



## UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

### Liberalism's dangerous religions

*Enlightenment legacies in political theory*

Blijdenstein, A.E.E.

#### Publication date

2021

[Link to publication](#)

#### Citation for published version (APA):

Blijdenstein, A. E. E. (2021). *Liberalism's dangerous religions: Enlightenment legacies in political theory*. [Thesis, fully internal, Universiteit van Amsterdam].

#### General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

#### Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, P.O. Box 19185, 1000 GD Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

# Liberalism's Dangerous Religions



Enlightenment Legacies  
in Political Theory

Anna Blijdenstein

**Liberalism's Dangerous Religions.  
Enlightenment Legacies in Political Theory**

Anna Blijdenstein

Graphic Design: Mahtab Zamanifar  
Cover Photography: Diana Scherer

Printer: Repros, Amsterdam

© Copyright, 2021, Anna Blijdenstein  
ISBN: 978-90-9035181-0

The research for/publication of this doctoral thesis received financial assistance from the Dutch Research Council (NWO). This publication is part of the project *Critique of Religion: Framing Jews and Muslims in Public Debate and Political Theory* with project number 327-25-009 of the research program *Religion in Modern Society*.

**Liberalism's Dangerous Religions.  
Enlightenment Legacies in Political Theory**

**ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT**

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor  
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam  
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus  
prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex

ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,  
in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel  
op donderdag 28 oktober 2021, te 16.00 uur

door Anna Elisabeth Emilie Blijdenstein  
geboren te Utrecht

## ***Promotiecommissie***

<i>Promotor:</i>	prof. dr. H.Y.M. Jansen	Universiteit van Amsterdam
<i>Copromotor:</i>	dr. M.M. Leezenberg	Universiteit van Amsterdam
<i>Overige leden:</i>	prof. dr. M. de Wilde	Universiteit van Amsterdam
	prof. dr. L.A. Bialasiewicz	Universiteit van Amsterdam
	prof. dr. C. Laborde	University of Oxford
	prof. dr. A.M.R. de Dijn	Universiteit Utrecht
	dr. D. Loick	Universiteit van Amsterdam
	dr. mr. I. Rosenthal	Universiteit van Amsterdam
	dr. C. Baumgartner	Universiteit Utrecht

Faculteit der Geesteswetenschappen

### **Publications from this thesis**

Earlier versions of two chapters of this thesis have been published before.  
Chapter three was published as:

Blijdenstein, A. 2020. Exposing Political Theory's Theological Roots: Three Caveats. *Patterns of Prejudice*, 54(1-2) , 109-122.

A major part of chapter five was published as:

Blijdenstein, A. 2015. Egalitarian Theories of Religious Freedom and the Black Box of Religion. In Bardon, A., Lee, L., Birnbaum, M. and Stoeckl, K. (Eds.). *Religious Pluralism: A Resource Book*. European University Institute, Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies, ReligioWest, 76-82.



# Table of Contents

Introduction	11
<b>The (Im)possibility of Genealogical Critique</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>Exhuming Christian Sub-structures</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>Overview of Chapters</b>	<b>24</b>

## Chapter 1:

<b>Judaism and Islam.</b>	
<b>Remaking Religion in Enlightenment Thought</b>	<b>29</b>
<b>Judaism, Islam and Europe in Enlightenment Polemics</b>	<b>34</b>
Secularizing theological tropes	37
Setting the boundaries of European civilization	39
<b>Judaism and Islam and the Problems of Religion</b>	<b>41</b>
Fanaticism and the imagination	45
Lawgivers and politicians	49
Particularism and intolerance	57
Ritual and reward: materialist religion	61
<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>66</b>

## Chapter 2:

<b>Kant's Universal Religion.</b>	
<b>Europe, Orient and the Limits of Reason</b>	<b>67</b>
<b>Judaism and the Pure Religion of Morality</b>	<b>69</b>
Politics, law and rituals: worldly considerations	70
Particularism and Christian universalism	73
Jewish conversation	75
<b>Enthusiasm, Fanaticism and the 'Islamic Mind'</b>	<b>80</b>
Fanaticism and the limits of reason	84
Islam and Judaism in Kant's Orient	91
<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>95</b>

# Chapter 3:

<b>Exposing Political Theory's Theological Roots. Three Caveats</b>	<b>97</b>
<b>Spiritual Christians, Legalistic Jews, Political Muslims</b>	<b>99</b>
<b>Theology or Politics?</b>	<b>103</b>
<b>Theology, Culture, Ethnicity, Nationality</b>	<b>106</b>
<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>109</b>

# Chapter 4:

<b>Containing a 'Destructive Potential'. Habermas on Religion in the Public Sphere</b>	<b>111</b>
<b>Religious Arguments and the Neutral State</b>	<b>113</b>
Religious truth claims and conflict	115
Religious rites, membership, and particularism	118
<b>Religion: Legitimate Speakers</b>	<b>121</b>
Reflexivity	122
The genealogy of reason and religion	124
Judeo-Christianity and Islam	126
<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>129</b>

# Chapter 5:

<b>Egalitarian Theories of Religious Freedom and the Black Box of Religion</b>	<b>131</b>
<b>Two Egalitarian Theories of Religious Freedom</b>	<b>133</b>
Rawls	133
Maclure and Taylor	135
<b>Defining Religion</b>	<b>136</b>
Religion as conscience	137
Religion as comprehensive	141
Religion, univocality and conflict	142
<b>Representation of Specific Religions: Rawls on Islam</b>	<b>145</b>
<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>147</b>

# Chapter 6:

<b>Disaggregation and Danger. Formulating a Response to Genealogical Critiques of 'Religion'</b>	<b>149</b>
<b>Taking Seriously the Critical Challenge</b>	<b>151</b>
Three strands of critique	152
Liberal philosophy and religion's dark sides	160
<b>The Disaggregative Approach to Non-establishment</b>	<b>163</b>
Disaggregation and essentialism	166
<b>Disaggregation and Dangerous Religion</b>	<b>169</b>
Islam as a security threat	170
Politicizing religious difference	176
The politicization of Islam	180
<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>184</b>

## Summative Conclusion and Discussion 187

<b>Enlightenment and the Remaking of Religion</b>	<b>189</b>
<b>Enlightenment Inheritances in Liberal Political Thought</b>	<b>192</b>
<b>What Does Religion Do?</b>	<b>194</b>
<b>Regulating Religious Symbols</b>	<b>196</b>

<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>200</b>
---------------------	------------

<b>Nederlandse Samenvatting</b>	<b>225</b>
---------------------------------	------------

<b>Dankwoord</b>	<b>235</b>
------------------	------------