Borsje, H.J.

Published in:
Celtic Studies Association of North America Newsletter

Citation for published version (APA):
sector (p. 102). Barry, Tilson, and Ryan show that drug costs in Ireland have risen dramatically in recent years. Two chapters by medical practitioners, Bradley and Lynch suggest that a complex relationship exists between the medical profession and drug companies in Ireland causing doctors to become potentially entangled if not ensnarled in relationships with drug companies.

The final three chapters of the book provide a comparative study of medicine regulation in Canada, Britain, and Australia. There is no direct effort to compare these cases with the Irish case, so these chapters do not really help us to assess the challenges facing Ireland when it comes to regulating drugs and the pharmaceutical sector. Overall, this book is intended to critique a model of economic growth the Irish have chosen that jeopardizes the public good.

While the contributors effectively highlight the potential pitfalls of neoliberalism and the export-oriented model of economic growth, they fail to offer any alternative that would simultaneously better secure the public’s health interests and maximize economic growth. The current recession in Ireland highlights the Irish public’s interest in job creation and prosperity. Despite the criticism this book offers, the employment and wealth that the pharmaceutical sector produces makes it likely to continue to have expansive power and little regulation in the Irish context.

Timothy J. White
Department of Political Science and Sociology
Xavier University

Dark Speech: The Performance of Law in Early Ireland
Robin Chapman Stacey
(The Middle Ages Series, Philadelphia: U of Penn Press, 2007)

This book is an impressive, erudite monograph on the performative dimension of early-medieval Irish law texts. Robin Chapman Stacey builds on the work of others who have preceded her in structuring the enormous amount of legal material that is part of the medieval Irish literary heritage (see bibliography). The book is an important contribution to the fields of Medieval and Celtic Studies, as Stacey not only makes complex medieval Irish legal thought and practice accessible to a wider readership but also applies multidisciplinary research results to Irish material. An historian herself, Stacey brings in insights from anthropological, linguistic, medieval European, cultural, literary and gender studies. Further, she does not limit her investigation to law texts, but brings, where relevant, other genres into the discussion.

In five chapters the performative dimension of the medieval Irish legal tradition is mapped. Chapter 1 shows how juridical statements were made by non-verbal legal rituals, which involved moving bodies (i.e. people, animals or objects) in time and place. For instance, when someone entered the land of another, crossing over the ancestral graves with two horses in hand and in the company of a witness, then this was part of the procedure called tellach, ‘entry’, by which the performing person registered a hereditary claim to this land (29). Chapter 2 discusses
the history of the Irish legal profession, which apparently had its origin in a
performance tradition, in which law and aesthetics went hand in hand. Juridical
language was verbal art: the performers had to live up to certain aesthetic standards
within the genre of legal language. Legal language could consist of maxims, rhetorical
verse or prose, ornamented language, ordinary language and Latin (99). Status was a
recurring factor in legal performances: the type of speech appeared to be related to the
identity, and thus the status, of the speaker.

How words could reflect and exert power in legal contexts is discussed in Chapter 3.
Language appears to have been an important instrument in constructing and reshaping
social status through code switching and the use of various speech patterns. Stacey
demonstrates the overlap between legal verbal performance and other areas of verbal
power such as poetry, prophecy, curse and satire. Words were believed to be powerful,
not only in the so-called secular (indeed a rather impossible word in medieval studies;
cp. p. 219) area, but also in the empirically unverifiable regions of religion. It surprised
me that Stacey, after carefully making room for the religious dimension (55, 59, 79, 82-
89), sometimes downplayed the overlap with ‘magical texts’ or spells and the supernat
atural aspects of satire (109-111, 114). This is especially the terrain where speech/language
becomes dark or obscure and can be significant without being understood by all
involved (98). This book shows the overlap between legal texts and spells to an even a
greater extent than I realized. Some examples will suffice here.

Stacey demonstrates convincingly that legal speech resonates with authorative
language from different genres. She points out that form and syntax are important for the
authority of speech: the structure of such verbal expressions is directly related to the
power of speech (4-5). This is true for the
genre of spells as well. Stacey notes structural parallels between ritual binding
formulas in Berrad Airechta and a passage on the acquisition of sheep (122-3): the
former presents a repetitive rhythm by the use of the preposition cen, ‘without’
(cen...cen...cen...: cen foer cen anad cen
imdegail ... cen eluth cen esngabail cen
ailsih cin fuatach; 123); the latter by
repeating nip, ‘may she not be...’
(nip...nip...nip...: nip brisc a croiceann, nip
forfind no forofinn, ma dub no lachtna; nip
toich, nip gungablac, nip congalfinnach,
nip daintach, nip ancrad, nip ladach, nip
letheirlach, nip romeidleach; Kelly, Early
Irish Farming, 507). As Stacey concluded
(123), the structure of such a rhythmic
formula allows expansion and adaptation to
a particular situation. Similar repetitive
formulations also occur in spells. We find
nip...nip...nip... in the so-called spell
against a thorn from the Stowe Missal (nip
hon, nip anim, nip att, nip galar, nip crú
cruach, nip loch liach, nip aupaith; Stokes
& Strachan, Thesaurus Palaeohibernicus II,
250), and in a spell in Leabhar Breac (nip
on [MS nifon] hi nduine ... nip loch, nip
c[h]ru, nip att, nip aillsiu [MS fallsiu];
Carey, Léachtaí Cholm Cille 30). Moreover, the preposition ar is often
repeated in protective texts, such as the
loricae (with a or ab in Latin texts). I
suggest that this formulaic listing might be
connected with the human need for
security. It is as if every possible risk
needed to be verbally expressed as an
‘exorcistic’ insurance against dangers and
their concomitant fears (cp. also Stacey’s
analysis of the intensely negative phrasing
of Languedoc oaths: 237). This line of
reasoning seems to be also present in the
detailed lists in loricae, which originally
may have been counter-spells (Herren, The
Hisperica Famina II, 23-31).

Daniel Binchy suggested that sanctions
behind fasting against someone and the
incapacitating of tools by symbolic actions should be sought in the area of ‘primitive magic and taboo’ (Celtica 10: 34); Stacey rightly points out that ecclesiastical sources may have been grounded in similar fears and beliefs and suggests to explain these procedures without the notions of magic and taboo (27-28). She then makes a good case of how several linguistic and social factors build the structures of the relevant performances. I would argue, however, that our analysis should include those ‘similar fears and beliefs’ that seem to be basic to the symbolical acts, although we might discard Binchy’s controversial terminology. Especially because we, as secularized scholars, are ‘outsiders to the system’ (15) we cannot afford to leave the religious dimension aside.

The performances described and analyzed in the book employ symbols and symbolical acts. Stacey rightly remarks that symbols are rooted in “cultural perceptions of the cosmic order, and hence in a source of authority believed to originate from outside the local community itself” (32). What struck me in reading her quotations from the legal texts was the abundance in references to fir, which – significantly – not only means ‘truth’ but also ‘justice’. This underscores the importance of the study of medieval Irish law for the study of medieval Irish religious thought. Fir, as is well-known, was the backbone of the cosmological order, or perhaps even a law of the cosmos. A desideratum related to this is a systematic study of Echtrae Fergusa maic Leiti that builds on the results of Stacey’s book, in which stray reference to this text is made. The tale describes important (legal) rituals which are grounded in Irish mythology (cp. my From Chaos to Enemy, 17-91).

These additions in the area of religion do not in any way diminish the value of the work here discussed; Stacey presents an admirable overview of the material and has given us gems of analyses of difficult texts.

Chapter 4 describes patterns in the texts in which status is related to questions concerning who is allowed to speak; who is silenced; who speaks for others; and where and when is speech allowed. Stacey beautifully describes how the textual tradition merges native and new into an amalgam, stating a certain compatibility of pre-Christian and Christian culture if ‘voiced over’ from a Christian point of view. The pre-Christian dimension in the textual heritage is not only used to depict certain classes of poets as inferior but also romanticized. More research here is obviously needed: we are far from finished in studying the image of the pre-Christian Irish past.

In Chapter 5 Stacey shows that the mass of legal material is uniform only to a certain extent. Within the uniformity of structure, language and content, she brings out the fact that this legal tradition was created by many voices, perhaps related to region and law school, and rightly pleads for a nuanced mapping of these complex aristocratic voices.

With this book, Stacey not only addresses her fellow Celticists but also wants to reach the broader readership of researchers who study the European continent in the Middle Ages. Unfortunately, and still too often, the Irish Sea seems an insurmountable gap between the study of medieval Ireland and that of the rest of medieval Europe. The central question of the last, concluding chapter is what we can learn from the Irish material for the study of medieval continental Europe. Stacey’s analysis of the ceremony of oath taking by two continental aristocratic brothers is refreshing and convincing. The near future will show how accessible this book is to scholars outside the field, but it constitutes in any case an
admirable attempt to bridge the above-mentioned gap. The importance of this fascinating survey of verbal power in medieval Irish law for Celtic Studies is obvious.

Dr Jacqueline Borsje
University of Amsterdam
Faculty of Humanities
Department of Art, Religion and Culture Studies

Come early for:

John V. Kelleher Lecture
‘So Many Dark and Time-worn Volumes’:
How our Understanding of Early Irish Literature has Progressed

October 8, 2009 ~ 5:00 pm
Faculty Club Library
~ delivered by ~
Professor Patrick Sims-Williams
(Department of Welsh, Aberystwyth University)

The University of California at Berkeley welcomed a host of scholars and students from all over the world to their beautiful campus and fresh spring weather for the 2009 California Celtic Conference and annual meeting of CSANA, from March 12-15th. The conference was blessed with many distinguished scholars, as well as a number of rising stars and new faces, and the quality of the presentations was outstanding. The unofficial theme of the conference this year was Brittany, and there were a number of presentations relating to various aspects of Breton language, tradition, and history; we were particularly lucky to have several scholars from France share their insights with us. The CSANA seminar was led by Anthony Vitt and Myriah Williams (two of Eve Sweetser’s undergraduate students), who presented their hard work on a number of Breton folktales as retold by Per Jakez Hélias. David Howlett, Ruairí Ó hUiginn, and Joseph Nagy delivered provocative, exciting plenary addresses on “Dating the Life of St. Samson,” “Dating Some Ulster Tales,” and “Fenian BFFs” respectively, setting high standards for the rest of the conference. Diarmuid Ó Giolláin from University College, Cork gave this year’s Alan