



## UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

### Countering universalism

*Decolonisation and the order of art*

Anzi, A.

### Publication date

2022

[Link to publication](#)

### Citation for published version (APA):

Anzi, A. (2022). *Countering universalism: Decolonisation and the order of art*. [Thesis, externally prepared, Universiteit van Amsterdam].

### General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

### Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

Countering Universalism  
Decolonisation and the Order of Art

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor  
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam  
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus  
prof. dr. G.T.M. ten Dam  
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,  
in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel  
op donderdag 15 september 2022, te 16.00 uur

door Achia Anzi  
geboren te Safed

***Promotiecommissie***

<i>Promotores:</i>	prof. dr. E. Peeren prof. dr. E.J. van Alphen	Universiteit van Amsterdam Universiteit Leiden
<i>Copromotores:</i>	dr. N. Roei	Universiteit van Amsterdam
<i>Overige leden:</i>	prof. dr. C.M.K.E. Lerm-Hayes prof. dr. G.Z. Hochberg prof. dr. M. Juneja dr. C. de Cesari dr. S.M. Dasgupta	Universiteit van Amsterdam Columbia University Universität Heidelberg Universiteit van Amsterdam Universiteit van Amsterdam

Faculteit der Geesteswetenschappen

## Table of Contents

<b>List of Figures</b> .....	4
<b>The Birth of Art: Introduction</b> .....	7
Decolonisation of Knowledge and Discourse Analysis.....	9
Art and Colonialism .....	12
Archaeology of Art .....	16
Colonised Art and the Art of the Settler .....	19
Chapter Outline .....	25
<b>Chapter I   From Curiosity to Aesthetics: Atul Dodiya and the Order of Art</b> .....	28
Introduction.....	28
Modernity/Coloniality .....	30
Swaraj (Self-Rule) .....	35
Cracks in Modernity .....	39
The Sociology of Modern Aesthetics.....	43
Museal Displacement and Aesthetic Differentiation.....	47
Aesthetics and Colonialism .....	49
From Curiosity to Aesthetics .....	54
Contemporary Curiosity .....	60
Conclusion .....	62
<b>Chapter II   Larry Abramson and the Decline of the Artistic order</b> .....	65
Introduction.....	65
The Dead End of Pure Art and the Postmodern Sin.....	67
End of Art or Epistemological Shift .....	74
Piles .....	78
The Politics of Abstraction .....	83
Tsooba .....	86
The Return of the Repressed or Epistemological Shift .....	91
Black Square and Gravestone: Malevich and Abramson .....	94
Conclusion .....	98

<b>Chapter III   Michal Rovner Re-frames the Louvre</b> .....	100
Introduction.....	100
Restoration of the Louvre .....	102
History vs. <i>Histories</i> .....	108
Context, Frame, and Interpretation.....	112
Hermeneutics and Historical Continuity .....	116
Outside: The Art of the Settler .....	119
<i>Makom</i> .....	128
Conclusion .....	133
<b>Chapter IV   Transworlding: Subodh Gupta’s Migratory Objects</b> .....	136
Introduction.....	136
Objects and Cultural Context .....	138
Cow Dung in a Migratory Setting.....	142
Faeces and the Conceptual Critique of the Order of Art .....	147
Dung and Black Art: Stereotype and Hybridity .....	150
<i>Bihari</i> : Stereotype and Parodic Repetition .....	155
How To Spell Cow in Hindi: Hybridity and the Impasse of Particularity .....	159
Identity and the Metaphysics of Substance.....	167
Discourse Analysis and the Interpretation of Being.....	170
Worlding.....	172
Transworlding.....	174
Conclusion .....	177
<b>Chapter V   Lines of Memory: Zarina’s Maps of Dwelling</b> .....	179
Introduction.....	179
Beyond Formalism.....	180
The Art of Dispossession .....	185
The Spell of the Territory .....	189
Critical Cartography and Border Aesthetics.....	192
Escape Map .....	195

House with Four Walls .....	197
Cartography and Postcolonial Theory .....	199
Deconstruction and Postcolonial Critiques of Cartography.....	202
Analogy of Substances and Analogy of Functions.....	206
Mimicry and Decolonisation .....	210
The Bridge and the Boundary .....	215
Father's House.....	217
Atlas of my World.....	221
Conclusion .....	224
<b>Conclusion</b> .....	<b>228</b>
The Order of Art and Decoloniality .....	224
The Past and Futurity of Decolonial Theory .....	235
<b>Bibliography</b> .....	<b>239</b>
<b>Summary</b> .....	<b>252</b>
<b>Samenvatting</b> .....	<b>256</b>
<b>Acknowledgements</b> .....	<b>260</b>

## List of Figures

Figure 1-1. Atul Dodiya. “ <i>Onboard the S.S. Rajputana.</i> ” <i>Painted Photographs/ Paintings photographed</i> , 2014.	29
Figure 1-2. Atul Dodiya, <i>The Bombay Buccaneer</i> , 1994.	33
Figure 1-3. Jean-Baptiste Gentil, <i>Map of Beder</i> , 1770.	40
Figure 1-4. Atul Dodiya, <i>Cracks in Mondrian - Hyderabad</i> , 2004–2005.	41
Figure 1-5. Atul Dodiya, <i>Guggenheim Gorakhpur</i> , 2014.	51
Figure 1-6. Atul Dodiya, <i>S.S. Rajputana Leaving the Port of Bombay</i> , 2014.	53
Figure 1-7. Atul Dodiya, <i>Broken Branches</i> , 2002.	55
Figure 1-8. Jan van Kessel the Elder, <i>Europe (The Four Parts of the World)</i> , 1664.	58
Figure 1-9. Atul Dodiya, <i>Cycling from Gujarat Vidyapith to Sabarmati Ashram</i> , 2013.	63
Figure 2-1. Larry Abramson, <i>Panic III</i> , 2009.	65
Figure 2-2. Larry Abramson, <i>Panic VII</i> , 2009.	65
Figure 2-3. Larry Abramson, <i>Black Square I</i> , 1978.	68
Figure 2-4. Larry Abramson, <i>Black Square II</i> , 1978.	68
Figure 2-5. Larry Abramson, <i>Dead End (Salute the Flag)</i> , 1979.	69
Figure 2-6. Larry Abramson, <i>Yellow Square (Because it is there)</i> , 1979.	69
Figure 2-7. Larry Abramson, <i>Yellow Square (Mountain)</i> , 1979.	69
Figure 2-8. Larry Abramson, <i>Yellow Square (The Poetry of Rachel)</i> , 1979.	69
Figure 2-9. Larry Abramson, <i>Yellow Square (The 1920’s)</i> , 1979.	71
Figure 2-10. Larry Abramson, <i>Yellow Square (Good Yellow) (detail)</i> , 1979.	71
Figure 2-11. Larry Abramson, <i>Dead End (Sin)</i> , 1980.	71
Figure 2-12. Larry Abramson, <i>Yellow Square (Creation) (detail)</i> , 1980.	71
Figure 2-13. Larry Abramson, <i>Painted by the Devil</i> , 1979.	73
Figure 2-14. Larry Abramson, <i>Composition (according to Avraham Naton)</i> , 2016.	82
Figure 2-15. Larry Abramson, <i>Tag Mechir (Ma Yafim Haleylot III)</i> , 2016.	82
Figure 2-16. Avraham Naton, <i>Composition</i> , 1951.	83
Figure 2-17. Joseph Zaritsky, <i>Landscape (Tzuba)</i> , 1974.	86
Figure 2-18. Larry Abramson, <i>Tsooba</i> , 1993-1994.	87
Figure 2-19. Larry Abramson, <i>Tsooba</i> , 1993-1994.	87

Figure 2-20. Larry Abramson, <i>From Tsooba</i> , 1993-1994.	89
Figure 2-21. Larry Abramson, <i>Chovevei Zion, Return of the Black Square XXI</i> , 2015.	96
Figure 3-1. Michal Rovner, <i>Makom II and Makom IV</i> , 2011.	103
Figure 3-2. Michal Rovner, <i>Fragments</i> , 2011.	104
Figure 3-3. Michal Rovner, <i>Restoration of Louvre</i> , 2011.	105
Figure 3-4. Michal Rovner, <i>Retzef</i> , 2006.	106
Figure 3-5. Michal Rovner, <i>Imprint</i> , 2007.	115
Figure 3-6. Michal Rovner, <i>Outside #1, #2, #7</i> , 1990-1.	124
Figure 3-7. Yitzhak Danziger, <i>The Sheep of the Negev</i> , 1963.	125
Figure 4-1. Subodh Gupta, <i>Three of Them</i> , 1984.	138
Figure 4-2. Subodh Gupta, <i>Tea Time</i> , 1987.	139
Figure 4-3. Subodh Gupta, <i>Local Passenger</i> , 1990.	139
Figure 4-4. Subodh Gupta, <i>29 Mornings</i> , 1996.	140
Figure 4-5. Subodh Gupta, <i>Ray</i> , 2012.	141
Figure 4-6. Subodh Gupta, <i>My Mother and Me</i> , 1997.	142
Figure 4-7. Subodh Gupta, <i>Pure (I)</i> (performance), 1999.	144
Figure 4-8. Subodh Gupta, <i>Pure (I)</i> (detail), 1999/2014.	145
Figure 4-9. Piero Manzoni, <i>Artist's Shit (Merda d'artista)</i> , 1961.	147
Figure 4-10. Piero Manzoni, <i>Artist's Breath (Fiato d'artista)</i> , 1960.	148
Figure 4-11. David Hammons, <i>Bliz-aard Ball</i> , 1983.	151
Figure 4-12. Chris Ofili, <i>Painting with Shit on It</i> , 1993.	152
Figure 4-13. Chris Ofili, <i>The Holy Virgin Mary</i> , 1996.	153
Figure 4-14. Subodh Gupta, <i>Bihari</i> , 1999.	156
Figure 4-15. Subodh Gupta, <i>How to Spell Cow in Hindi I</i> , 1999.	159
Figure 4-16. Henri Cartier-Bresson, <i>Ahmedabad (Gujarat, India)</i> , 1966.	160
Figure 4-17. Lonely Planet cover.	162
Figure 5-1. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Untitled</i> , 1972.	180
Figure 5-2. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Untitled</i> , 1975.	181
Figure 5-3. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Untitled</i> , 1974.	181
Figure 5-4. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Riders</i> , 1968.	182
Figure 5-5. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Lotus</i> , 1982.	182



Figure 5-6. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Kiss</i> , 1968.	182
Figure 5-7. Constantin Brâncuși, <i>The Kiss</i> , 1907-8.	183
Figure 5-8. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Cage</i> , 1970.	184
Figure 5-9. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Untitled</i> , 1970.	184
Figure 5-10. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Father's House 1898-1994</i> , 1994.	185
Figure 5-11. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Dividing Line</i> , 2001.	186
Figure 5-12. Zarina Hashmi, <i>...these Cities Blotted into the Wilderness, Jenin</i> , 2003.	187
Figure 5-13. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Ghar, Home is a Foreign Place</i> , 1999.	188
Figure 5-14. Sigalit Landau, <i>Barbed Hula</i> , 2000.	190
Figure 5-15. Shilpa Gupta, <i>1:14.9</i> , 2011-12.	190
Figure 5-16. Shilpa Gupta, <i>100 Hand Drawn Maps of my Country (Tel Aviv and Jerusalem)</i> , 2008 - ongoing.	191
Figure 5-17. Abanindranath Tagore, <i>Bharat Mata</i> , 1905.	192
Figure 5-18. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Atlas of My World IV</i> , 2001.	194
Figure 5-19. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Abyss</i> , 2013.	195
Figure 5-20. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Travels with Rani</i> , 2008.	196
Figure 5-21. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Mapping the Dislocation</i> , 2003.	197
Figure 5-22. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Fence</i> , 1980.	198
Figure 5-23. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Homecoming</i> , 1981.	198
Figure 5-24. Zarina Hashmi, <i>House with Four Walls</i> , 1991.	199
Figure 5-25. Zarina Hashmi, <i>A Map without A City</i> , 2013.	218
Figure 5-26. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Paris 1963-1967, Homes I Made/ A Life in Nine Lives</i> , 1997.	221
Figure 5-27. Toshar Joag, <i>Peeling the Onion</i> , 2016.	222
Figure 5-28. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Atlas of My World III</i> , 2001.	224
Figure 6-1. Gal Weinstein, <i>Attached to the Ground</i> , 1999.	228
Figure 6-2. N.L.Tallur, <i>Veni, Vidi, Vici</i> , 2012.	230