UNIVERSITY OF AMSTERDAM

UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

Independent refugee youth in waiting

Social navigations while in transit in Indonesia

Masardi, R.D.

Publication date
2021

Link to publication

Citation for published version (APA):
Masardi, R. D. (2021). *Independent refugee youth in waiting: Social navigations while in transit in Indonesia*. [Thesis, externally prepared, Universiteit van Amsterdam].

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, P.O. Box 19185, 1000 GD Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

UvA-DARE is a service provided by the library of the University of Amsterdam (https://dare.uva.nl)

Download date:12 Oct 2026

Independent Refugee Youth in Waiting

Social Navigations while in Transit in Indonesia

Realisa Darathea Masardi

Independent Refugee Youth in Waiting

Social Navigations while in Transit in Indonesia

Realisa Darathea Masardi

© Realisa Darathea Masardi

Cover image: “Seeing light despite all of the darkness,” photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016
Design: Dhimas Langgeng, Yogyakarta, langgengdhimasg@gmail.com
Print: GKM Printing, Yogyakarta

Independent Refugee Youth in Waiting

Social Navigations while in Transit in Indonesia

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus
prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,
in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Aula der Universiteit
op vrijdag 24 september 2021, te 14.00 uur

door Realisa Darathea Masardi
geboren te Semarang

Promotiecommissie

Promotores:	dr. G. Nooteboom	Universiteit van Amsterdam
	dr. B. Kalir	Universiteit van Amsterdam
Copromotores:	prof. dr. H.W. van Schendel	Universiteit van Amsterdam
Overige leden:	prof. dr. C.M.A. Horst	Peace Research Institute Oslo
	prof. dr. E.M. Moyer	Universiteit van Amsterdam
	prof. dr. W.J. Berenschot	Universiteit van Amsterdam
	dr. M.K. Janeja	Universiteit Leiden
	dr. O.K. Sooudi	Universiteit van Amsterdam

Faculteit der Maatschappij- en Gedragswetenschappen

For Istan, and Henri.
Also for my mother in heaven.

Table of Contents

Table of Figures viii
List of Abbreviations and Acronyms xi
Acknowledgements xiii

Chapter 1 1
Introduction

Chapter 2 40
Transit in Indonesia:
An Enabling Waiting Spot

Chapter 3 80
Age, Solitary Movement, and Narratives:
Re-examining the Stigmas of Independent Refugee Youth

Chapter 4 113
Disbelieving and Playing Roles:
Navigating the Refugee Management System in Indonesia

Chapter 5 151
Making the Ends Meet:
Navigating Refugee Economies in Indonesia

Chapter 6 181
Being Good to Acquaintances, Opening the Heart to Friends:
Navigating Relationships with Indonesian Locals

Chapter 7 209
Keep Moving Forward:
Navigating Global Youth Culture

Conclusions 240

References 255
Summary 274
Samenvatting 282

Table of Figures

Introduction

Figure 1. An independent young man lighting candles when the electricity has gone out. I present this photo to illustrate the idea that despite the many difficulties of waiting, young people keep their bodies and minds active (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) ... 9

Figure 2. A group of independent Hazara youth playing a strategy board game (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 15

Figure 3. Research locations of the multi-sited ethnography 25

Figure 4. Interviewing a Hazara young woman in the most comfortable setting for her. Interview was conducted in English (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 27

Figure 5. A Hazara young man presenting his photos during the exhibition (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 29

Figure 6. Flyer for the photo exhibition at the University of Indonesia, Depok, designed by a Hazara young man (poster credit: Kazim 2016) 29

Figure 7. One session of the photography workshop in a shelter in Jakarta (photo credit: Zardar 2016) 30

Figure 8. At the end of fieldwork, we printed some pictures that we had taken of the youth to present as a gift. The young people really appreciated this small gesture (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2017) ... 32

Chapter 2

Figure 1. Poster about Operation Sovereign Borders in the streets of Cisarua (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 43

Figure 2. Refugee registration trends in Indonesia (UNHCR Compilation 2016) 45

Figure 3. Routes from countries of origin to Indonesia 47

Figure 4. Routes from Afghanistan, Iran, and Pakistan 49

Figure 5. Routes from Ethiopia, Somalia, and Yemen 52

Figure 6. Routes from Sri Lanka 54

Figure 7. Refugee resettlement departures from Indonesia, 2015 to 2019 (UNHCR, n.d.) 63

Figure 8. Location of refugee population in Indonesia as of May 31, 2016 (DGI 2016) 65

Figure 9. Contrasting conditions in IDC Pekanbaru (left), IOM

community housing in Medan (center), and the interception hotel in Pekanbaru (right) (Henri Ismail 2016) 67
Figure 10. Underage independent refugees queuing for their weekly allowance in the CWS office (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 69
Figure 11. Young independent refugees from Sri Lanka, Somalia, and Yemen dressed up for the Voice of Refugee Charity Night, September 2016 (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 69
Figure 12. Youth accommodation in Indonesia: a cell inside an IDC, Pekanbaru (left); a room in a CWS shelter for minors, Jakarta (center); and accommodation for underage youth under the IOM and Department of Social Affairs, Medan (right) (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 71

Chapter 3
Figure 1. Independent young boys from 8 to 17 years old sharing a room in a CWS shelter for minors (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 93
Figure 2. Somali independent women in IOM community housing in Medan. Some of them live in separate accommodation to their husbands (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 97
Figure 3. Some youths continue their education in self-organized learning centers while in transit and learn English to prepare for their future education in a resettlement country. These pictures were taken in the Refugee Learning Nest (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 107

Chapter 4
Figure 1. Refugee Resettlement Facts (UNHCR 2016) 126
Figure 2. Population of UASC 2014 and 2015 in Indonesia (UNHCR Compilation 2016) 131
Figure 3. An independent refugee boy celebrates his 13th birthday in a CWS shelter. More underage independent youth are travelling alone to Indonesia (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 131
Figure 4. An independent young man who was rumored as being over 18 years old by his peers in the shelter. However, no one talk about it openly (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 132
Figure 5. Trends of the Women and Children Populations in Indonesia 2013-2015 (UNHCR Compilation, 2016) 137
Figure 6. A refugee family sleeping in front of the UNHCR Jakarta to demand accommodation and financial support. If they fail, they will conduct self-reporting to Jakarta IDC (left); families and independent men self-reporting to the immigration office in Pekanbaru (right) (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 141
Figure 7. A Hazara independent youth holding a sign during a

demonstration in front of the UNHCR office, Jakarta (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2017) 149

Chapter 5

Figure 1. "List of Duties during Week" in a rented house of six independent young men (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 154
Figure 2. A group of independent young men in Jakarta eat bread and beans on a daily basis and usually skip breakfast (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 156
Figure 3. A female volunteer teacher reads a story to her students in a refugee-led learning center 169

Chapter 6

Figure 1. Independent young men, an older refugee, their landlady, and myself, sharing Indonesian and Hazaragi food for lunch. Some independent refugee youth develop close relationships with their Indonesian hosts (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 184
Figure 2. An underage independent Hazara boy chooses to pray in the shelter rather than in a local mosque (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 193
Figure 3. A Somali independent young man regularly visits the local Mosque for Friday prayers (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 197
Figure 4. A Hazara young woman in Cisarua learns Bahasa Indonesia (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 204

Chapter 7

Figure 1. Somaya in Bogor Botanical Garden (Photo credit: Somaya's friend 2016) 210
Figure 2. Portraits of the FC Shahin team. They made their t-shirts, inspired by the Refugee Olympic Team at the 2016 Olympic Games (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2017/ News Deeply) 215
Figure 3. Independent refugee youth staying in a CWS shelter in Jakarta train together in a futsal field (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 217
Figure 4. Alex, Hamza, and Abdii posing before recording a song (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 220
Figure 5. Hazara young women playing futsal in a sports center in Cisarua (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 225
Figure 6. Facebook pages and groups related to refugees in Indonesia, December 2016 232
Figure 7. An independent young man posing with his pictures inside his room in IOM accommodation in Pekanbaru. He sometimes posted his drawings on his Facebook page (photo credit: Henri Ismail 2016) 234

List of Abbreviation and Acronyms

AIDS	: Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
Basarnas	: Badan Nasional Pencarian dan Pertolongan [National Search and Rescue Agency]
CED	: Comedy, Entertainment, and Documentary Studio
CWS	: Church World Service
CREC	: Cipayung Refugee Educational Center
CRLC	: Cisarua Refugee Learning Center
DGI	: Directorate General of Immigration
DSA	: Department of Social Affairs
EUR	: Euro
FC	: Football Club
FIFA	: Fédération Internationale de Football Association
FPIS	: Forum Pembela Islam [Islamic Defenders Front]
GMDAC	: Global Migration Data Analysis Centre
HIV	: Human Immunodeficiency Virus
IOM	: International Organization for Migration
ISJAI	: International Symposium of Journal of Anthropology Indonesia
ID	: Identification
IDCs	: Immigration Detention Centers
IT	: Information Technology
ISIS	: Islamic State of Iraq and Syria
JRS	: Jesuit Refugee Service
K-Pop	: Korean Pop
KRL	: Kereta Rel Listrik [Commuter Line Train]
LGBTQI	: Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer, Intersex
MSA	: Ministry of Social Affairs
NGO	: No-Governmental Organization
OISFF	: Olleh International Smartphone Film Festival
PM	: Prime Minister
PhD	: Doctor of Philosophy
Polsek	: Kepolisian Sektor
Puskesmas	: Pusat Kesehatan Masyarakat
RLC	: Refugee Learning Center

RLN	: Refugee Learning Nest
RPSA	: Rumah Perlindungan Sosial Anak [Safe House for Children]
RSD	: Refugee Status Determination
SC	: Separated Children
SGBV	: Sexual and Gender-Based Violence
SUAKA	: Indonesian Civil Society Association for Refugee Rights Protection
UAM	: Unaccompanied Minor
UASC	: Unaccompanied and Separated Children
UM	: Universiti Malaya
UNHCR	: United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UN	: United Nation
UPM	: Universiti Putra Malaysia
US	: United State
USA	: United State of America
UUM	: Universiti Utara Malaysia

Acknowledgements

First of all, I would like to express my gratitude to all of the independent young refugees and everyone in the refugee community who welcomed me and shared their life stories with me. Thank you to the young people for trusting me and letting me try to develop friendships with you. Thank you for showing me your enormous strengths, which at times felt very surreal, but which successfully taught me that hope is a powerful force that fuels people's ability to endure many difficulties and uncertainties. I also owe a debt of gratitude to the activists and social workers who work with refugee communities in the field, who were willing to share their experiences to enrich my perspective. Writing about independent refugee youth has allowed me to evolve as an anthropologist, as I learnt to write or argue not only things that are politically correct, but also to be braver and take the difficult path: unfolding the bitter truths about people's choices and perspectives, which led to the construction of more complex and multifaceted images of those I have written about. And if I have not grown into a better anthropologist, surely I am now a more honest one after finishing this dissertation.

The journey of my PhD would have been much more challenging if I had not received full support from my three wonderful supervisors: Dr. Gerben Nooteboom, Prof. Dr. Willem van Schendel, and Dr. Barak Kalir. Gerben Nooteboom, as my "daily supervisor," supported me tremendously, both academically and mentally. He always found a way to encourage me to keep writing, provided valuable comments so that I could make good progress, and always advised me constructively on how to amend and improve the structures and language use of my thesis. Gerben

always read my chapter drafts carefully and provided detailed and constructive comments on every page. During the finalization phase of this dissertation, he worked as hard as I did to improve the chapters by working day and night, providing last minute suggestions and pointing to any gaps. Gerben is the father figure in my PhD's ups and downs, who was all ears when I needed to talk about my anxieties and problems. I also thank his lovely family: his wife Yolanda and his children Aaron, Elis, and Timo for opening their door to me and my family to have occasional weekend breaks at their home and sometimes to cook Indonesian meals together. Their warm welcome brought a great deal of comfort to me and my family and made us feel less isolated being far away from our massive extended family back home in Indonesia.

I also owe a debt of gratitude to Dr. Barak Kalir, as the migration expert in this team. His academic productivity and deep involvement in the area of migration studies facilitated me a great deal in terms of understanding the current theoretical debates on migration, border practices, and the lives of migrants themselves. His critical approach also reminded me to consider the multi-level perspectives (macro, meso, and micro) when conducting ethnography. Barak's academic-activist positionality in the migration debate also inspired me to produce a thesis that will contribute to the condition of the refugee population in Indonesia. In the midst of my doubts on how to speak to the larger academic debate, Barak suggested various updated reading materials that were highly relevant. I also thank Barak for the opportunity to learn a lot about the global migration issue through my participation in some of the workshops and discussions within his research project, "The Social Life of State Deportation Regimes," with other PhD researchers and postdocs. For a scholar who was previously more focused on the issues of children and young people, I gained a great deal of knowledge about global migration during my interactions with this group.

Prof. Dr. Willem van Schendel was the "quality controller" of my research and dissertation writing. His stimulating questions in all of our supervision meetings always struck me and forced me to think bigger about the discussion in the chapters. His critical and reflective approach helped me a lot to sharpen my arguments and maintain my consistency in focusing on the perspectives of young

refugees when analyzing my findings. During Willem's visit during my fieldwork at the end of 2016, we visited refugee communities in Cisarua and met some independent youth in Jakarta. His effortless warmth and kindness captured the hearts of the refugees. They were truly excited to meet a professor, and he patiently answered all of their questions. In our discussion afterward, Willem made some reflections from his observations in the field on topics that I had not been thinking about. Such stimulation was priceless in my struggle to make sense of everything I encountered during the research. Willem's passion for photography was also a big support for Henri and I, both to use and to write more about the use of visual methods in this research. He encouraged us to create something else with the visual data – a photo book, a photo exhibition, and a methodology article about using visual methods in ethnographic research – which I have promised to do in the near future.

My PhD would not have been possible without a generous scholarship from Lembaga Pengelola Dana Pendidikan (LPDP), Republic of Indonesia, which covered my doctoral program for four years, facilitating me to conduct my fieldwork and dissertation writing. Thanks to this scholarship, I was also able to bring my family to accompany me in Amsterdam. I also received financial support from Universitas Gadjah Mada to finalize my dissertation writing after the LPDP scholarship had ended. I thank the institution greatly for its generosity.

I also wish to express my appreciation to the academics who helped me to improve my dissertation. I thank Antje Missbach for several discussions during my research period and also during my dissertation writing. Thank you for the encouragement to participate in some events and also for your kind suggestions on my chapters. I am also grateful to Dave Lumenta and Rhino Ariefiansyah for the collaborations during my fieldwork, and for Avyanti Azis for the discussions. I also thank Bram Jansen for the rich discussion on the context refugees' strategies and tactics. There are several emerging Indonesian scholars who also focus on migration issues in Indonesia, and I have had many productive discussions with them: Mahardhika Sudrajad, Ainul Fajri-Gazali, Mutiara Pertiwi, and all the researchers in the "Diskusi Kepo Jurnal." Thanks also to the refugee activists who see refugee issues as more than just a job and gave me priceless insight into the

matter: Lars Stengers, Gading Gumilang Putra, Trish Cameron, Febionesta, Enny Suprapto, as well as other fellow officers at CWS, UNHCR, IOM, JRS, Dompet Dhuafa, Yayasan Buddha Tzu Chi, and SUAKA.

It has been a delight to be part of the Moving Matters group in the Department of Anthropology at the University of Amsterdam. Aside from my supervisors, I have gained input and suggestions from several prominent scholars in the group: Rosanne Rutten, Olga Sooudi, Tina Harris, Yatun Sastramidjaja, Gerry van Klinken, Laurens Bakker, Erella Grassiani, Shanshan Lan, Luisa Steur, and from the wonderful post-doc researchers Katerina Rozakou, Ioana Vrabiescu, and Cecilia Vergnano. The academic community in Moving Matters is very welcoming and fun! I thank my first year mates Willy Sier, Lieke Wissink, Anastina Kalius, Maria Isabel Moncayo, Sanderien Verstappen, Tania Salerno, Busarin Lertchavalitsakul, Thijs Schut, Lex Kuiper, Yukari Sekine, and Edda Bild. I also thank other members of the flex-room for their friendship: Vita Febriany, Arum Candra Hayuningsih, Ratna Hanani, Karim, Ilan Amit, Sara Rizoti, Oil Jiraporn, Arnoud Zwemmer, Nur Isdah Idris, Diana Pakasi, Prio Sambodo, Farwiza, Fajri Siregar, Kyana Dipananda, Budi Endratno, Bono Priambodo, Sarita, and Leo Douw.

I owe a special thank you to the administrative staff at the University of Amsterdam: Murriel Kiesel, Danny van der Pool, Christina Garofalo, Janus Oomen, Yomi van der Veen, Karen Kraal, Nicole Schulp, Alix Nieuwenhuis, and Hermance Mettrop. Thanks also to Jose Komen and Joan Schrijvers, who no longer work at the university. I really appreciate your great big help and patient in dealing with me in all these years.

I thank Amanda O'Byrne my lovely roommate in my first year who taught me how to survive in Amsterdam. Thank you for the memorable time when we cook and talk together. I miss you so much! Also for Marjolein van Pagee for introducing the artsy side of Amsterdam when I just arrived and also for the nice discussions and the companion; and for translating the summary of my dissertation into Dutch.

The Indonesian community in the Netherlands was also a great support for me during my study period. I want to thank the Indonesian PhD students at the AISSR: Enny, Annisa, and Nilma.

Thanks also go to Lea Pamungkas, Insan, and oma opa for the barbeque invitation in their lovely garden every summer and to Frieda Amran for making us feel at home in the Netherlands. I also thank Friska Fadillah, Evi Sutrisno, Edith Bons, Artien Utrecht, Bambang Ponco, Theo Pramono, Bang Aip, Koes Komo, and their families for the fun times in Amsterdam. Thanks also to my long-time fellows from Antro-UGM, who are/were also doing their PhD in the Netherlands: Des Christy, Gaffari Rahmadian, and Runavia Mulyasari. Thanks for the relaxing holidays we spent together and for the unlimited support we shared! In the finalizing phase of my dissertation, I had to stay alone without my family for three months in the Netherlands. I owe a big thank you to Widya Fitria Ningsih, Uji Nugroho, Ekaningrum Damastuti and their family, who allowed me to stay at their beautiful house and lock myself up the whole day to write. Thank you so much for the warm welcome and especially for the very delicious cooking and fun chats with you all.

I would not have been able to finish my dissertation without the support of my colleagues: all of the lecturers at the Department of Anthropology, Gadjah Mada University. I am very grateful that I was allowed some flexibilities to finish my studies. I especially thank Pujo Semedi, the then Dean of the Faculty of Cultural Science when I started my PhD and now Head of the Department of Anthropology, for his support and encouragement. Thanks also to all the lecturers in the Department of Anthropology: Bambang Hudayana, Pande Made Kutanegara, Atik Triratnawati, Setiadi, PM Laksono, Heddy S Ahimsa-Putra, Lono LS, Irwan Abdullah, Suzie Handajani, Agus Indiyanto, M. Zamzam Fauzanafi, Mubarika DF, Sita Hidayah, Agung Wicaksono, Khidir Marsanto, Elan Lazuardi, M. Yusuf, Wiwiek Sushartami, and also to Laksmi Savitri who is no longer working at UGM. Also for the administrative staffs in Faculty of Cultural Science UGM: Tutik Sri Handayani, Sarwo Pribadi, Rahmad Gunawan, Dewi Widyastuti, and Pongki CA Nugroho for their support and assistance during my study.

I could not have completed this dissertation without the help of some talented people. I especially thank Wahyu Kuncoro, who helped me to conduct a study on refugee representations in Indonesian online media; Widha Ayu Anggarani, who made me the beautiful maps in the chapters; Zoe Goldstein, for helping

me to edit the language in the dissertation; Vallery Kendira, for editing the graphics and glossary; and also to Dhimas Langgeng, for lay-outing and creating the beautiful cover for this book.

My parents and younger sisters have always have been an unconditional support throughout my life, including my PhD life. During this dissertation writing, I have been mostly away and absent from my duties of being a "good daughter and sister." The biggest regret I have regarding my doctoral phase is that I was not able to be with my mother when she passed from cancer. Losing her is very painful for us all, but I have always had the great support and understanding of Bapak Rudi and my sisters (Leony, Naomi, Vella). I cannot thank them enough for the love and care they showed me in many difficult times while finishing this dissertation.

Also for Emak Vonny and Opa Koen, my parents in law, for their love and patient especially in taking care of me during my early pregnancy while doing fieldwork in Jakarta. Big thanks to Ingrid, James, and Una who have been great social supports for my little family all these years. And for oom Suntiono Wibowo and family who lent us a tough motorcycle to do the fieldworks in mountainous Bogor, thank you so much!

I also thank my long term best friends Elina and Ami, and all 'tenk-tenk', the sisters of my heart. Thank you for always be there for me, through thick and thin.

Last but not least, I save my greatest gratitude for Henri and Istan, my little family, for their constant companionship during this whole process. Henri is not only a supportive visual research partner in the field, but most importantly he is a very loyal and caring husband. He gave up all of his passions and his career in Indonesia to accompany me all the way to finish my PhD. Our days are not always sunny, but he is always there for me and keeps me strong. He never fails to make us his priority. Istan arrived in the middle of my dissertation writing. He is a happy-go-lucky boy who enjoys travelling to many places. He has accompanied me as I have presented papers at conferences and joined a summer course. I could not ask for a better and more understanding son. The dissertation is finished now, and I dedicate this book to Henri and Istan: the two loves of my life.