



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

Defence counsel in international criminal law

Temminck Tuinstra, J.P.W.

Publication date

2009

Document Version

Final published version

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Temminck Tuinstra, J. P. W. (2009). *Defence counsel in international criminal law*. [Thesis, fully internal, Universiteit van Amsterdam].

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

CONTENTS

List of Abbreviations

ix

PART I THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE RIGHT TO COUNSEL IN INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL PROCEEDINGS

I INTRODUCTION

1.1 Safeguarding the Right to an Effective Defence	1
1.2 Appraising the Position of the Defence	1
1.3 Theoretical Framework	
1.4 Scope	
1.5 Central Research Questions	
1.6 Methodology	
1.7 Structure	

II THE RIGHT TO LEGAL ASSISTANCE

2.1 Introduction	11
2.2 Historical Background of the Right to Defence Counsel	13
2.2.1 The Common Law System	13
2.2.2 The Civil Law System	15
2.3 General Scope of Legal Assistance at International Criminal Courts	18
2.3.1 Legal Framework	18
2.3.2 Legal Representation during the Initial Stage of Proceedings	19
2.3.3 Legal Assistance during the (Pre-)Trial and Appeal Stages	21
2.3.4 Legal Aid System	26
2.3.5 List of Counsel	30
2.3.6 Legal Aid Remuneration Schemes	31
2.4 Guaranteeing Competent Counsel	36
2.4.1 Introduction	36
2.4.2 Qualification Requirements of Counsel	38
2.4.3 Distinctions in Requirements	44
2.4.4 Qualification Requirements for Other Defence Team Members	45
2.4.5 Promoting Competent Representation	46
2.4.6 Addressing Incompetent Representation	47
2.5 The Right of an Accused to Legal Assistance of his own Choosing	49

2.5.1 Introduction	49
2.5.2 The Scope of the Right to Counsel of the Accused's Choice	50
2.5.3 Limitations to the Right to Choose Defence Counsel	52
2.5.4 Replacement of Counsel	57
2.5.5 Conclusion	59
2.6 Communication between the Accused and his Counsel	60
2.6.1 Introduction	60
2.6.2 Safeguarding the Privacy of Communications	62
2.6.3 Scope of the Right to Communicate with Counsel	63
2.6.4 The Privilege to Communicate in Private	65
2.7 Conclusion	67

III ORGANISATIONAL STRUCTURES FOR THE DEFENCE

3.1 Introduction	71
3.2 Organizing the Defence within the Court's Organisational Structure	72
3.2.1 Organisational Structure of International Criminal Courts	72
3.2.2 Responsibilities of the Registry and the President	73
3.2.3 Independent Defence Offices	78
3.2.4 Advisory Panels	82
3.3 Bar Associations	84
3.3.1 Introduction	84
3.3.2 Membership	86
3.3.3 Functions of Bar Associations	89
3.4 Conclusion	94

PART II PROCEDURAL PERSPECTIVES

IV INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL PROCEDURE IN PERSPECTIVE

4.1 Introduction	97
4.2 Damaška's Policy-Implementing and Conflict-Solving Models	102
4.2.1 The Conflict-Solving Model	102
4.2.2 Defence Counsel in Conflict-Solving Proceedings	105
4.2.3 The Policy-Implementing Model	106
4.2.4 Defence Counsel in Policy-Implementing Proceedings	108
4.3 Context of International Criminal Tribunals and ICC	110
4.3.1 Applicability of Damaška's Models to International Criminal Justice	110
4.3.2 Goals of Justice of International Criminal Courts	111
4.3.3 Structure of Authority in the Context of International Criminal Justice	119
4.3.4 Nature of Proceedings of the ICTY, the ICTR and the ICC	126
4.4 Conclusion: Damaška Face to Face with International Criminal Justice	141

PART III
THE ROLE OF DEFENCE COUNSEL IN INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL
PRACTICE

V THE PRINCIPLE OF EQUALITY OF ARMS

5.1 Introduction	145
5.2 General Scope of the Principle of Equality of Arms	147
5.3 Equality of Arms and the Proportionality of Resources and Facilities	148
5.3.1 Introduction	148
5.3.2 Procedural Approaches to Adequate Resources and Facilities	149
5.3.3 Material Differences between the Prosecution and the Defence	151
5.3.4 Conclusion	158
5.4 Disparities in Time and Number of Witnesses	160
5.5 State Cooperation and Access to Evidence	166
5.6 The Prosecution's Reliance on the Principle of Equality of Arms	171
5.7 Equality of Arms & Joinder	175
5.8 Conclusion	180

VI REGULATION OF PROFESSIONAL CONDUCT

6.1 Introduction	183
6.2 Codes of Professional Conduct	185
6.3 Standards of Professional Conduct	189
6.3.1 Introduction	189
6.3.2 Counsel's Professional Independence	191
6.3.3 Conflicts of Interest	193
6.3.4 Counsel's Duty of Confidentiality	199
6.3.5 Fee-splitting	202
6.4 Enforcement Mechanisms	206
6.4.1 Introduction	206
6.4.2 Disciplinary Proceedings Incorporated in Codes of Professional Conduct	207
6.4.3 Misconduct	212
6.4.4 Contempt of Court	215
6.4.5 Conclusion: Appropriate Disciplinary Enforcement Mechanisms	221
6.5 Collision between National and International Codes of Conduct	225
6.6 Conclusion	230

VII ASSISTING AN ACCUSED WHO REPRESENTS HIMSELF

7.1 Introduction	233
7.2 Procedural Approaches to the Right to Self-Representation	234
7.3 An Effective Exercise of the Right to Self-Representation	235

7.4 Various Forms of Mandatory Legal Assistance	237
7.4.1 Introduction	237
7.4.2 <i>Amici Curiae</i>	237
7.4.3 Standby Counsel	240
7.4.5 Court Assigned Counsel	243
7.5 Conclusion	247

VIII CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

8.1 Introduction	249
8.2 An Adequate and Effective Defence in International Criminal Proceedings	249
8.3 The <i>ad hoc</i> Tribunals versus the ICC	261
8.4 Recommendations Improving the Defence in International Criminal Proceedings	262
8.5 Final Observations	264
Summary	267
Samenvatting	279
Acknowledgements	291
Bibliography	293