Unified quantifier of mechanical disorder in solids

Kapteijns, G.; Bouchbinder, E.; Lerner, E.

DOI
10.1103/PhysRevE.104.035001

Publication date
2021

Document Version
Final published version

Published in
Physical Review E

Citation for published version (APA):
Mechanical disorder in solids, which is generated by a broad range of physical processes and controls various material properties, appears in a wide variety of forms. Defining unified and measurable dimensionless quantifiers, allowing quantitative comparison of mechanical disorder across widely different physical systems, is therefore an important goal. Two such coarse-grained dimensionless quantifiers (among others) appear in the literature: one is related to the spectral broadening of discrete phononic bands in finite-size systems (accessible through computer simulations) and the other is related to the spatial fluctuations of the shear modulus in macroscopically large systems. The latter has been recently shown to determine the amplitude of wave attenuation rates in the low-frequency limit (accessible through laboratory experiments). Here, using two alternative and complementary theoretical approaches linked to the vibrational spectra of solids, we derive a basic scaling relation between the two dimensionless quantifiers. This scaling relation, which is supported by simulational data, shows that the two apparently distinct quantifiers are in fact intrinsically related, giving rise to a unified quantifier of mechanical disorder in solids. We further discuss the obtained results in the context of the unjamming transition taking place in soft sphere packings at low confining pressures, in addition to their implications for our understanding of the low-frequency vibrational spectra of disordered solids in general, and in particular those of glassy systems.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevE.104.035001

I. INTRODUCTION

Mechanical disorder in solids appears in a multitude of forms, e.g., manifested in the material’s composition, in the spatial arrangement of its constituents, and in the interactions between them. It can be generated by a broad range of physical processes, taking place either during solid formation (e.g., solidification or glass transition [1]) and/or after it (e.g., through various heat treatments [2], irreversible mechanical deformation [3], and irradiation [4]). Mechanical disorder has a deep impact on the properties of solids, such as stress relaxation [5], sound attenuation [6–8], thermal conductivity [9], plastic deformability [10], and failure resistance [11–13]. Consequently, quantifying mechanical disorder is important; in particular, it is highly desirable to define measurable dimensionless and universally applicable quantifiers of mechanical disorder, which allow us to quantitatively compare the degree of disorder of widely different physical systems [14–16].

Several proposals of quantifiers of mechanical disorder exist in the literature [14,15,17–27]. Of particular relevance in the present context are measurable disorder quantifiers that play key roles in determining material properties and that can be applied in both computer simulations—that are playing increasingly important roles in materials research due to the dramatic rise in computing power—and in laboratory experiments. As such, the disorder quantifiers we consider are coarse grained to some extent, probing the effect of disorder on some measurable physical properties. One such quantifier can be constructed using the standard deviation of the spatial distribution of the shear modulus $\mu$, denoted by $\Delta \mu$. The ratio $\Delta \mu / \langle \mu \rangle$ (where $\langle \mu \rangle$ is the average shear modulus, cf. Fig. 1) can be used to define a dimensionless disorder quantifier. Such a definition can make physical sense only if it is scale independent, i.e., if the spatial fluctuations of $\mu$ are probed on a length scale $\ell$ such that $(\Delta \mu / \langle \mu \rangle)(\ell / d_0)^{3/2}$ is independent of $\ell$. Here $d$ is the spatial dimension, $d_0$ is an atomicistic length, and $\ell$ is larger than any possible correlation length associated with the spatial fluctuations of $\mu$. This disorder quantifier plays a central role in a class of theoretical approaches collectively termed Fluctuating Elasticity Theory (FET) [14,17–20], which was recently shown to control wave attenuation rates in disordered solids [8] and to correlate with the number density of soft, quasilocalized modes in structural glasses [13]. Its precise definition and ways to probe it will be discussed in detail below.

Another quantifier of mechanical disorder has been related to the spectral broadening of low-frequency phononic bands in solids [25]. Low-frequency phonons exist in solids due to a broken global continuous symmetry, independently of whether the solids are ordered (e.g., crystalline) or disordered. For finite-size solids, lowest-frequency phonons appear in well-separated, discrete bands. If the solid is ordered, the discrete phononic bands are degenerate, i.e., groups of phonons with different wave vectors share the same frequency $\omega$. In the presence of mechanical disorder, this degeneracy is lifted...
FIG. 1. (a)–(c) Low-frequency density of states $D(\omega)$ averaged over 100 computer glasses of $N = 64\,000$ particles in three dimensions, plotted against the rescaled frequency $\omega/\omega_0$, where $\omega_0 \equiv c_s/a_0$ with $c_s$ the (ensemble averaged, $T_p$-dependent) speed of shear waves, and $a_0 \equiv (V/N)^{1/3}$ is an interparticle distance in a system of volume $V$. (a) Data for glasses of parent temperature $T_p = 0.4$ (in simulational units); the disorder-dependent frequency scale $\omega^\dagger(L)$ indicated by the dashed vertical line separates the frequency axis into the range in which discrete phonon bands are distinguishable, and the range in which their width surpasses the gaps between them, rendering them indistinguishable (phonon sea). The grey rectangle indicates the zoomed-in window presented in panel (b), where the universal $\sim \omega^4$ VDoS of nonphononic modes is observed between and below the discrete phonon bands. (c) Same as (a) but for $T_p = 1.3$ glasses of larger mechanical disorder. The dimensionless prefactor $A_g\omega^4_0$ is roughly 35 times larger compared to the $T_p = 0.4$ glasses. (d) Sample-to-sample probability distribution functions (PDFs) of the shear modulus $\mu$, measured for $T_p = 1.3$ and $T_p = 0.4$ glasses of $N = 16\,000$ particles.

and the discrete phononic bands acquire a finite spectral width $\Delta \omega$, as demonstrated in Fig. 1. Consequently, $\Delta \omega/\omega$ can be used to construct a dimensionless disorder quantifier. The precise definition based on $\Delta \omega/\omega$ and ways to probe it will be discussed in detail below. The main questions we aim at addressing in this paper are whether the disorder quantifier defined based on $\Delta \mu/\langle \mu \rangle$ is fundamentally related to the one defined based on $\Delta \omega/\omega$, and if so, what the physical content and meaning of such a basic relation are.

To better understand these questions and to sharpen them, we present in Fig. 1(a) the low-frequency vibrational density of states $D(\omega)$ (VDoS) of finite-size computer glasses comprised of $N = 64\,000$ particles in three dimensions, obtained by quenching a deeply supercooled equilibrium liquid to zero temperature (details about the model and methods are provided below). It is observed that phononic bands localized at discrete frequencies exist at the lowest tail of the VDoS [28]. Each phononic band is also characterized by a well-defined width $\Delta \omega$, explicitly marked on the third band for illustration, making the ratio $\Delta \omega/\omega$ well defined for each band. The lowest phononic bands are shown to be superimposed on top of an $\omega^4$ function (continuous green line), as highlighted by the zoom-in view presented in Fig. 1(b). The $\omega^4$ law corresponds to nonphononic excitations, which have been recently shown to be a universal feature of glasses formed by quenching a melt [16,29–32]. As the nonphononic part of the VDoS universally follows the $\omega^4$ law, the prefactor $A_g$ of this law (see figure) encapsulates nonuniversal properties of the glass and, in particular, must be sensitive to the degree of mechanical disorder, which depends on the glass preparation procedure [24,26,32].

At higher frequencies, the VDoS changes its character. In particular, when a crossover frequency $\omega^\dagger$ (which depends on the linear system size $L$, as well as on the disorder quantifier $\chi$ as explained below) is surpassed, discrete phononic bands are no longer clearly distinguishable [25]. Moreover, the $\omega^4$ law of nonphononic excitations is not clearly observed due to the overwhelming abundance of phonons, which eventually (at frequencies $\omega > \omega^\dagger$) follow Debye’s density of states $\sim \omega^{-d-1}$ in $d$ spatial dimensions (not shown). In these terms, the posed challenge is to understand how $\Delta \mu/\langle \mu \rangle$ manifests itself within the phonon sea for $\omega > \omega^\dagger$ and how it might be related to the spectral broadening of discrete phononic bands at $\omega < \omega^\dagger$. If this challenge is met, then one is able
to unify two apparently distinct dimensionless quantifiers of mechanical disorder, which are accessible in both finite-size computer solids and in macroscopically large solids. In the latter context, one should also establish experimental procedures to probe the disorder quantifier.

In this paper, a basic relation between the two mechanical disorder quantifiers discussed above is derived and substantiated through computer simulations. The former is achieved using two alternative and complementary theoretical approaches that intimately link mechanical disorder to the low-frequency vibrational spectra of solids and to its effect on wave attenuation in such systems. The relation to low-frequency vibrational spectra, following FET [14, 17–20] and the very recent support it received [8], makes the emerging unified disorder quantifier experimentally accessible using techniques such as neutron and inelastic x-ray scattering.

To robustly validate the derived relation between the two mechanical disorder quantifiers against computer simulations, we seek to study model systems that feature the largest-possible range of mechanical disorder. To this aim, we employed a glass-forming model [33] that can be very deeply quenched from different equilibrium parent temperatures [39], as is clearly shown in Fig. 1(a). Notice that the wave vector \( \mathbf{k} \) is related to the integers \( \mathbf{m} \equiv (m_x, m_y, m_z) \) as \( \mathbf{k} = (2\pi / L)m \) [39], and \( |m| = \sqrt{N} \).

In Ref. [25], a perturbation theory was developed, culminating in a prediction for the scaling behavior of the spectral widths of discrete phonon bands; it reads [25]

\[
\frac{\Delta \omega(\omega, z, N)}{\sqrt{N}} \sim \frac{\omega_{c}(N)}{\sqrt{N}},
\]

where \( N \) is the system size, \( \omega \equiv \omega_{c}k \) is the frequency of phonons from the \( z \)th band (\( c \) is the wave speed), and \( n_{z} \) is their (lifted) degeneracy level. The prefactor of this proportionality relation defines a dimensionless mechanical disorder quantifier \( \chi \), namely [25],

\[
\chi \equiv \frac{\Delta \omega(\omega, z, N)}{\omega_{c}(N)}\sqrt{N}. 
\]

Figures 1(a) and 1(c) present the low-frequency VDoS of computer glasses of \( N = 64000 \) quenched from different equilibrium parent temperatures \( T_{p} \) (as indicated by the legends); the different degrees of mechanical disorder featured by these glasses is manifested in the much-larger spectral widths \( \Delta \omega \) of the high-\( T_{p} \) glasses.

B. The phonon sea crossover frequency \( \omega_{s} \)

Equation (2) for the spectral widths of discrete phonon bands holds up to a system-size dependent crossover frequency scale \( \omega_{s}(L) \), defined by the condition that the spectral width of discrete phonon bands becomes comparable to the gaps between successive phonon bands. Incorporating the definition of \( \chi \) spelled out above and following Ref. [25], the crossover frequency \( \omega_{s} \) is predicted to satisfy [25]

\[
\omega_{s} \sim (\chi L)^{-\frac{1}{d}}, 
\]

where \( d \) again denotes the dimension of space. \( \omega_{s} \) is marked by the vertical line in the example of Fig. 1(a), and its scaling with \( L \) was validated using numerical simulations in Ref. [40]. At frequencies \( \omega > \omega_{s} \), discrete phonon bands are no longer distinguishable, and a phonon sea emerges instead, as seen in...
Figs. 1(a) and 1(c). Since \( \omega_1 \to 0 \) in the thermodynamic limit, the phonon frequency is expected to extend to zero frequency in that limit. In the phonon sea, Debye’s VDoS [39] for phonon frequencies \( D(\omega) \sim \omega^{-d-1} \) is expected to hold.

C. Spectral widths in the phonon sea

How do the spectral widths \( \Delta \omega(k) \) behave at frequencies \( \omega > \omega_h \), deep inside the phonon sea? Let us assume that Eq. (2) for the spectral width of discrete phonon bands with \( \omega < \omega_h \) also holds in the phonon sea; since the (lifted) degeneracy of phonons is no longer relevant (phonon bands are no longer discrete and well-separated in frequency), now \( n_c \) represents the number of modes that exist within the spectral widths \( \Delta \omega \) (recall the physical meaning of the latter, as discussed above). \( n_c \) can therefore be related to the VDoS \( D(\omega) \) via [40]

\[
n_c \simeq N D(\omega) \Delta \omega.
\] (5)

Using this relation together with Eq. (2), we obtain

\[
\Delta \omega \simeq \chi^2 \omega^2 D(\omega),
\] (6)

which, importantly, is independent of the system size \( N \). Equation (6) is closely related to the Rayleigh-Klemens law [41]. In the thermodynamic limit, we expect phonons to dominate the low-frequency spectrum [25], namely, \( D(\omega) \sim \omega^{-d-1} \); we thus obtain the spectral widths inside the phonon sea in the form

\[
\Delta \omega \sim \chi^2 \omega_0^{-d} \omega^{d+1}.
\] (7)

In the context of the attenuation rate of plane waves in disordered media, the \( \sim \omega^{d+1} \) scaling is known as Rayleigh scattering [42], and has been observed in numerical simulations in recent years [6,8,40,43,44].

D. The disorder parameter \( \gamma \)

FET [14,17–20] is a theoretical framework that relates the spatial fluctuations of the local elastic moduli fields of a disordered solid to its vibrational and thermodynamic properties. Of particular interest here is the low-frequency wave attenuation rate \( \Gamma \), which according to FET scales as \( \gamma \omega_0^{-d} \omega^{d+1} \), where \( \gamma \) is called the “disorder parameter” defined as

\[
\gamma \equiv \left( \frac{\Delta \mu}{\langle \mu \rangle} \right)^2 \left( \frac{\ell}{a_0} \right)^d.
\] (8)

Here \( \ell \) represents the coarse-graining length on which the spatial fluctuations \( \Delta \mu \) of the shear modulus are evaluated and \( a_0 \) is an interparticle length as defined above. Assuming that the spatial distribution of the shear modulus field is correlated on a length scale \( \xi_g < \ell \), one expects the variance \( (\Delta \mu)^2 \) to scale as \( \sim \ell^{-d} \), and therefore \( \gamma \) should become independent of the coarse-graining length \( \ell \) for large enough \( \ell \). Since we expect \( \Gamma \) to be proportional to \( \Delta \omega \), we conclude that the spectral width \( \Delta \omega \) at frequency \( \omega \) follows

\[
\Delta \omega \propto \gamma \omega_0^{-d} \omega^{d+1}.
\] (9)

E. A unified quantifier of mechanical disorder

Combining now Eqs. (7) and (9), we immediately conclude that

\[
\chi^2 \sim \gamma,
\] (10)

which is the main result of this paper.

The very same result can be obtained based on Eqs. (2) and (9) alone; recall that the degeneracy \( n_c(k) \) of wave vectors of magnitude \( k \) (for a perfectly homogeneous solid) is proportional to \( k^{d-1} [39] \), and that \( k \sim \sqrt{L}/\ell \). Therefore, \( n_c \sim \ell^{d-1} \sim L^{-d-2} \omega^{d-2} [25] \), and hence for large \( \omega \) phonon bands (at frequencies \( \omega < \omega_h \)), we expect

\[
\Delta \omega \sim \frac{\chi \omega^{d+2}}{L}.
\] (11)

Requiring that the spectral widths for \( \omega < \omega_h \) smoothly connect to the spectral widths at \( \omega > \omega_h \) as given by Eq. (4), we obtain

\[
\chi \frac{\omega_0^{d+2}}{L} \sim \gamma \omega^{d+1} \Rightarrow \omega_h \sim \left( \frac{\gamma L}{\chi} \right)^{-\frac{1}{d+2}}.
\] (12)

Comparing this result with the scaling relation for \( \omega_h \) in Eq. (4), we obtain

\[
(\chi L)^{-\frac{1}{d+2}} \sim \left( \frac{\gamma L}{\chi} \right)^{-\frac{1}{d+2}} \Rightarrow \chi^2 \sim \gamma,
\] (13)

in agreement with Eq. (10) above.

III. NUMERICAL SUPPORT

Our goal in this section is to test our main prediction in Eq. (10) for computer glasses generated over a broad range of conditions, which mimic a correspondingly large range of cooling rates through the glass transition.

A. Models and methods

In this paper, we employ a computer glass model of highly polydispersed soft spheres interacting via a \( \propto r^{-10} \) pairwise potential, where \( r \) is the distance between the centers of pairs of soft spheres. A full description of the model can be found in Ref. [45]. The model is inspired by the one put forward in Ref. [33], and as such it can be equilibrated down to very low temperatures using the swap-Monte-Carlo algorithm, where the latter is also explained in detail in Ref. [33]. The crossover temperature of this system is found to be \( T_k \approx 0.66 \) in the model’s simulation units (as described in Ref. [45]), according to the definition introduced in Ref. [46]. \( T_k \) coincides with the onset of the high-\( T_p \) plateau of \( \gamma \) as shown in Fig. 3 below. The high-\( T_p \) shear modulus of this system is \( \mu_{\infty} \approx 9.2 \) in the model’s simulation units.

We created ensembles of glassy samples of \( N = 16000 \) particles, parameterized by the equilibrium parent temperature \( T_p \), from which liquid configurations were instantaneously quenched using a conventional minimization algorithm. The sample-to-sample fluctuations of the shear modulus were evaluated using ensembles of 2000 independent glassy samples for each \( T_p \). We also created a similar set of glass ensembles with \( N = 2000 \) particles to demonstrate the
strength of finite-size effects. For our spectral-width calculations described below, it is necessary to employ somewhat large systems to cleanly estimate the widths of the lowest-frequency phonon bands in solids quenched from high parent temperatures. The system sizes we employed for these calculations are described in the text for computer glasses of size $N = 16 000$ particles, which are much noisier than the median-based estimation throughout the studied $T_p$ range. We therefore adopt the outlier-exclusion estimate of $\gamma$ in what follows.

B. Spectral widths $\Delta \omega$ of discrete phonon-bands

Phonon band widths $\Delta \omega$ for each $T_p$ ensemble were estimated as follows:

1. We performed a partial diagonalization of the Hessian matrix $H \equiv \frac{\partial^2 U}{\partial x \partial x}$ for at least 50 independent configurations for each $T_p$ ensemble to obtain the vibrational eigenfrequencies $\omega_i$ (all particle masses in our model are set to unity) and their associated eigenmodes $\Psi_i^{(\ell)}$.

2. We filtered eigenfrequencies $\omega_i$ according to the participation ratio $e(\Psi_i^{(\ell)}) \equiv [N \sum_i (\Psi_i^{(\ell)} \cdot \Psi_i^{(\ell)})^2]^{-1}$ of their corresponding eigenmodes $\Psi_i^{(\ell)}$, as also done in Refs. [25,30]. In our analyses, we only considered eigenmodes $\Psi_i^{(\ell)}$ with $e(\Psi_i^{(\ell)}) > 0.03$ to prevent low-frequency quasilocalized modes from affecting our estimations of phonon-band widths.

3. We fitted a Gaussian to each peak pertaining to individual phonon bands, as done and explained in Ref. [25]. The spectral widths $\Delta \omega$ were taken as the standard deviation (std) obtained from those Gaussian fits.

In Fig. 2, we present our measurements of our different $T_p$ glasses’ phonon-band widths $\Delta \omega$. In Fig. 2(a), we present the raw data obtained from the Gaussian fits as explained above. In Fig. 2(b), we plot the same data as shown in Fig. 2(a), this time against the rescaled frequency $\omega \sqrt{n_z} / \sqrt{N}$. We fit the data following Eq. (2)—represented by the continuous lines in Fig. 2(b)—to obtain an estimation of $\chi(T_p)$.

Fig. 3. Comparison between the direct calculation of $\gamma$ (via sample-to-sample statistics), and the two estimation methods as described in the text for computer glasses of $N = 16 000$ particles. The vertical dashed line marks the crossover temperature $T_X$ [46], which coincides with the onset of the high-$T_p$ plateau of $\gamma$. Also plotted are direct measurements and the outlier exclusion estimations of $\gamma$ for systems of $N = 2000$ particles (using the same ensemble sizes as the $N = 16 000$ systems), which are much noisier than the median-based estimation throughout the studied $T_p$ range. We therefore adopt the outlier-exclusion estimate of $\gamma$ in what follows.

C. Sample-to-sample $\mu$ fluctuations

Having at hand estimations for $\chi$, we now turn to estimating $\gamma$ via the sample-to-sample fluctuations $\Delta \mu$ of the shear modulus $\mu$. Support for the equivalence between these procedures has been presented recently in Ref. [44]. To this aim, we first stress that the sample-to-sample distribution $p(\mu; N)$ of glasses of size $N$ shows strong finite-size effects, as discussed at length in Refs. [8,15]. In particular, in small glass samples quenched from high parent temperatures, some occurrences of anomalously large fluctuations of $\mu$ are often observed, rendering a clean estimation of the variance $(\Delta \mu)^2$ difficult. This finite-size effect—which is also demonstrated in Fig. 3 below—is likely related to the deviations from the $\omega^3$ law observed in small computer glasses instantaneously quenched from high parent temperatures [47].
To overcome this potential difficulty, we adopt and compare between two approaches introduced in Refs. [15,45], respectively:

1. We follow the procedure described in Ref. [15] to remove outliers from each data set \( \{ \mu_i \} \) pertaining to each parent temperature \( T_p \), as follows: For each data point \( \mu_i \), we calculate \( \text{std}(\mu) \) for all other data points \( j \neq i \), namely, under the exclusion of \( \mu_i \). We then identify the data point whose exclusion leads to the largest variation of \( \text{std}(\mu) \) amongst all other data points; if that (largest) variation with respect to the original (unfiltered) value of \( \text{std}(\mu) \) exceeds 1%, we permanently remove the identified data point from the total data set. This procedure is repeated until the variation of the standard deviation \( \text{std}(\mu) \) under exclusion of any single data point is smaller than 1%. This method is referred to below as the outlier exclusion method.

2. In Ref. [45], a measure of the width of the sample-to-sample distribution \( p(\mu) \) was defined as the square-root of the median (instead of the mean, as done for obtaining \( \text{std}(\mu) \)) of the squared fluctuations \( (\mu_i - \mu)^2 \) about the ensemble-mean \( \mu \). We refer to this method as the median method. Notice that here we report the median of \( (\mu_i - \mu)^2 \) rather than the square-root of the median as reported in Ref. [45].

In Fig. 3, we compare our estimations of \( \gamma \) using the direct calculation and the two analysis schemes described above (outlier-exclusion and median methods). We find that the outlier-exclusion method results in slightly lower values of \( \gamma \) for high \( T_p \) glasses. Importantly, we reiterate that our calculations are performed on ensembles of 2000 glasses of \( N = 16 \, 000 \) particles, explaining why the difference between the direct calculation and the outlier elimination method are quite underwhelming. In Fig. 3, we also show the direct calculation of \( \gamma \) for glasses of \( N = 2000 \) particles, which is substantially noisier, see Ref. [15] for a related discussion. We further note that the data obtained with the outlier exclusion method are roughly proportional to the estimations of \( \gamma \) based on the median of fluctuations as described above, which is much less sensitive to outliers. For these reasons, we opt for the outlier-exclusion method to estimate \( \gamma \) in what follows below.

Finally, note that the crossover temperature \( T_p \) [46], marked by vertical dashed line in Fig. 3, appears to coincide with the onset of the high-\( T_p \) plateau of \( \gamma \). The physical significance and relevance of this interesting observation will be discussed elsewhere.

With estimations of \( \gamma(T_p) \) and \( \chi(T_p) \) at hand, we parametrically plot the two quantifiers against each other in Fig. 4 to find that \( \gamma \sim \chi^2 \), as predicted by our scaling theory in Sec. II.

IV. MECHANICAL DISORDER NEAR THE UNJAMMING POINT

Up to now we demonstrated the validity of our main prediction in Eq. (10) for computer glasses quenched from a melt, cf. Fig. 4. Our prediction, however, is expected to be generally valid for a broader class of disordered solids. This is demonstrated in this section.

The unjamming transition is a mechanical instability observed upon decompressing atthermal packings of frictionless soft spheres [36,37,48,49]. Growing length scales and correlation volumes are known to emerge in these systems as their confining pressure is reduced toward zero [50–55]. The key microscopic parameter controlling the mechanical behavior of low-pressure soft-sphere packings is the coordination \( Z \), which represents the number of interactions per particle. In particular, scaling laws of elastic moduli [56,57] and length scales [50,51,53–55] with the difference \( \delta Z \equiv Z - Z_c \) are known to emerge, where the critical coordination \( Z_c = 2d \) —known as the Maxwell threshold [58]—is reached in the limit of vanishing confining pressure.

How do the interrelated mechanical disorder quantifiers discussed here behave near the unjamming point? In Refs. [59,60], the spectral widths of acoustic excitations are obtained using Effective Medium calculations on disordered Hookean spring networks of coordination \( Z \); the key result relevant to the present discussion is the scaling \( \Delta \omega \sim \omega^2 (\delta Z)^{\gamma/2} \) (in three dimensions), implying together with Eq. (9) and the \( Z \) of Ref. [6] for wave attenuation rates in soft-sphere packings put forward in Ref. [52], where it was shown that the sample-to-sample shear modulus distribution collapses for different pressures and system sizes if it is considered for systems with constant \( N \delta Z \), implying again that \( \gamma \sim 1/\delta Z \). This result is consistent with numerical data from simulations of soft-sphere packings near the unjamming point. We note, however, that the numerical results of Ref. [6] for wave attenuation rates in soft-sphere packings near the unjamming point do not agree with the Effective Medium prediction, as discussed in that same work.

If the relation \( \gamma \sim \chi^2 \) is general, it should hold in systems near the unjamming transition as well. Here, we test this scaling relation by measuring the broadening of discrete, low-frequency phonon-bands of disordered spring networks in two dimensions. Our networks’ geometry was first derived from the contact network of disordered soft-disc packings, and their coordination \( Z \) was reduced toward \( Z_c \) using an edge-dilution scheme described in the Appendix, which minimizes fluctuations of the angles formed by edges around nodes. The results are presented in Fig. 5; we find that \( \chi \sim 1/\sqrt{\delta Z} \), in agreement with our main theoretical prediction.

V. CONCLUDING REMARKS AND PROSPECTS

In this paper, we have discussed two broadly applicable and dimensionless quantifiers of mechanical disorder. The first
quantifier, $\chi$, is related to the spectral broadening of discrete phonon bands seen in the low-frequency spectra of finite-size computer glasses, as shown in Figs. 1(a) and 1(c). The second quantifier, $\gamma$, is known as the disorder parameter in FET [14,17–20] and plays a key role in determining the spectral widths of acoustic excitations in the thermodynamic limit. Our main result—$\gamma \sim \chi^2$—was validated (in Fig. 4) against extensive computer simulations of glasses quenched from a broad range of parent temperatures $T_p$. It was also validated (in Fig. 5) against computer simulations of disordered spring networks approaching the unjamming transition.

To assess the value of $\gamma$—which characterizes the relative width of the distribution of coarse-grained elastic moduli fields in disordered media [see Eq. (8)]—we employed sample-to-sample statistics instead of spatial coarse-graining procedures. The equivalence of these two approaches to evaluating $\gamma$ was recently argued for in Ref. [44] based on detailed analyses of computer glasses. A deeper understanding of this equivalence and its further reinforcement is left for future investigations.

In Figs. 1(a)–1(c), we presented data that indicate that the prefactor $A_\omega$ of the universal $\propto \omega^4$ nonphononic VDoS correlates with the mechanical disorder quantifiers $\gamma$ and $\chi$ discussed in this paper. It is natural to expect that systems rich with soft nonphononic modes—as indicated by a large (dimensionless) prefactor $A_\omega^{5/3}$—would also have relatively large spatial fluctuations of their coarse-grained shear modulus fields. Indeed, in Ref. [13] it was argued that $A_\omega^{5/3} \sim \gamma^{5/3}$ in three-dimensional glasses [61], based on scaling arguments.

These predictions are tested against our computer glasses data in Fig. 6. In Fig. 6(a), we show the low-frequency VDoS of our computer glasses of different parent temperatures $T_p$; we obtain estimations of the dimensionless prefactors $A_\omega^{5/3}$ by fitting the low-frequency tails to the universal $\sim \omega^4$ law. In Fig. 6(b), we plot the extracted $A_\omega^{5/3}$ versus the disorder parameter $\gamma$ obtained as explained in Sec. III C. We find that the proposed scaling $A_\omega^{5/3} \sim \gamma^{5/3}$ holds over a limited, intermediate range of $\gamma$ values. As pointed out in Refs. [15,62], $A_\omega^{5/3}$ dips downward at the lowest values of $\gamma$. In Ref. [62], it was demonstrated that $\gamma$ varies monotonically with a glassy correlation length $\xi_g$, which is expected to be bounded from below by an interparticle distance, suggesting a lower bound on $\gamma$ as well. Relations between the glassy length $\xi_g$, the disorder parameter $\gamma$ and the prefactor $A_\omega$ were discussed, suggested, and tested further in Refs. [15,44,54,62]. A complete understanding of the relation between $A_\omega$ and the disorder quantifiers discussed here is left for future work.

We conclude the discussion with commenting on the experimental accessibility of the mechanical disorder quantifiers discussed in this paper. Spectral widths of acoustic excitations $\Delta \omega(k)$ are related to wave attenuation rates $\Gamma(k)$ as $\Gamma \sim \Delta \omega$, as demonstrated for frequencies $\omega < \omega_t$ using computer simulations in Ref. [25], and for frequencies $\omega > \omega_t$ in Ref. [44]. While longitudinal wave attenuation rates are accessible experimentally [63,64] via high-resolution inelastic x-ray scattering, methods for measuring transverse (shear) waves’ attenuation rates well in the Rayleigh scaling regime.
FIG. 7. (a) Lowest-frequency phonon bands of three realizations of spring networks of \( N = 1 \) 638 400 nodes with coordination \( Z = 4.1 \) generated using the algorithm described in the text. Sound waves are marked by arrows. (b) An example of a spring network of \( N = 400 \) nodes and coordination \( Z = 4.1 \) generated with the algorithm described here.

\((k \lesssim 1 \text{nm}^{-1})\) are unfortunately not yet available. In Ref. \([65]\), a measure of local elastic moduli of a metallic glass (amorphous PdCuSi) was obtained using atomic force acoustic microscopy. There, it was reported that \( \Delta \mu / \mu \approx 30\% \), where the fluctuations were estimated over lengths of order 10 nm. An important goal of future experiments is to assess and compare the mechanical disorder of laboratory glasses to our measurements of the mechanical disorder of computer glasses on equal footing, in terms of the quantifiers discussed in this paper. An impressive effort in this direction was presented very recently in Ref. \([14]\).

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank J. Zylberg for developing and sharing the edge-dilution algorithm that inspired the one used in this paper. E.B. acknowledges support from the Ben May Center for Chemical Theory and Computation and the Harold Perlman Family. E.L. acknowledges support from the The Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (Vidi Grant No. 680-47-554/3259).

APPENDIX: DISORDERED SPRING NETWORKS

We created two-dimensional disordered networks of Hookean springs by adopting the contact networks of the soft-disc glasses described and studied in Ref. \([24]\). The particle centers of the original glass are set to be the networks’ nodes, and an edge is placed between each pair of interacting particles in the original glass. The coordination of these initial networks is \( Z \approx 6.5 \). We employed the edge-dilution algorithm described below to remove edges until the target coordinations \( Z = 4.4, 4.2, 4.1 \) were reached. Each edge of the remaining network is then replaced by a relaxed Hookean spring (of unit stiffness), i.e., the spring’s rest length is set to the original distance between the pair of nodes it is connected to. An example of a network produced by our algorithm is shown in Fig. 7(b).

The low-frequency spectrum of the disordered networks produced by our scheme—provided the system is large enough—consists solely of phonons, as demonstrated in Fig. 7(a). This is a nontrivial feature of our scheme. We tested other edge-dilution schemes aimed at minimizing local coordination fluctuations. The low-frequency spectrum of spring networks with small \( \delta Z \) produced by these other schemes usually features localized, nonphononic soft vibrations, in addition to phonons. Since the low-frequency spectrum of the spring networks produced by our algorithm consists solely of phonons, we could directly measure the spectral width of phonon bands by calculating the standard deviation of the vibrational frequencies of each band.

Bond-dilution algorithm

We introduce an algorithm \([66]\) that iteratively removes edges from a two-dimensional network, based on the network’s geometry. To explain how the algorithm works, we refer readers to the illustration in Fig. 8(a); removing the edge labeled \( \alpha \) between two nodes \( i \) and \( j \) creates two remaining angles \( \theta_i^{(\alpha)} \) and \( \theta_j^{(\alpha)} \). In each edge-removal iteration of our
algorithm, the next edge to be removed is the one whose larger (out of two) associated remaining angle (as defined above) is minimal, across all edges.

The algorithm consists of a preprocessing step and a removal step. The preprocessing step creates an array of $M$ linked-lists, denoted by $b$. The links of each linked list represent edges; each link representing an edge stores the larger of the two remaining angles that would be formed upon removal of that edge, namely, $\theta^{(a)} = \max(\theta^{(a)}_1, \theta^{(a)}_2)$. Each linked list $b_i$ holds the edges or whose $\theta^{(a)}$ are equal up to $2\pi/M$, namely, those that satisfy $\frac{2\pi}{M} \leq \theta^{(a)} < \frac{2\pi(i+1)}{M}$. This data structure is explained in Fig. 8(b).

To find the edge that opens up the smallest bond-angle (up to accuracy $2\pi/M$), we simply find the first element of $b$ that contains a nonempty linked list and remove the edge that is stored in the head of that linked list [shown in pink in Fig. 8(b)]. The second element of the linked list becomes its new head. To remove subsequent edges, we simply repeat this procedure, emptying the linked lists in the array $b$ from left to right.

Importantly, when a link is considered for removal, it is necessary to check if the originally stored $\theta^{(a)}$ is still accurate, since previous edge removals might have increased it. If $\theta^{(a)}$ is unchanged, we remove the edge. If $\theta^{(a)}$ has changed due to other edge removals, we remove its link and insert it at the head of the linked list in $b$ corresponding to the updated remaining angle $\theta^{(a)}$. The reason we can traverse $b$ from left to right is that $\theta^{(a)}$ can only increase when we remove other edges $\neq a$. To create the networks used in this paper, we chose $M = 10^4$.

The longitudinal to transverse wave-speeds ratio of our $T_c = 0.4$ glasses is $\approx 2.5$; as a result, the six lowest-frequency phonon bands seen in Fig. 1(a) pertain to transverse phonons, whereas the first band of longitudinal phonons is submerged at the upper-edge of the sixth band of transverse phonons.


Here we assume that the spatial fluctuations of coarse-grained shear modulus fields are equivalent to its sample-to-sample fluctuations, as demonstrated recently [44].


J. C. Maxwell, On the calculation of the equilibrium and stiffness of frames, Philos. Mag. 27, 294 (1864).


Generalizing the argument of Ref. [13] to general dimension $d$, one expects $A_{\phi} \omega_0^2 \sim \gamma^{5/2} d$.


Our algorithm is an adaptation of an algorithm developed by J. Zylberg.