



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

Shadow education in the Netherlands

The position of shadow education in the educational landscape and students' school careers

Jansen, D.

Publication date

2021

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Jansen, D. (2021). *Shadow education in the Netherlands: The position of shadow education in the educational landscape and students' school careers*.

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

RS



References

REFERENCES

* = included in meta-analysis

- Abdel-Moneim, M. A. (2021). In search of a school façade: Explaining the centrality of private tutoring among high-performing students in Egypt. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 83(5). PubMed: 102384
- Addi-Racah, A. (2019). Private tutoring in a high socio-economic secondary school in Israel and pupils' attitudes towards school learning: A double-edged sword phenomenon. *British Educational Research Journal*, 45(5), 938–960.
- Addi-Racah, A., & Dana, O. (2015). Private tutoring intensity in schools: A comparison between high and low socio-economic schools. *International Studies in Sociology of Education*, 25(3), 183–203.
- Aloe, A. M. (2014). An empirical investigation of partial effect sizes in meta-analysis of correlational data. *The Journal of General Psychology*, 141(1), 47–64.
- *Areepattamannil, S., & Kaur, B. (2013, Apr. 27). *The relationship of private tutoring to student performance in reading, mathematics, and science in 19 countries* [Panel presentation]. American Educational Research Association (AERA) Annual Meeting, San Francisco, CA, United States. Retrieved from <http://www.aera.net/Publications/OnlinePaperRepository/tabid/10250/Default.aspx>
- *Atalmis, E. H., Avgin, S. S., Demir, P., & Yildirim, B. (2016a). Examination of science achievement in the 8th grade level in Turkey in terms of national and international exams depending upon various variables. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 7(10), 152–162.
- *Atalmis, E. H., Yilmaz, M., & Saatcioglu, A. (2016b). How does private tutoring mediate the effects of socio-economic status on mathematics performance? Evidence from Turkey. *Policy Futures in Education*, 14(8), 1135–1152.
- Austin, P. C. (2008). A critical appraisal of propensity-score matching in the medical literature between 1996 and 2003. *Statistics in Medicine*, 27(12), 2037–2049.
- Baker, D. P. (2011). The future of the schooled society: The transforming culture of education in post-industrial society. In H.B. Kaplan & M.T. Hallinan (Eds.), *Frontiers in sociology of education* (pp. 11–34). Springer.
- Baker, D. P., Akiba, M., LeTendre, G. K., & Wiseman, A. W. (2001). Worldwide shadow education: Outside-school learning, institutional quality of schooling, and cross-national mathematics achievement. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 23(1), 1–17.

- Ball, S. J., & Youdell, D. (2008). *Hidden privatisation in public education*. Brussels: Education International.
- Ballantine, J. H., Hammack, F. M., & Stuber, J. (2017). *The sociology of education: A systematic analysis*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Banks, J., & Smyth, E. (2015). 'Your whole life depends on it': Academic stress and high-stakes testing in Ireland. *Journal of Youth Studies*, 18(5), 598–616.
- Bates, D., Maechler, M., & Bolker, B. (2011). lme4: linear mixed-effects models using S4 classes. *R Package Version 0.999375-39*. Retrieved from <http://CRAN.R-project.org/package=lme4>.
- Begg, C. B., & Mazumdar, M. (1994). Operating characteristics of a rank correlation test for publication bias. *Biometrics*, 50(4), 1088–1101.
- Berdowski, Z., Berger, J., & Bal, J. (2010). *Geld naast de school* [Money next to school]. Zoetermeer: Panteia.
- Bergen, N., & Labonté, R. (2020). 'Everything is perfect, and we have no problems': Detecting and limiting social desirability bias in qualitative research. *Qualitative Health Research*, 30(5), 783–792.
- Biesta, G. (2009). Good education in an age of measurement: On the need to reconnect with the question of purpose in education. *Educational Assessment, Evaluation, and Accountability*, 21(1), 33–46.
- Bisschop, P., van den Berg, E., van der Ven, K., de Geus, W., & Kooij, D. (2019). *Aanvullend en particulier onderwijs* [Supplementary and private education]. Utrecht: SEO/Oberon.
- Bodovski, K., & Farkas, G. (2008). 'Concerted cultivation' and unequal achievement in elementary school. *Social Science Research*, 37(3), 903–919.
- Bol, T., & Van de Werfhorst, H. G. (2013). The measurement of tracking, vocational orientation, and standardization of educational systems: A comparative approach (GINI discussion paper 81). Retrieved from the GINI Project website: <http://www.gini-research.org/system/uploads/532/original/81.pdf?380554366>
- Bouma, K. (2017, May 10). *Tienduizenden scholieren deden commerciële examencursus: "Vergroot kans op ongelijkheid*. [Tens of thousands of schoolchildren took commercial exam course: "Increases the chance of inequality"]. Amsterdam: De Volkskrant.
- Bourdieu, P., & Passeron, J. C. (1977). *Reproduction in education, society and culture*. London: SAGE.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2013). *Successful qualitative research: A practical guide for beginners*. London: SAGE.
- Bray, M. (1999). *The shadow education system: Private tutoring and its implications for planners*. Paris: UNESCO International Institute for Educational Planning

- (IIEP). Retrieved from <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0018/001802/180205e.pdf>
- Bray, M. (2006). Private supplementary tutoring: Comparative perspectives on patterns and implications. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 36(4), 515–530.
- Bray, M. (2009). *Confronting the shadow education system: What government policies for what private tutoring?* Paris: UNESCO IIEP. Retrieved from <http://www.iiep.unesco.org/en/confronting-shadow-education-system-what-government-policies-what-private-tutoring-12159>
- Bray, M. (2010). Researching shadow education: Methodological challenges and directions. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 11(1), 3–13.
- Bray, M. (2014). The impact of shadow education on student academic achievement: Why the research is inconclusive and what can be done about it. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 15(3), 381–389.
- Bray, M. (2020). Shadow education in Europe: Growing prevalence, underlying forces, and policy implications. *ECNU Review of Education*.
- Bray, M. (2021). Geographies of shadow education: Patterns and forces in the spatial distributions of private supplementary tutoring. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 1–18.
- Bray, M., & Kobakhidze, M. N. (2014). Measurement issues in research on shadow education: Challenges and pitfalls encountered in TIMSS and PISA. *Comparative Education Review*, 58(4), 590–620.
- Bray, M., & Kobakhidze, M. N. (2015). Evolving ecosystems in education: The nature and implications of private supplementary tutoring in Hong Kong. *Prospects*, 45(4), 465–481.
- Bray, M., & Kwo, O. (2015). Designing and implementing mixed approaches to shadow education research: Experiences and lessons in Hong Kong. In M. Bray, O. Kwo & B. Jokić (Eds.), *Researching private supplementary tutoring: Methodological lessons from diverse cultures* (pp. 149–178). Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Bray, M., & Thomas, R. M. (1995). Levels of comparison in educational studies: Different insights from different literatures and the value of multilevel analyses. *Harvard Educational Review*, 65(3), 472–491.
- Bray, M., Kobakhidze, M. N., & Suter, L. E. (2020). The challenges of measuring outside-school-time educational activities: Experiences and lessons from the Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA). *Comparative Education Review*, 64(1), 87–106.

- *Bray, M., Kobakhidze, M. N., Zhang, W., & Liu, J. (2018). The hidden curriculum in a hidden marketplace: Relationships and values in Cambodia's shadow education system. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 50(4), 435–455.
- Breen, R., & Goldthorpe, J. H. (1997). Explaining educational differentials: Towards a formal rational action theory. *Rationality and Society*, 9(3), 275–305.
- Brehm, W. C., & Silova, I. (2014). Hidden privatization of public education in Cambodia: Equity implications of private tutoring. *Journal of Educational Research*, 6(1), 94–116.
- *Buchmann, C. (2002). Getting ahead in Kenya: Social capital, shadow education, and achievement. In B. Fuller & E. Hannum (Eds.), *Schooling and social capital in diverse cultures* (pp. 133–159). Amsterdam: JAI Press.
- *Buchmann, C., Condrón, D. J., & Roscigno, V. J. (2010). Shadow education, American style: Test preparation, the SAT and college enrollment. *Social Forces*, 89(2), 435–461.
- Burman, E., & Miles, S. (2020). Deconstructing supplementary education: From the pedagogy of the supplement to the unsettling of the mainstream. *Educational Review*, 72(1), 3–22.
- Byun, S. Y. (2010). Does policy matter in shadow education spending? Revisiting the effects of the high school equalization policy in South Korea. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 11(1), 83–96.
- *Byun, S. Y. (2014). Shadow education and academic success in Republic of Korea. In H. Park & K. Kim (Eds.) *Education in the Asia-Pacific Region* (pp. 39–58). Springer.
- *Byun, S. -Y., & Pong, S. -L. (2016). Children's highbrow cultural activities and academic achievement in Hong Kong. In G. Kao & H. Park (Eds.), *Family environments, school resources, and educational outcomes* (pp. 123–148). Bingley, UK: Emerald Group Publishing.
- Byun, S., & Baker, D. (2015). Shadow education. In R. Scott, S. Kosslyn & N. Pinkerton (Eds.), *Emerging trends in the social and behavioral sciences: An interdisciplinary, searchable, and linkable resource* (pp. 1–9). Wiley, Blackwell.
- Byun, S., Chung, H. J., & Baker, D. (2018). Global patterns of the use of shadow education: Student, family, and national influences. *Research in the Sociology of Education*, 20, 71–105.
- *Chan, C., & Bray, M. (2014). Marketized private tutoring as a supplement to regular schooling: Liberal Studies and the shadow sector in Hong Kong secondary education. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 46(3), 361–388.
- Chan, V. N. M. (2019). English private tutoring in Macao: Perceptions of senior secondary three students. *ECNU Review of Education*, 2(1), 44–63.

- *Chatterjee, S. (2018). Do private tutors enhance English language ability? Regression discontinuity evidence from a policy experiment in India. *Bulletin of Economic Research*, 70(2), 139–149.
- Chen, I. C., & Kuan, P. -Y. (2021). The heterogeneous effects of participation in shadow education on mental health of high school students in Taiwan. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 18(3), 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph18031222>
- *Chen, S. Y., & Lu, L. (2009). After-school time use in Taiwan: Effects on educational achievement and well-being. *Adolescence*, 44(176), 891–909.
- Cheung, M. W. (2015b). metaSEM: An R package for meta-analysis using structural equation modeling. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 5, 1521.
- Cheung, M. W. L. (2015a). *Meta-analysis: A structural equation modeling approach*. Chichester, UK: John Wiley & Sons.
- Cheung, M. W. -L., & Chan, W. (2005). Meta-analytic structural equation modeling: A two-stage approach. *Psychological Methods*, 10(1), 40–64.
- Chih-Hao, C. (2019). Effects of private tutoring on English performance: Evidence from senior high students in Taiwan. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 68(1), 80–87.
- *Choi, Á., Calero, J., & Escardíbul, J. O. (2011). Hell to touch the SKY? Private tutoring and academic achievement in Korea. *Investigaciones de Economía de la Educación*, 6, 18–134.
- *Choi, Y., & Park, H. (2016). Shadow education and educational inequality in South Korea: Examining effect heterogeneity of shadow education on middle school seniors' achievement test scores. *Research in Social Stratification and Mobility*, 44, 22–32.
- CNV Trade Union. (2017). *'Ik geef alles wat ik kan, maar schiet toch tekort.'* Leraren over schaduwonderwijs. ['I give all I can, yet fall short'. Teachers on shadow education.]. Utrecht: CNV.
- *Cole, R. (2017). Estimating the impact of private tutoring on academic performance: Primary students in Sri Lanka. *Education Economics*, 25(2), 142–157.
- College for Tests and Exams. (2011). *Aanscherping van de exameneisen*. [Tightened exam requirements]. The Hague.
- Crozier, G., Reay, D., & James, D. (2011). Making it work for their children: White middle-class parents and working-class schools. *International Studies in Sociology of Education*, 21(3), 199–216. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09620214.2011.616343>
- *Dang, H. A. (2007). The determinants and impact of private tutoring classes in Vietnam. *Economics of Education Review*, 26(6), 683–698.

- Dang, H. A., & Rogers, F. H. (2008). The growing phenomenon of private tutoring: Does it deepen human capital, widen inequalities, or waste resources? *World Bank Research Observer*, 23(2), 161–200.
- *Davies, S. (2004). School choice by default? Understanding the demand for private tutoring in Canada. *American Journal of Education*, 110(3), 233–255.
- Dawson, W. (2010). Private tutoring and mass schooling in East Asia: Reflections of inequality in Japan, South Korea, and Cambodia. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 11(1), 14–24.
- De Geus, W., & Bisschop, P. (2017). *Licht op schaduwonderwijs. Onderzoek naar deelname aan en uitgaven voor schaduwonderwijs*. [Shedding light on shadow education: Research on participation and expenditures on shadow education]. Utrecht: SEO/Oberon.
- de Guzman, R. M., Rodriguez, S. M., & de Castro, B. V. (2018). The mediating role of shadow education (SE) participation on goal orientation, study habits, connectedness, and academic performance. In S. Tang & S. Cheah (Eds.), *Redesigning learning for greater social impact* (pp. 89–109). Singapore: Springer.
- *Devine-Eller, A. (2012). Timing matters: Test preparation, race, and grade level. *Sociological Forum*, 27(2), 458–480.
- *Dongre, A. A., & Tewary, V. (2015). Impact of private tutoring on learning levels: Evidence from India. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 50(41), 72–80.
- DUO. (2020). *Geslaagden, gezakten en gemiddelde examencijfers per instelling*. [Graduates, number of non-pass, and average exam scores by institution]. <https://duo.nl>
- Dutch Education Council. (2009). *Uitwijken en inbrengen*. [Diversion and insertion]. The Hague: Onderwijsraad.
- Dutch Ministry of Education, Culture, and Science. (2019). *Kamerbrief onderzoek aanvullend en particulier onderwijs*. [Parliamentary letter on research on supplementary and private education research]. The Hague: Rijksoverheid.
- Dutch Ministry of Education, Culture, and Science. (2021). *Kamerbrief over nadere uitwerking Nationaal Programma Onderwijs*. [Parliamentary letter on further elaboration of National Program for Education]. The Hague: Rijksoverheid.
- Dutch Parliament. (2017, January 26). *Gesprek over Schaduwonderwijs*. [Conversation about shadow education]. The Hague: Tweede Kamer der Staten-Generaal.
- Dwarkasing, A. (2012, April 11). *Eindsprint naar het examen*. [Final sprint to the exam]. Amsterdam: Trouw.
- Education Inspectorate. (2013). *The state of education in the Netherlands 2011/2012*. Utrecht: Inspectorate of Education.

- Education Inspectorate. (2014). *The state of education in the Netherlands 2012/2013*. Utrecht: Inspectorate of Education.
- Education Inspectorate. (2016). *Staat van het Onderwijs, 2014/15*. [The state of education in the Netherlands. 2014/15]. Utrecht: Inspectorate of Education.
- Education Inspectorate. (2021). *Staat van het Onderwijs 2021*. [The state of education 2021]. Utrecht: Inspectorate of Education.
- Edwards, D. B., Jr., Le, H., & Sustarsic, M. (2020). Spatializing a global education phenomenon: Private tutoring and mobility theory in Cambodia. *Journal of Education Policy*, 35(5), 713–732.
- Egger, M., Davey Smith, G., Schneider, M., & Minder, C. (1997). Bias in meta-analysis detected by a simple, graphical test. *BMJ*, 315(7109), 629–634.
- Elffers, L. (2018). *De bijlesgeneratie: De opkomst van de onderwijscompetitie* [The (private) tutoring generation: The emergence of educational competition]. Amsterdam: University of Amsterdam Press.
- Elffers, L., & Jansen, D. (2019). *De opkomst van schaduwonderwijs in Nederland: Wat weten we en welke vragen liggen nog open?* [The rise of shadow education in the Netherlands: What do we know and what questions are still open?]. Utrecht: NRO.
- Elffers, L., Fukkink, R., Jansen, D., Helms, R., Timmerman, G., Fix, M., & Lusse, M. (2019). *Aanvullend onderwijs: Leren en ontwikkelen naast de school: Een verkennende schets van het landschap van aanvullend onderwijs in Nederland*. [Supplementary education: Learning and development beyond the school: An exploratory sketch of the landscape of supplementary education in the Netherlands]. Amsterdam, Rotterdam, and Groningen: NWA.
- Elffers, L., Jansen, D., Kienhuis, W., van Leeuwen, L., Fukkink, R. G., Helms, R., & Lusse, M. (2021). *Aanvullend onderwijs in Nederland: Een verkennend beeld uit onderzoek en handvatten van en voor de praktijk*. [Supplementary education in the Netherlands: An exploratory picture from research and tools from and for practice]. Amsterdam, Rotterdam, and Groningen: NWA.
- Elt, G. (2012, April 26). *Run op examentrainingen voortgezet onderwijs*. [Run on secondary school exam trainings]. Rijswijk: ANP.
- *Entrich, S. R. (2014). Effects of investments in out-of-school education in Germany and Japan. *Contemporary Japan*, 26(1), 71–102.
- Entrich, S. R. (2015). The decision for shadow education in Japan: Students' choice or parents' pressure? *Social Science Japan Journal*, 18(2), 193–216.
- Entrich, S. R. (2018). *Shadow education and social inequalities in Japan: Evolving patterns and conceptual implications*. Gewerbestrasse: Springer.
- Entrich, S. R. (2020). Worldwide shadow education and social inequality: Explaining differences in the socioeconomic gap in access to shadow

- education across 63 societies. *International Journal of Comparative Sociology*, 61(6), 441–475.
- Enrich, S. R., & Lauterbach, W. (2019). Shadow education in Germany: Compensatory or status attainment strategy? Findings from the German LifE study. *International Journal for Research on Extended Education*, 7(2–2019), 143–159.
- Enrich, S. R., & Lauterbach, W. (2020). Gender- and SES-specific disparities in shadow education: Compensation for boys, status upgrade for girls? Evidence from the German LifE Study. *Orbis Scholae*, 14(2), 13–38.
- Epstein, J. L. (1995). School/family/community partnerships. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 76(9), 701–712.
- Exley, S. (2020). Selective schooling and its relationship to private tutoring: The case of South Korea. *Comparative Education*, 56(2), 218–235.
- Exley, S. (2021). Locked in: Understanding the ‘irreversibility’ of powerful private supplementary tutoring markets. *Oxford Review of Education*. Advanced online publication.
- Fan, X., & Nowell, D. L. (2011). Using propensity score matching in educational research. *Gifted Child Quarterly*, 55(1), 74–79.
- Fitzmaurice, H., Flynn, M., & Hanafin, J. (2020). Parental involvement in homework: A qualitative Bourdieusian study of class, privilege, and social reproduction. *International Studies in Sociology of Education*. Advance online publication.
- Forsey, M. (2013). But did it help you get to university? A qualitative study of supplementary education in Western Australia. In J. Aurini, S. Davies, & J. Dierkes (Eds.), *Out of the Shadows: The Global Intensification of Supplementary Education* (International Perspectives on Education and Society, Vol.22, pp. 171–189). Emerald Group Publishing.
- Forster, A. G., & van de Werfhorst, H. G. (2020). Navigating institutions: Parents’ knowledge of the educational system and students’ success in education. *European Sociological Review*, 36(1), 48–64.
- *Ghosh, P., & Bray, M. (2018). Credentialism and demand for private supplementary tutoring. *International Journal of Comparative Education and Development*, 20(1), 33–50.
- Ghosh, P., & Bray, M. (2020). School systems as breeding grounds for shadow education: Factors contributing to private supplementary tutoring in West Bengal, India. *European Journal of Education*, 55(3), 342–360.
- Giddens, A. (1984). *The constitution of society: Outline of the theory of structuration*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.

- Gonzalez, A., Peters, M. L., Orange, A., & Grigsby, B. (2017). The influence of high-stakes testing on teacher self-efficacy and job-related stress. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 47(4), 513–531.
- Gorard, S. (2010). Education can compensate for society – A bit. *British Journal of Educational Studies*, 58(1), 47–65.
- Guerrero, L. S. (2020). From children to parents: The role of performance shifts in private tutoring enrollment by social origins. The South Korean case. *Research in Social Stratification and Mobility*, 66.
- *Guill, K., & Bos, W. (2014). Effectiveness of private tutoring in mathematics with regard to subjective and objective indicators of academic achievement. Evidence from a German secondary school sample. *Journal of Educational Research*, 6(1), 34–67.
- *Guill, K., & Lintorf, K. (2019). Private tutoring when stakes are high: Insights from the transition from primary to secondary school in Germany. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 65, 172–182.
- Guill, K., Lüdtke, O., & Köller, O. (2020a). Assessing the instructional quality of private tutoring and its effects on student outcomes: Analyses from the German National Educational Panel Study. *British Journal of Educational Psychology*, 90(2), 282–300.
- Guill, K., Lüdtke, O., & Schwanenber, J. (2020b). A two-level study of predictors of private tutoring attendance at the beginning of secondary schooling in Germany: The role of individual learning support in the classroom. *British Educational Research Journal*, 46(2), 437–457.
- Győri, J. G., & Bray, M. (2021). Learning from each other: Expanding and deepening international research on shadow education. *Hungarian Educational Research Journal*. Advanced Online Publication.
- *Ha, T. T., & Harpham, T. (2005). Primary education in Vietnam: Extra classes and outcomes. *International Education Journal*, 6(5), 626–634.
- *Ha, Y., & Park, H. J. (2017). Can after-school programs and private tutoring help improve students' achievement? Revisiting the effects in Korean secondary schools. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 18(1), 65–79.
- Hajar, A. (2018). Exploring year 6 pupils' perceptions of private tutoring: Evidence from three mainstream schools in England. *Oxford Review of Education*, 44(4), 514–531.
- Hajar, A. (2020). The association between private tutoring and access to grammar schools: Voices of year 6 pupils and teachers in south-east England. *British Educational Research Journal*, 46(3), 459–479.

- Hajar, A., & Abenova, S. (2021). The role of private tutoring in admission to higher education: Evidence from a highly selective university in Kazakhstan. *Hungarian educational research journal*. Advanced Online Publication.
- Halliday, D. (2016). Private education, positional goods, and the arms race problem. *Politics, Philosophy & Economics*, 15(2), 150–169.
- Hallsén, S., & Karlsson, M. (2019). Teacher or friend? – Consumer narratives on private supplementary tutoring in Sweden as policy enactment. *Journal of Education Policy*, 34(5), 631–646.
- Hamid, M. O., Khan, A., & Islam, M. M. (2018). The spread of private tutoring in English in developing societies: Exploring students' perceptions. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 39(6), 868–886.
- Hamilton, L., Roksa, J., & Nielsen, K. (2018). Providing a “Leg Up”: Parental involvement and opportunity hoarding in college. *Sociology of Education*, 91(2), 111–131.
- *Han, Y., & Lee, S. (2016). Heterogeneous relationships between family private education spending and youth academic performance in Korea. *Children and Youth Services Review*, 69, 136–142.
- Hansen, B. B. (2004). Full matching in an observational study of coaching for the SAT. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 99(467), 609–618.
- Harrison, E., Drake, T., & Ots, R. (2020). finalfit: Quickly create elegant regression results tables and plots when modelling. *finalfit*. Retrieved from <https://cran.r-project.org/package=>.
- Hartmann, S. (2008). ‘At school we don’t pay attention anyway’ – The informal market of education in Egypt and its implications. *Sociologus*, 58(1), 27–48.
- He, Y., Zhang, Y., Ma, X., & Wang, L. (2021). Does private supplementary tutoring matter? The effect of private supplementary tutoring on mathematics achievement. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 84. PubMed: 102402
- Ho, D. E., Imai, K., King, G., & Stuart, E. A. (2007). Matching as nonparametric preprocessing for reducing model dependence in parametric causal inference. *Political Analysis*, 15(3), 199–236.
- Ho, L. (2021). ‘Our students do not get that equal chance’: Teachers’ perspectives of meritocracy. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 51(2), 173–193. Advanced Online Publication.
- *Hof, S. (2014). Does private tutoring work? The effectiveness of private tutoring: A nonparametric bounds analysis. *Education Economics*, 22(4), 347–366.
- Holloway, S. L., & Kirby, P. (2020). Neoliberalising education: New geographies of private tuition, class privilege, and minority ethnic advancement. *Antipode*, 52(1), 164–184.

- Holloway, S. L., & Pimlott-Wilson, H. (2020). Marketising private tuition: Representations of tutors' competence, entrepreneurial opportunities and service legitimisation in home tutoring business manuals. *British Educational Research Journal*, 46(1), 205–221.
- Hoogstand, M. (2012, May 14). *Het wordt nog erger dan vorig jaar*. [It is going to be even worse than last year]. Amsterdam: NRC Handelsblad.
- Huang, M. H. (2013). After-school tutoring and the distribution of student performance. *Comparative Education Review*, 57(4), 689–710.
- Huang, M. H. (2020). Compensatory advantage and the use of out-of-school-time tutorials: A cross-national study. *Research in Social Stratification and Mobility*, 66. PubMed: 100472
- Hulshof, N., & Timmermans, A. (2016). *Cohortonderzoek COOL5-18: Basisrapport havo-5 2012/2013 en vwo-6 2013/2014*. [Cohort study COOL5-18. Basic Report havo-5. 2012/13 and vwo-6, 2013/14]. Groningen: GION onderzoek/onderwijs.
- Hulshof, N., Timmermans, A., Keuning, J., & Naaijer, H. (2015). *Cohortonderzoek COOL5-18: Basisrapport havo-5 2009/2010 en vwo-6 2010/2011*. [Cohort study COOL5-18. Basic Report havo-5. 2009/10 and vwo-6, 2010/11]. Groningen: GION onderzoek/onderwijs.
- Hunter, J., & Cox, A. (2014). Learning over tea! Studying in informal learning spaces. *New Library World*, 115(1/2), 34–50.
- Ireson, J., & Rushforth, K. (2011). Private tutoring at transition points in the English education system: Its nature, extent and purpose. *Research Papers in Education*, 26(1), 1–19.
- Ireson, J., & Rushforth, K. (2014). Why do parents employ private tutors for their children? Exploring psychological factors that influence demand in England. *Journal of Educational Research*, 6(1), 12–33.
- Jackson, M., Khavenson, T., & Chirkina, T. (2020). Raising the stakes: Inequality and testing in the Russian education system. *Social Forces*, 98(4), 1613–1635.
- Jak, S. (2015). *Meta-analytic structural equation modelling*. New York: Springer.
- Jak, S., & Cheung, M. W. L. (2018). Testing moderator hypotheses in meta-analytic structural equation modeling using subgroup analysis. *Behavior Research Methods*, 50(4), 1359–1373.
- Jerrim, J., & Sims, S. (2019). Why do so few low- and middle-income children attend a grammar school? New evidence from the Millennium Cohort Study. *British Educational Research Journal*, 45(3), 425–457.
- Jokić, B., Soldo, A., & Dedić, Z. R. (2013). Private tutoring and social equity in Croatia and Bosnia and Herzegovina: A comparative qualitative study. In M. Bray, A. Mazawi & R. Sultana (Eds.), *Private tutoring across the*

- Mediterranean: Power dynamics and implications for learning and equity* (p. 1127). Rotterdam: Sense.
- *Jung, J. H., & Lee, K. H. (2010). The determinants of private tutoring participation and attendant expenditures in Korea. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 11(2), 159–168.
- Kang, C., & Park, Y. (2021). Private Tutoring and Distribution of Student Academic Outcomes: An Implication of the Presence of Private Tutoring for Educational Inequality. *Korean Economic Review*, 37(2), 287–326.
- Karlsson, M. (2020). A question of time and place: Student tutors' narrative identities in for- and non-profit contexts in Sweden. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 1–16.
- Katartzi, E. (2017). Youth, family and education: Exploring the Greek case of parentocracy. *International Studies in Sociology of Education*, 26(3), 310–325.
- Keizer-Mittelhaëuser, M. A., Naayer, H., Zijlsing, D., & Timmermans, A. C. (2015). *Cohortonderzoek COOL5-18: Technisch rapport meting vwo-6 in 2014*. [Cohort study COOL5-18: Technical report measurement vwo-6 in 2014]. Groningen, the Netherlands.
- Kerckhoff, A. C. (1993). *Diverging pathways: Social structure and career deflections*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Keuning, J., Hendriks, J., & Zijlsing, D. (2012a). *Cohortonderzoek COOL5-18: Technisch rapport meting havo-5 in 2010*. [Cohort study COOL5-18: Technical report measurement havo-5 in 2010]. Groningen: GION onderzoek/onderwijs.
- Keuning, J., Hendriks, J., & Zijlsing, D. (2012b). *Cohortonderzoek COOL5-18: Technisch rapport meting vwo-6 in 2011*. [Cohort study COOL5-18: Technical report measurement vwo-6 in 2011]. Groningen: GION onderzoek/onderwijs.
- Keuning, J., Zijlsing, D., Naayer, H., & Timmermans, A. C. (2015). *Cohortonderzoek COOL5-18: Technisch rapport meting havo-5 in 2013*. [Cohort study COOL5-18: Technical report measurement havo-5 in 2013]. Groningen: GION onderzoek/onderwijs.
- Kim, H. (2004). Analyzing the effects of the high school equalization policy and the college entrance system on private tutoring expenditure in Korea. *Korean Education Development Institute (KEDI) Journal of Educational Policy*, 1(1), 5–24.
- *Kim, H. (2015). Can the academic achievement of Korean students be portrayed as a product of “shadow achievement”? *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 16(1), 119–135.

- *Kim, H. (2015). Chapter 8. After-school classes in Korea: Effects on the demand for private tutoring and academic performance. In J. K. Scholz, H. Moon & S. H. Lee (Eds.), *Social policies in an age of austerity: A comparative analysis of the US and Korea* (pp. 181–232). UK: Edward Elgar Publishing.
- Kim, J. H., & Chang, J. (2010). Do governmental regulations for cram schools decrease the number of hours students spend on private tutoring? *KEDI Journal of Educational Policy*, 7(1), 3–21.
- *Kim, S., & Lee, J. H. (2010). Private tutoring and demand for education in South Korea. *Economic Development and Cultural Change*, 58(2), 259–296.
- Kim, Y. C. (2016). *Shadow education and the curriculum and culture of schooling in South Korea*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Kim, Y. C., & Jung, J. H. (2019). *Shadow education as worldwide curriculum studies*. Springer International Publishing.
- King, G., & Nielsen, R. A. (2019). Why propensity scores should not be used for matching. *Political Analysis*, 27(4), 435–454.
- Kulper, E. (2017, May 1). *Zelfs de bolleboos in de klas gaat op examentraining*. [Even the brainiac in the classroom goes on exam training]. Amsterdam: FD.
- Kwo, O., & Bray, M. (2014). Understanding the nexus between mainstream schooling and private supplementary tutoring: Patterns and voices of Hong Kong secondary students. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 34(4), 403–416.
- Kwok, P. (2004). Examination-oriented knowledge and value transformation in East Asian cram schools. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 5(1), 64–75.
- Lai, C. K. (2019). *Celebrity endorsement: A qualitative study of chain tutoring centres in the Hong Kong shadow education sector* [Doctoral dissertation, University of Leicester].
- Lareau, A. (2003). *Unequal childhoods: Class, race and family life*. Berkley, LA: University of California Press.
- *Lee, B. J., Jwa, H. S., & Lim, S. H. (2014). The effects of private tutoring and parenting behaviors on children's academic achievement in Korea: Are there differences between low- and high-income groups? *KEDI Journal of Educational Policy*, 11(2), 163–178.
- Lee, C. J., Lee, H., & Jang, H. M. (2010). The history of policy responses to shadow education in South Korea: Implications for the next cycle of policy responses. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 11(1), 97–108.
- *Lee, J. (2007). Two worlds of private tutoring: The prevalence and causes of after-school mathematics tutoring in Korea and the United States. *Teachers College Record*, 109(5), 1207–1234.

- *Lee, J. Y. (2013). *Private tutoring and its impact on students' academic achievement, formal schooling, and educational inequality in Korea*. [Doctoral dissertation, Columbia University]. Academic Commons.
- *Lee, S. (2006). *Prestige-oriented view of college entrance and shadow education in South Korea: Factors influencing parent expenditures on private tutoring Korea*. [Doctoral dissertation, Pennsylvania State University]. Electronic Theses and Dissertations for Graduate School (ETDA). <https://etda.libraries.psu.edu/catalog/7429>
- Lee, S., & Shouse, R. C. (2011). The impact of prestige orientation on shadow education in South Korea. *Sociology of Education*, 84(3), 212–224.
- Leech, N. L., & Onwuegbuzie, A. J. (2007). An array of qualitative data analysis tools: A call for data analysis triangulation. *School Psychology Quarterly*, 22(4), 557–584.
- Leenders, H., de Jong, J., Monfrance, M., & Haelermans, C. (2019). Building strong parent–teacher relationships in primary education: The challenge of two-way communication. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 49(4), 519–533.
- Li, F., Zaslavsky, A. M., & Landrum, M. B. (2013). Propensity score weighting with multilevel data. *Statistics in Medicine*, 32(19), 3373–3387.
- *Li, R. (2016). *Shadow Education in China: What is the relationship between private tutoring and students' National College Entrance Examination (Gaokao) Performance?* [Doctoral dissertation, Iowa State University]. Digital Repository. <https://lib.dr.iastate.edu/etd/15754/>
- Lipsey, M. W., & Wilson, D. B. (2001). *Practical meta-analysis*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- *Liu, J. (2012). Does cram schooling matter? Who goes to cram schools? Evidence from Taiwan. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 32(1), 46–52.
- *Liu, J., & Bray, M. (2017). Determinants of demand for private supplementary tutoring in China: Findings from a national survey. *Education Economics*, 25(2), 205–218.
- Liu, J., & Bray, M. (2020). Evolving micro-level processes of demand for private supplementary tutoring: Patterns and implications at primary and lower secondary levels in China. *Educational Studies*, 46(2), 170–187. h
- *Loyalka, P., & Zakharov, A. (2016). Does shadow education help students prepare for college? Evidence from Russia. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 49, 22–30. DOI: 10.1016/j.ijedudev.2016.01.008
- Lucas, S. R. (2001). Effectively maintained inequality: Education transitions, track mobility, and social background effects. *American Journal of Sociology*, 106(6), 1642–1690.

- Luellen, J. K., Shadish, W. R., & Clark, M. H. (2005). Propensity scores: An introduction and experimental test. *Evaluation Review*, 29(6), 530–558.
- Luo, J., & Forbes, K. (2019). 'It's a plus rather than a must': Perspectives of mainstream teachers in China on the influence of advertised educational ethos in supplementary English education. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 1–19.
- Lyceo. (2012). *Scholieren bewust van nieuwe exameneisen*. [Students aware of new exam requirements]. Press release Tutoring Company. Retrieved from <https://www.yumpu.com/nl/document/read/20474321/scholieren-volledig-bewust-van-nieuwe-exameneisen-lyceo>
- Maanen, H. J. (2014, May 1). *Niet chillen, maar blokken: Animo voor examentraining groeit*. [Don't chill out, but cram: Enthusiasm for exam training grows]. Arnhem: Omroep Gelderland.
- Mahmud, R. (2019). Mixed implications of private supplementary tutoring for students' learning. *International Journal of Comparative Education and Development*, 21(1), 61–75.
- Mahmud, R., & Kenayathulla, H. B. (2018). Shadow education: Patterns and scale of private supplementary tutoring in English in secondary education at urban Dhaka in Bangladesh. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 48(5), 702–716.
- Malik, M. A. (2017). Shadow education: Evolution, flaws and further development of the term. *Social Sciences and Education Research Review*, 4(1), 6–29.
- Manzon, M., & Areepattamannil, S. (2014). Shadow educations: Mapping the global discourse. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 34(4), 389–402.
- *Matsuoka, R. (2015). School socioeconomic compositional effect on shadow education participation: Evidence from Japan. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 36(2), 270–290.
- Matsuoka, R. (2019). Concerted cultivation developed in a standardized education system. *Social Science Research*, 77, 161–178.
- McInerney, D. M., & Ali, J. (2006). Multidimensional and hierarchical assessment of school motivation: Cross-cultural validation. *Educational Psychology*, 26(6), 717–734.
- Megahed, N. M., & Ginsburg, M. B. (2003). Stratified students, stratified teachers: Ideologically informed perceptions of educational reform in Egypt. *Mediterranean Journal of Educational Studies*, 8(2), 7–33.
- *Mischo, C., & Haag, L. (2002). Expansion and effectiveness of private tutoring. *European Journal of Psychology of Education*, 17(3), 263–273.

- Mitra, R., & Reiter, J. P. (2016). A comparison of two methods of estimating propensity scores after multiple imputation. *Statistical Methods in Medical Research*, 25(1), 188–204.
- Montebon, D. R. T. (2016). Shadow education: Effects on students' self-efficacy in science. *International Journal of Research Studies in Education*, 4(5), 31–40.
- Morgan, D. L., & Krueger, R. A. (1993). When to use focus groups and why. In D. L. Morgan (Ed.), *Successful focus groups: Advancing the state of the art* (pp. 6–7). London: SAGE.
- Mori, I., & Baker, D. (2010). The origin of universal shadow education: What the supplemental education phenomenon tells us about the postmodern institution of education. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 11(1), 36–48.
- *Nagac, K., & Guc, Y. (2015). An analysis of education policy towards private tutoring centers in Turkey. *Journal of Applied Economics & Business Research*, 5(3), 161–170.
- *Nam, S. -J. (2013). The relationship between private tutoring and academic achievement – An application of a multivariate latent growth model. *International Journal of Human Ecology*, 14(1), 29–39.
- Nam, Y., & Chan, K. (2019). The roles of mainstream schooling and shadow education in English language teaching: A case study in Hong Kong. *Education Journal*, 8(1), 16–26.
- *Nath, S. R. (2008). Private supplementary tutoring among primary students in Bangladesh. *Educational Studies*, 34(1), 55–72.
- Oldenburg, R. (1999). *Great good place: Cafes, coffee shops, bookstores, bars, hair salons, and other hangouts at the heart of a community*. New York, NY: Marlow.
- Oldenburg, R., & Brissett, D. (1982). The third place. *Qualitative Sociology*, 5(4), 265–284.
- Ömeroğulları, M., Guill, K., & Köller, O. (2020). Effectiveness of private tutoring during secondary schooling in Germany: Do the duration of private tutoring and tutor qualification affect school achievement?. *Learning and Instruction*, 66, 101306.
- Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD). (1997). *Parents as partners in schooling*. Paris: OECD.
- Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD). (2011). *Quality time for students, learning in and out of school*. Paris: OECD.
- Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD). (2014). *PISA, 2012 results: What students know and can do. Student performance in mathematics, reading and science*. Paris: OECD.

- Otto, B., & Karbach, J. (2019). The effects of private tutoring on students' perception of their parents' academic involvement and the quality of their parent-child relationship. *Educational Psychology, 39*(7), 923-940.
- Ozaki, M. (2015). *A juku childhood: Children's experiences in juku attendance and its relation to their well-being in Japan* [Doctoral dissertation, University of Bath]. <https://researchportal.bath.ac.uk/en/studentTheses/a-juku-childhood-childrens-experiences-in-juku-attendance-and-its>
- Paramita, S. (2014). 'We follow the private tutors not the teachers': An ethnographic insight into educational practices among the students of an Indian city. *International Journal of Research in Social Sciences, 4*(4), 819-840.
- Park, H., Buchmann, C., Choi, J., & Merry, J. J. (2016). Learning beyond the school walls: Trends and implications. *Annual Review of Sociology, 42*(1), 231-252.
- Park, H., Byun, S. Y., & Kim, K. -K. (2011). Parental involvement and students' cognitive outcomes in Korea: Focusing on private tutoring. *Sociology of Education, 84*(1), 3-22.
- *Paviot, L., Heinsohn, N., & Korkman, J. (2008). Extra tuition in Southern and Eastern Africa: Coverage, growth, and linkages with pupil achievement. *International Journal of Educational Development, 28*(2), 149-160.
- Pessoa, A. S. G., Harper, E., Santos, I. S., & Gracino, M. C. dS. (2019). Using reflexive interviewing to foster deep understanding of research participants' perspectives. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods, 18*, 1-19.
- Piao, H., & Hwang, H. (2021). Shadow education policy in Korea during the COVID-19 pandemic. *ECNU Review of Education, 1*-15.
- Pishgar, F., Greifer, N., Leyrat, C., & Stuart, E. (2020). MatchThem::Matching and weighting after multiple imputation. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2009.11772*.
- Popa, S., & Acedo, C. (2006). Redefining professionalism: Romanian secondary education teachers and the private tutoring system. *International Journal of Educational Development, 26*(1), 98-110.
- *Prakhov, I. (2017). The prevalence and efficiency of investment in pre-entry coaching in Russia. *Tertiary Education and Management, 23*(2), 170-185.
- Purnell, D. (2015). Expanding Oldenburg: Homes as third places. *Journal of Place Management and Development, 8*(1), 51-62.
- R Core Team. (2021). *R: A language and environment for statistical computing*. Retrieved from <https://www.r-project.org/>. Vienna, Austria: R Foundation for Statistical Computing.
- Renzulli, L. (2014). Educational transformations and why sociology should care. *Social Currents, 1*(2), 149-156.

- Rosenbaum, P. R., & Rubin, D. B. (1983). The central role of the propensity score in observational studies for causal effects. *Biometrika*, 70(1), 41–55.
- Rubin, D. B. (1987). *Multiple imputation for nonresponse in surveys*. John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- *Runte-Geidel, A., & Marzo, P. F. (2015). Shadow education in Spain: Examining social inequalities through the analysis of PISA results. *European Education*, 47(2), 117–136.
- *Rushforth, K. (2011). *The quality and effectiveness of private tuition*. [Doctoral dissertation, University of London]. London. Digital Repository. <https://discovery.ucl.ac.uk/id/eprint/10019960>
- *Ryu, D., & Kang, C. (2013). Do private tutoring expenditures raise academic performance? Evidence from middle school students in South Korea. *Asian Economic Journal*, 27(1), 59–83.
- Sá, C., Florax, R. J. G. M., & Rietveld, P. (2006). Does accessibility to higher education matter? Choice behaviour of high school graduates in the Netherlands. *Spatial Economic Analysis*, 1(2), 155–174.
- *Safarzyńska, K. (2013). Socio-economic determinants of demand for private tutoring. *European Sociological Review*, 29(2), 139–154.
- Schildkamp, K., Rekers-Mombarg, L. T. M., & Harms, T. J. (2012). Student group differences in examination results and utilization for policy and school development. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement*, 23(2), 229–255.
- Schoonenboom, J., & Johnson, R. B. (2017). How to construct a mixed methods research design. *Kolner Zeitschrift Fur Soziologie und Sozialpsychologie*, 69(Suppl 2), 107–131.
- Sekhon, J. S. (2008). Multivariate and propensity score matching software with automated balance optimisation: The matching package for R. *Journal of Statistical Software*, 42(7).
- *Seo, E. H. (2018). Private tutoring and academic achievement: Self-study as a mediator. *Social Behavior and Personality: An International Journal*, 46(5), 823–830.
- Sewell, W. H., Haller, A. O., & Portes, A. (1969). The educational and early occupational attainment process. *American Sociological Review*, 34(1), 82–92.
- Sianou-Kyrgiou, E. (2008). Social class and access to higher education in Greece: Supportive preparation lessons and success in national exams. *International Studies in Sociology of Education*, 18(3–4), 173–183.
- Silova, I. (2010). Private tutoring in Eastern Europe and Central Asia: Policy choices and implications. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 40(3), 327–344.

- Sleenhof, J. P. W., Thurlings, M. C. G., Koopman, M., & Beijaard, D. (2021). The role of structure and interaction in teachers' decision making during allocation meetings. *Teaching Education*. Advanced Online Publication.
- Smyth, E. (2008). The more, the better? Intensity of involvement in private tuition and examination performance. *Educational Research and Evaluation, 14*(5), 465–476.
- *Smyth, E. (2009). Buying your way into college? Private tuition and the transition to higher education in Ireland. *Oxford Review of Education, 35*(1), 1–22.
- Sobhy, H. (2012). The de-facto privatization of secondary education in Egypt: A study of private tutoring in technical and general schools. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, 42*(1), 47–67.
- Sohn, H., Lee, D., Jang, S., & Kim, T. K. (2010). Longitudinal relationship among private tutoring, student-parent conversation, and student achievement. *KEDI Journal of Educational Policy, 7*(1), 23–41.
- *Southgate, D. E. (2009). *Determinants of shadow education: A cross-national analysis*. [Doctoral dissertation, Ohio State University]. Digital Repository. https://etd.ohiolink.edu/apexprod/rws_etd/send_file/send?accession=osu1259703574&disposition=inline
- Springer, S., Birch, K., & MacLeavy, J. (2016). An introduction to neoliberalism. In S. Springer, K. Birch, & J. MacLeavy (Eds.), *The handbook of neoliberalism* (pp. 2–14). Routledge.
- *Šťastný, V. (2016). Private supplementary tutoring in the Czech Republic. *European Education, 48*(1), 1–22.
- Šťastný, V. (2017). Private tutoring lessons supply: Insights from online advertising in the Czech Republic. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, 47*(4), 561–579.
- Šťastný, V. (2021a). Shadow education: A double-edged sword for Czech mainstream schools in the competitive educational market. *Research Papers in Education, 1*–22.
- Šťastný, V. (2021b). Shadow education in the context of early tracking: Between-track differences in the Czech Republic. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*. Advanced Online Publication.
- Šťastný, V., Chvál, M., & Walterová, E. (2021). An ordinary moonlighting activity? Determinants of the provision of private tutoring by Czech schoolteachers. *International Journal of Educational Development, 81*. PubMed: 102351
- Statistics Netherlands. (2021). *Uitgaven van huishoudens aan onderwijsondersteuning*. [Household expenditure on supplementary education]. Den Haag: CBS.

- Stevenson, D. L., & Baker, D. P. (1992). Shadow education and allocation in formal schooling: Transition to university in Japan. *American Journal of Sociology*, 97(6), 1639–1657.
- Stuart, E. A. (2010). Matching methods for causal inference: A review and a look forward. *Statistical Science*, 25(1), 1–21.
- Suter, L. R., & Györi, J. G. (2021). The contribution of research on out-of-school-time on educational theories and practice: A review of European research between 1999 and 2019. *Hungarian Educational Research Journal*. Advanced Online Publication.
- *Tansel, A., & Bircan, F. (2006). Demand for education in Turkey: A Tobit analysis of private tutoring expenditures. *Economics of Education Review*, 25(3), 303–313.
- Thelen, K. (2003). How institutions evolve: Insights from comparative historical analysis. In J. Mahoney & D. Rueschemeyer (Eds.), *Comparative historical analysis in the social sciences* (pp. 208–240). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Trent, J. (2016). Constructing professional identities in shadow education: Perspectives of private supplementary educators in Hong Kong. *Educational Research for Policy and Practice*, 15(2), 115–130.
- Tsai, C. C., & Kuo, P. C. (2008). Cram school students' conceptions of learning and learning science in Taiwan. *International Journal of Science Education*, 30(3), 353–375.
- *Tse, S. K. (2014). To what extent does Hong Kong primary school students' Chinese reading comprehension benefit from after-school private tuition? *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 15(2), 283–297.
- *Ünal, H., Özkan, E. M., Milton, S., Price, K., & Curva, F. (2010). The effect of private tutoring on performance in mathematics in Turkey: A comparison across occupational types. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 2(2), 5512–5517.
- *Vadasy, P. F., Sanders, E. A., Peyton, J. A., & Jenkins, J. R. (2002). Timing and intensity of tutoring: A closer look at the conditions for effective early literacy tutoring. *Learning Disabilities Research and Practice*, 17(4), 227–241.
- van Buuren, S., & Groothuis-Oudshoorn, K. (2011). mice: Multivariate imputation by chained equations in R. *Journal of Statistical Software*, 45(3), 1–67.
- van de Werfhorst, H. G. (2014). Changing societies and four tasks of schooling: Challenges for strongly differentiated educational systems. *International Review of Education*, 60(1), 123–144.

- van de Werfhorst, H. G., & Hofstede, S. (2007). Cultural capital or relative risk aversion? Two mechanisms for educational inequality compared. *British Journal of Sociology*, 58(3), 391–415.
- van de Werfhorst, H. G., & Mijs, J. J. B. (2010). Achievement inequality and the institutional structure of educational systems: A comparative perspective. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 36(1), 407–428.
- Vasterman, J. (2013, May 13). *In 30 uur bijgespijkerd*. [Brushed up in 30 hours]. Amsterdam: NRC.
- Vaughn, S., Schumm, J. S., & Sinagub, J. M. (1996). *Focus Group Interviews in Education and Psychology*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- Vermeulen, C., Keet, A., de Boer, M., & Plomp, H. (2012). *Examenmonitor VO 2012*. [Exam monitor secondary education 2012]. Groningen: Dienst Uitvoering Onderwijs (DUO).
- Vermeulen, C., Keet, A., de Boer, M., & Plomp, H. (2013). *Examenmonitor VO 2013*. [Exam monitor secondary education 2013]. Groningen: Dienst Uitvoering Onderwijs (DUO).
- Viechtbauer, W. (2010). Conducting meta-analyses in R with the metafor package. *Journal of Statistical Software*, 36(3), 1–48.
- Vries, M. (2013, May 8). *Middelbare scholen huren zelf bureaus in voor bijspijkerkursussen*. [High school hire their own agencies for tutoring courses]. Amsterdam: Trouw.
- Wang, D., & Bray, M. (2016). When whole-person development encounters social stratification: Teachers' ambivalent attitudes towards private supplementary tutoring in Hong Kong. *Asia-Pacific Education Researcher*, 25(5–6), 873–881.
- White, I. R., & Carlin, J. B. (2010). Bias and efficiency of multiple imputation compared with complete-case analysis for missing covariate values. *Statistics in Medicine*, 29(28), 2920–2931.
- Yamato, Y., & Zhang, W. (2017). Changing schooling, changing shadow: Shapes and functions of juku in Japan. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 37(3), 329–343.
- Yastrebov, G., Kosyakova, Y., & Kurakin, D. (2018). Slipping past the test: Heterogeneous effects of social background in the context of inconsistent selection mechanisms in higher education. *Sociology of Education*, 91(3), 224–241.
- Ying, M., & Wright, E. (2021). Outsourced concerted cultivation: International schooling and educational consulting in China. *International Studies in Sociology of Education*. Advanced Online Publication.

- Yung, K. W. H. (2015). Learning English in the shadows: Understanding Chinese learners' experiences of private tutoring. *TESOL Quarterly*, 49(4), 707–732.
- Yung, K. W. H. (2020). Problematizing students' preference for video-recorded classes in shadow education. *Educational Studies*. Advance online publication.
- Yung, K. W. H., & Yuan, R. (2020). 'The most popular star-tutor of English': Discursive construction of tutor identities in shadow education. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 41(1), 153–168.
- Zhang, W., & Bray, M. (2017). Micro-neoliberalism in China: Public-private interactions at the confluence of mainstream and shadow education. *Journal of Education Policy*, 32(1), 63–81.
- *Zhang, W., & Bray, M. (2018). Equalising schooling, unequalising private supplementary tutoring: Access and tracking through shadow education in China. *Oxford Review of Education*, 44(2), 221–238.
- Zhang, W., & Bray, M. (2020). Comparative research on shadow education: Achievements, challenges, and the agenda ahead. *European Journal of Education*, 55(3), 322–341.
- *Zhang, Y. (2013). Does private tutoring improve students' National College Entrance Exam performance? – A case study from Jinan, China. *Economics of Education Review*, 32(1), 1–28.
- *Zhang, Y., & Liu, J. (2016). The effectiveness of private tutoring in China with a focus on class-size. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 46, 35–42.
- *Zhang, Y., & Xie, Y. (2016). Family background, private tutoring, and children's educational performance in contemporary China. *Chinese Sociological Review*, 48(1), 64–82.
- Zhang, Y., Dang, Y., He, Y., Ma, X., & Wang, L. (2021). Is private supplementary tutoring effective? A longitudinally detailed analysis of private tutoring quality in China. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 22(2), 239–259.
- *Zhao, G. (2015). Can money "buy" schooling achievement? Evidence from 19 Chinese cities. *China Economic Review*, 35, 83–104.
- Zheng, X., Wang, C., Shen, Z., & Fang, X. (2020). Associations of private tutoring with Chinese students' academic achievement, emotional well-being, and parent-child relationship. *Children and Youth Services Review*, 112(5), 1–11.
- Zwier, D., Geven, S., & van de Werfhorst, H. G. (2020). Social inequality in shadow education: The role of high-stakes testing. *International Journal of Comparative Sociology*, 61(6), 412–440.