



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

Incomplete cartels and antitrust policy : incidence and detection

Bos, A.M.

Publication date
2009

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Bos, A. M. (2009). *Incomplete cartels and antitrust policy : incidence and detection*. [Thesis, fully internal, Universiteit van Amsterdam]. Tinbergen Institute.

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

Contents

List of Figures	vii
Acknowledgments	ix
1 Motivation and Outline	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Motivation	3
1.3 Methodology	5
1.4 Outline	9
2 The Economics of Incomplete Cartels	11
2.1 Introduction	11
2.2 Incomplete Cartels in Practice	14
2.3 Foundations of Cartel Theory	19
2.3.1 The Incentive Constraint	21
2.3.2 The Participation Constraint	22
2.3.3 Why are Cartels Bad?	23
2.4 On the Profitability of Incomplete Cartels	25
2.4.1 Collusive price leadership	27
2.4.2 Differentiated goods	29
2.4.3 Quantity competition	30
2.4.4 Comparison	33
2.5 On the Sustainability of Incomplete Cartels	33
2.5.1 Collusive price leadership	34
2.5.2 Differentiated goods	34

2.5.3	Quantity competition	35
2.5.4	Comparison	36
2.6	The Participation Puzzle	37
2.6.1	Collusive price leadership	38
2.6.2	Differentiated goods	39
2.6.3	Quantity competition	40
2.6.4	Comparison	42
2.7	Coalition Formation with Positive Externalities	42
2.7.1	Simultaneous cartel formation	43
2.7.2	Sequential cartel formation	45
2.8	Incomplete Cartels and Firm Heterogeneity	47
2.9	Incomplete Bidding Rings	49
2.10	Discussion	53
3	A Theory of Incomplete Cartels with Heterogeneous Firms	55
3.1	Introduction	55
3.2	A Model of Collusion with Asymmetric Capacity Constraints	58
3.2.1	Static Nash Equilibrium	59
3.2.2	Infinitely Repeated Game	61
3.3	Optimal Cartel Size	64
3.3.1	Costless Collusion	65
3.3.2	Costly Collusion	67
3.4	Incentives to Collude	70
3.5	The Most Profitable Cartel	75
3.6	Incomplete Cartels and Mergers	77
3.6.1	Merger Incentives	78
3.6.2	Coordinated Effects of Mergers	80
3.7	Concluding Remarks	89
4	Cartel Detection and Antitrust Law Enforcement	93
4.1	Introduction	93
4.2	Goal and Scope of Cartel Detection	95
4.2.1	Why do we need Cartel Detection?	96
4.2.2	Why do we need Economics to Detect Cartels?	97
4.3	Economic Methods of Cartel Detection	99
4.3.1	Market Structure	100
4.3.2	Cartel Conduct	105
4.3.3	Market Performance	110
4.4	Potential Pitfalls in Cartel Detection	111
4.4.1	No Result, is a Result	112
4.4.2	Descriptive Flaws, Empirical Limitations and Theoretical Complications	112
4.4.3	On the Problem of Defining a Workable Benchmark	114
4.5	Detecting Incomplete Cartels	114
4.5.1	A Variance Screen for Collusion: an Example (1)	115
4.6	The Need for Industry Specific Detection Tests	118

4.6.1	A Variance Screen for Collusion: an Example (2)	120
4.7	Discussion	121
5	Tracing the Base: A Topographic Test for Collusive Basing-Point Pricing	123
5.1	Introduction	123
5.2	Basing-Point Pricing	126
5.3	A Model of Basing-Point Pricing	131
5.3.1	Competitive Basing-Point Pricing	134
5.3.2	Collusive Basing-Point Pricing	135
5.4	Detecting Collusive Basing-Point Pricing	137
5.4.1	Variance Screens	138
5.4.2	Bid-distance Correlation	139
5.5	Tracing the Base	141
5.5.1	Base Recovery	142
5.6	A Likelihood Measure of Collusion	144
5.7	Concluding Remarks	149
6	Summary and Conclusions	153
6.1	Introduction	153
6.2	Main Findings	153
6.3	Implications for Antitrust Policy	156
6.4	Future Research	158
6.4.1	Cartel Formation with Heterogeneous Firms	158
6.4.2	Disentangling Overt Collusion and Tacit Collusion	159
A	BaseLocator[®]	163
A.1	Steps to Trace the Base	163
A.2	Kernel of the Software	165
	References	171
	Samenvatting (Summary in Dutch)	185