representation in Syria and Iraq

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus
prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,
in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Aula der Universiteit
op woensdag 19 mei 2021, te 14.00 uur

door Nour Allah Munawar
geboren te Aleppo

Promotiecommissie

Promotores:

prof. dr. J. Symonds
prof. dr. B. Kempers

Universiteit van Amsterdam
Universiteit van Amsterdam

Overige leden:

prof. dr. J.A. Baird
prof. dr. W.M.H. Hupperetz
prof. dr. R. van der Laarse
prof. dr. I.A.M. Saloul
prof. dr. U.Ü. Üngör
dr. G.F.J. Plets
dr. C. de Cesari

Birdbeck University of London
Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam
Universiteit van Amsterdam
Universiteit van Amsterdam
Universiteit van Amsterdam
Universiteit Utrecht
Universiteit van Amsterdam

Faculteit der Geesteswetenschappen

To my parents, Bara'a and Usama, whom I have admired and who have been the key motive to carry on with this research...

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to thank many people for their support, inspiration, help and advice, and naming everyone would require a long list. The following names only a few of those that have helped or inspired me, and my gratitude goes to these individuals and many others. It is worth mentioning that every single minute spent on writing and editing this book has kept my memories alive and prevented me from forgetting the destruction and manipulation of the Middle East's memory and heritage that I witnessed while living in Syria and abroad.

This dissertation owes much to the constructive comments and the continuous support offered by my PhD thesis promoters, Prof. James Symonds, and Prof. Bram Kempers. Without their guidance, advice, and encouragement, I would have never been able to finish this research. Special thanks go to the person who handpicked me from drowning in the waves of diaspora and forced migration miseries. Thank you, James, for every second you spent helping me becoming the academic person I now am.

Conducting this research without funds seems to be a difficult task, therefore I thank Scholars at Risk network and their staff for funding the first year of my research. A “thank you” word in the acknowledgement would not be sufficient to the University of Amsterdam (UvA), the entity that provided me with a funded four-year PhD fellowship. It was a great honour to be a staff member of one of the oldest Dutch and European Universities.

I thank the UCL Qatar who facilitated my research visit and helped me finding my way around Doha, in particular, Alexandra, Sarra, Nancy, Patrick, Marian, Catharina, Ludmilla, Kathy, Gosia, Judy, Paul, Simona, and all the staff members and students of the UCL Qatar.

Much gratitude goes to my friends and collages at the University of Amsterdam (UvA), Marijn, Lindsay, Jan, Dana, Aga, Laura, Nermin, Anna, Emily, Loes, Aniek, Pamela, Inge, Patricia, Chiara, Ugur, Gertjan, Jill, Martina, Letje, Marc, Mirjam, Rob, Carolyn, Ihab, Renè, Jobien, Gerdien, Annet, Tamara, and all the staff members and students of the University of Amsterdam, Amsterdam School for Heritage, Memory and Material Culture (AHM), and Amsterdam Centre for Ancient Studies and Archaeology (ACASA). A special thank you to my two paranymphs, Marijn Stolk and Jöella van Donkersgoed, who assisted me through the unforgettable experience of the PhD defence ceremony.

Finishing my PhD between Qatar and the Netherlands, has provided me with the opportunity to exchange knowledge, meet, and discuss my research with people from different places. Many thanks to my friends and colleagues from the Arab Centre for Research and

Policy Studies, for their support during my stay in Doha. My gratitude goes to Dr Azmi Bishara, Dr Sultan Barakat, Dana El-Kurd, Isra, Ihab, Ayat, Mohammad, Sofia, Ibraheem, and many others.

During the past four years, I had the opportunity to present my research in different Universities in Europe, America and the Middle East which gave me the opportunity to meet with many people and discuss with them my research. Many thanks to Cornelius Holtorf, Lynn Meskell, Gertjan Plets, Trinidad Rico, Dan Hicks, Sarah Mallet, Rachael Kiddey, Pavel Vařeka, Laura McAttackney, Christina Næss, Ghattas Sayej, Youssef Kanjou, Anas Al-khabour, Benjamin Isakhan, Dacia Viejo Rose, Zaki Aslan, Jens Notroff, Francesca Piazzoni, Jose Antonio Zarandona, Zena Kamash, Jen Baird, Filippo Carla-Uhink, Maja Gori, Fokke Gerritsen, Nurcan Yalman, Helena Rydén, and many others.

I thank all my friends in the Netherlands, Poland, and beyond who helped me through this incomparable journey, in particular Ahmad, Rogéria, Abdullah, Marta, Fayssal, Anastasia, Max, Despina, and Hellen who have been supporting me from the first day I arrived in the Netherlands. Special thanks go to all my friends who are inside and outside of Syria and Palestine who supported me with listening and their constructive comments.

Much gratitude goes to my siblings, with whom I shared the miseries and anguishes of displacement which started from Aleppo in summer 2012. Our journey has evidently watered the seeds, which our parents implanted in us, in a way that conforms with the famous French novel, *The Three Musketeers*, 'One for all and all for one'. Therefore, one single word of thank you to my siblings, Hisham, Baha'a, Mohammed, Abdulrahman, Joud Allah, Berlant, Bayan, and Qamar, would not be sufficient. Your care and support have been endless. Thank you for believing in me. Also, a thank you to the last clusters in our family, my little nieces Bara'a Jr. Meryem, Ayla, and Usama whose birth gave us the much-needed hope during the unprecedented life-events that our family witnessed.

Last but not least, special thanks go to my brother Abdulrahman Munawar, who was the first person to grant me a lifejacket by supporting me pursuing my dreams in academia in Europe and beyond. His help and efforts have been extraordinarily seeking to help me and my siblings encounter several crucial incidents that occurred since June 2012. Helping me and my siblings to overcome Syria's war, the displacement trauma, loss of our parents during the war, and most importantly the loss of our beloved home in Aleppo and many others constant efforts that are ongoing will never be forgotten.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgments	vii
Table of Contents	ix
List of Figures and Tables	xiii
Abbreviations	xvi
Introduction	21
Research Aims and Questions	24
Research Methods, Disciplines and Literature Review	27
Research Relevance	32
Chapter I	
A Tale of Contested Heritage	
Introduction	38
Heritage	38
Cultural Heritage and Cultural Property: The Western Approach	40
Cultural Heritage and Cultural Property: The Non-Western Approach	43
Endangered Heritage	45
The Consequences of Human Modernity	47
Urban Planning and Heritage	50
Cultural Heritage Within City Centres	52
Cultural Heritage and Conflict	54
The Values of Heritage and Heritage of Values	56

Conclusion	61
------------	----

Chapter II

Cultural Heritage and The Arab Spring

National and International Responses Towards Safeguarding Heritage Under Fire (2011 – 2018)

Introduction	66
International Non-Governmental Organisations (INGOS and IGOS)	68
Non-Governmental Organisations	79
National and Governmental Organisations	83
Associations and Networks	85
Research Institutions and Museums	86
Conclusion	90

Chapter III

Lessons from the Past

Rebuilding Heritage in Post-Conflict Times

Introduction	96
Post Second World War Rebuilding of Berlin	98
Introduction	98
Heritage and Nazism in Pre-War Germany	98
Rebuilding Berlin	101
Heritage Reconstruction in Pre-War Syria	106
Introduction	106
Heritage Destruction and Reconstruction in Ottoman Syria	109
Syria's Heritage under the French Mandate	111
Syria under the Rule of Hafez Al-Assad	112

Lebanon	116
Introduction	116
Rebuilding Beirut in the Aftermath of Lebanon’s Civil War	117
Post-July War Reconstruction of Beirut	120
Conclusion	123

Chapter IV

Politics of Heritage Reconstruction in Conflict Zones: Palmyra

Introduction	128
Palmyra and Syria’s Conflict	129
Who Cares about Palmyra, and Why?	134
Conclusion: Reconstructing Palmyra and the Way Forward	138

Chapter V

Public Archaeology

Heritage, People and Conflicts

Introduction	144
Heritage, Colonialism, Ba’athism in The Middle East	146
Public Archaeology and War: Aleppo and Mosul	154
Public Archaeology and Post-War Reconstruction	161
Post-War Recovery and Heritage	166
Conclusion	168

Chapter VI

Competing Heritage

Curating the Post-Conflict Heritage of Roman Syria

Introduction	172
Heritage, Memory and Politics	173
Syria's Roman Heritage and War	179
The Ugly Truth: All Heritage is At Risk	180
Cultural Heritage, War and World Community	182
The Narrative of Winners: An Attempt to Rewrite History	183
From Destruction to Construction	186
Conclusion	189
Chapter VII	
Heritage as a Therapy and Politics of Remembrance	
Introduction	194
Theorising Cultural Heritage Reconstruction	197
Heritage, Social Relevance and Future	203
Between Aleppo And Mosul: Capitals of The North	208
Politics of Memory: Writing the War Narrative	223
Conclusion	234
Heritage Reconstruction: Challenges and the Ways Forward	
Summary	242
Samenvatting	250
Bibliography	256

List of Figures and Tables

Figure 1.1 Geographical distribution of Hafez Al-Assad statues destroyed between 2011 and 2015	49
Table 1.1 Typologies of heritage values up until 1995	59
Table 1.2 Typologies of heritage values from 1996	61
Figure 2.1 Aleppo: capital of Islamic Culture 2006	75
Figure 2.2 The Emergency Safeguarding of the Syrian Heritage project partners	78
Figure 3.1 Ruins of the Reichstag Building in Berlin, July 1946	99
Figure 3.2 Destruction of Berlin's City Centre displaying the Berlin Palace (<i>Stadtschloss</i>) and Cathedral, 1945	101
Figure 3.3 President of the United States of America, Truman in Front of Berlin Palace (<i>Stadtschloss</i>) in Berlin, July 1945.	103
Figure 3.4 Bab al-Faraj clock tower, Aleppo, Syria 2011	108
Figure 3.5 The Hejaz Railway Station in Damascus, Syria 2005	109
Figure 3.6 French Post Card of Damascus City After the Destruction of <i>Sidi Amoud</i> Quarter	110
Figure 3.7 The Sykes–Picot Agreement Map Between the UK and France 1916	111
Figure 3.8 Images of the destruction of Hama City in the aftermath of Hama Massacre 1982.	114
Figure 3.9 Destruction of Hama 1982 in the aftermath of the Muslim Brotherhood Uprising.	114
Table 3.1 Military Coups in Syria since the Independence from France in April 1946.	116
Table 3.2 Represent the Religious Affiliations of People in Lebanon – Palestinian And Syrian Refugees are not Included.	117
Figure 3.10 Destruction of the Commercial Centre of Beirut During the Civil War.	118
Figure 3.11 Destruction of Beirut During the July 2006 War.	121
Figure 3.12 Al-Nejmeh Square in the Heart of Beirut City Centre, August 2012.	123
Figure 4.1 <i>DAESH</i> Blowing Up Baal-Shamin Temple, 25 August 2016.	130
Figure 4.2 Arch of Triumph of Palmyra, 31 March 2016.	132
Figure 4.3 Temple of Bel, 31 March 2016.	133

Figure 4.4 Russian Orchestra and Putin’s Speech, 06 May 2016.	135
Figure 4.5 Boris Johnson, former Mayor of London (2008-2016), Looks on as the Scale Replica of Palmyra’s Triumphal Arch is Unveiled in Trafalgar Square.	137
Figure 5.1 The Great Umayyad Mosque of Aleppo.	145
Figure 5.2 Great Mosque of al-Nuri in Mosul and its leaning minaret, June 2013	146
Figure 5.3 The king of Babylon Nebuchadnezzar (c. 605 – c. 562 BCE) and former Iraqi President Saddam Hussein (1979 – 2003) on a metal medal with gold coloured coating, commemorating a Festival held at Babylon in 1987.	149
Figure 5.4 A portrait representing the former Iraqi president Saddam Husein, the Muslim Leader Saladin (1174–1193 AD) and the king of Babylon Nebuchadnezzar (c. 605 – c. 562 BCE).	151
Figure 5.5 Map of SSNP flag over the greater Syria land.	152
Table 5.1 Human Casualties in Aleppo From the Beginning Of 2011 to the Present	156
Figure 5.6 The Great Umayyad Mosque of Aleppo after destruction, December 2016 – Cover Photo.	157
Figure 5.7 Al-Sultanyya mosque in Aleppo, in December 2016	158
Figure 5.8 A radical fighter of <i>Daesh</i> defaces the Lamassu in Nineveh in 2015.	159
Figure 5.9 Uncovering a palace, dates back to 600 BCE, beneath The Nebi Yunus shrine, which was demolished by <i>Daesh</i> in Mosul, February 2017.	160
Figure 6.1 Image of Queen Zenobia and Palmyra on the old 500 Syrian Pounds (1991).	177
Figure 6.2 Salah al-Din and Krak des Chevaliers images on the old 25 Syrian Pounds (1991).	178
Figure 6.3 Hiroshima Peace Memorial (Genbaku Dome) 2013.	188
Figure.7.1 The Geographical Distribution of the Representative Samples.	196
Figure 7.2 Age of the Representative Samples.	197
Table 7.1 Definitions of the Conservation Principles	200
Table 7.2 Reconstruction: Between Justifications and Arguments Against	201
Figure 7.3 Crosstabulation of Cultural Heritage Valuation and Gender.	206
Figure 7.4 An image of Aleppo taken in 1950s featuring the Aleppo Citadel and the Great Umayyad Mosque, Aleppo City.	209

Figure 7.5 The Great Umayyad Mosque of Aleppo – before the war	211
Figure 7.6 The Great Umayyad Mosque after the end of hostilities in Aleppo, July 2017.	213
Figure 7.7 Cumulative Satellite Imagery-based Damage Analysis of the Old City of Aleppo 2013 – 2017.	215
Figure 7.8 The Great Umayyad Mosque of Aleppo after the capture by the Syrian government, December 2016.	216
Figure 7.9 The Most Well-known and Valuable Cultural Heritage Site in Aleppo.	217
Figure 7.10 What would motivate you to return to home?	218
Figure 7.11 Heritage sites in Mosul damaged or razed during Daesh occupation June 2014 – July 2017	219
Figure 7.12 Local People valuation of the Syriac Orthodox Church in Mosul	220
Figure 7.13 Al-Hadba’ Minaret of al-Nuri Mosque of Mosul after destruction, July 2018.	221
Figure 7.14. 10,000 Dinars Iraqi Banknote, on the front side: Ibn al-Haytham (c. 965 – c. 1040 CE), an Arab mathematician, astronomer, and physicist of the Islamic Golden Age, and on the back side, al-Hadba’ minaret of the Al-Nuri mosque was portrayed.	222
Figure 7.15 A screenshot of Kontak Tv series showing White helmets fabricating chemical attacks.	224
Figure 7.16 Is there any heritage site / monument that you can NOT imagine its disappearance from Aleppo?	228
Figure 7.17 Will You Return Home After the War Ends?	229

ABBREVIATIONS

AAAS:	American Association for the Advancement of Science
AIA:	American Institute of Archaeology
AIUSA:	Amnesty International United States of America
APSA:	Association for the protection of Syrian Archaeology
ARC-WH:	Arab Regional Centre for World Heritage
ASOR:	American Schools of Oriental Research
CCNR:	Centre for Conflict, Negotiation and Recovery
CER:	Cultural Emergency Response
CHWB:	Cultural Heritage without Borders
CPMHF:	Community Peace Museums Heritage Foundation
DAESH / ISIS / ISIL:	Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant
DAI:	<i>Deutsches Archäologisches Institut</i>
DGAM:	Directorate-General of Antiquities and Museums
EAMENA:	Endangered Archaeology in the Middle East and North Africa
GHF:	Global Heritage Fund
GIAMS:	General Inventory of Artefacts in the Museums of Syria
HFP:	Heritage for Peace
ICCROM-ATHAR:	Architectural and Archaeological Tangible Heritage in the Arab Region
ICCROM:	International Centre for the Study of the Preservation and Restoration of Cultural Property
ICOM:	International Council of Museums
ICOMOS-ICORP:	International Scientific Committee on Risk Preparedness
ICOMOS:	International Council on Monuments and Sites
IDA:	Institute for Digital Archaeology
IGOs:	International Governmental Organizations
INGOs:	International Non-Governmental Organizations

INTERPOL:	International Criminal Police Organization
ISESCO:	Islamic Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
MENA:	Middle East and Northern Africa
NGOs:	Non-Governmental Organizations
OIC:	Organization of the Islamic Cooperation
PCF:	Prince Claus Fund
PennCHC:	Penn Cultural Heritage Centre
SAFE:	Saving Antiquities for Everyone
SHIRIN:	Syrian Heritage in Danger is an International Research Initiative and Network
SHOSI:	Safeguarding the Heritage of Syria and Iraq
SMRS:	Sites and Monuments Record for Syria
SYRHER:	Syrian Heritage Archive
TDA:	The Day After Association
UNESCO:	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNITAR-UNOSAT:	United Nations Institute for Training and Research
UNODC:	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
WMF:	World Monuments Fund