



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

Countering universalism

Decolonisation and the order of art

Anzi, A.

Publication date

2022

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Anzi, A. (2022). *Countering universalism: Decolonisation and the order of art*.

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

Countering Universalism
Decolonisation and the Order of Art

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus
prof. dr. G.T.M. ten Dam
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,
in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel
op donderdag 15 september 2022, te 16.00 uur

door Achia Anzi
geboren te Safed

Promotiecommissie

<i>Promotores:</i>	prof. dr. E. Peeren prof. dr. E.J. van Alphen	Universiteit van Amsterdam Universiteit Leiden
<i>Copromotores:</i>	dr. N. Roei	Universiteit van Amsterdam
<i>Overige leden:</i>	prof. dr. C.M.K.E. Lerm-Hayes prof. dr. G.Z. Hochberg prof. dr. M. Juneja dr. C. de Cesari dr. S.M. Dasgupta	Universiteit van Amsterdam Columbia University Universität Heidelberg Universiteit van Amsterdam Universiteit van Amsterdam

Faculteit der Geesteswetenschappen

Table of Contents

List of Figures	4
The Birth of Art: Introduction	7
Decolonisation of Knowledge and Discourse Analysis.....	9
Art and Colonialism	12
Archaeology of Art	16
Colonised Art and the Art of the Settler	19
Chapter Outline	25
Chapter I From Curiosity to Aesthetics: Atul Dodiya and the Order of Art.....	28
Introduction.....	28
Modernity/Coloniality	30
Swaraj (Self-Rule)	35
Cracks in Modernity	39
The Sociology of Modern Aesthetics.....	43
Museal Displacement and Aesthetic Differentiation.....	47
Aesthetics and Colonialism	49
From Curiosity to Aesthetics	54
Contemporary Curiosity	60
Conclusion	62
Chapter II Larry Abramson and the Decline of the Artistic order.....	65
Introduction.....	65
The Dead End of Pure Art and the Postmodern Sin.....	67
End of Art or Epistemological Shift	74
Piles	78
The Politics of Abstraction	83
Tsooba	86
The Return of the Repressed or Epistemological Shift	91
Black Square and Gravestone: Malevich and Abramson	94
Conclusion	98

Chapter III Michal Rovner Re-frames the Louvre	100
Introduction.....	100
Restoration of the Louvre	102
History vs. <i>Histories</i>	108
Context, Frame, and Interpretation.....	112
Hermeneutics and Historical Continuity	116
Outside: The Art of the Settler	119
<i>Makom</i>	128
Conclusion	133
Chapter IV Transworlding: Subodh Gupta’s Migratory Objects	136
Introduction.....	136
Objects and Cultural Context	138
Cow Dung in a Migratory Setting.....	142
Faeces and the Conceptual Critique of the Order of Art	147
Dung and Black Art: Stereotype and Hybridity	150
<i>Bihari</i> : Stereotype and Parodic Repetition	155
How To Spell Cow in Hindi: Hybridity and the Impasse of Particularity	159
Identity and the Metaphysics of Substance.....	167
Discourse Analysis and the Interpretation of Being.....	170
Worlding.....	172
Transworlding.....	174
Conclusion	177
Chapter V Lines of Memory: Zarina’s Maps of Dwelling	179
Introduction.....	179
Beyond Formalism.....	180
The Art of Dispossession	185
The Spell of the Territory	189
Critical Cartography and Border Aesthetics.....	192
Escape Map	195

House with Four Walls	197
Cartography and Postcolonial Theory	199
Deconstruction and Postcolonial Critiques of Cartography.....	202
Analogy of Substances and Analogy of Functions.....	206
Mimicry and Decolonisation	210
The Bridge and the Boundary	215
Father's House.....	217
Atlas of my World.....	221
Conclusion	224
Conclusion	228
The Order of Art and Decoloniality	224
The Past and Futurity of Decolonial Theory	235
Bibliography	239
Summary.....	252
Samenvatting.....	256
Acknowledgements.....	260

List of Figures

Figure 1-1. Atul Dodiya. <i>“Onboard the S.S. Rajputana.” Painted Photographs/ Paintings photographed, 2014.</i>	29
Figure 1-2. Atul Dodiya, <i>The Bombay Buccaneer, 1994.</i>	33
Figure 1-3. Jean-Baptiste Gentil, <i>Map of Beder, 1770.</i>	40
Figure 1-4. Atul Dodiya, <i>Cracks in Mondrian - Hyderabad, 2004–2005.</i>	41
Figure 1-5. Atul Dodiya, <i>Guggenheim Gorakhpur, 2014.</i>	51
Figure 1-6. Atul Dodiya, <i>S.S. Rajputana Leaving the Port of Bombay, 2014.</i>	53
Figure 1-7, Atul Dodiya, <i>Broken Branches, 2002.</i>	55
Figure 1-8. Jan van Kessel the Elder, <i>Europe (The Four Parts of the World), 1664.</i>	58
Figure 1-9. Atul Dodiya, <i>Cycling from Gujarat Vidyapith to Sabarmati Ashram, 2013.</i>	63
Figure 2-1. Larry Abramson, <i>Panic III, 2009.</i>	65
Figure 2-2. Larry Abramson, <i>Panic VII, 2009.</i>	65
Figure 2-3. Larry Abramson, <i>Black Square I, 1978.</i>	68
Figure 2-4. Larry Abramson, <i>Black Square II, 1978.</i>	68
Figure 2-5. Larry Abramson, <i>Dead End (Salute the Flag), 1979.</i>	69
Figure 2-6. Larry Abramson, <i>Yellow Square (Because it is there), 1979.</i>	69
Figure 2-7. Larry Abramson, <i>Yellow Square (Mountain), 1979.</i>	69
Figure 2-8. Larry Abramson, <i>Yellow Square (The Poetry of Rachel), 1979.</i>	69
Figure 2-9. Larry Abramson, <i>Yellow Square (The 1920’s), 1979.</i>	71
Figure 2-10. Larry Abramson, <i>Yellow Square (Good Yellow) (detail), 1979.</i>	71
Figure 2-11. Larry Abramson, <i>Dead End (Sin), 1980.</i>	71
Figure 2-12. Larry Abramson, <i>Yellow Square (Creation) (detail), 1980.</i>	71
Figure 2-13. Larry Abramson, <i>Painted by the Devil, 1979.</i>	73
Figure 2-14. Larry Abramson, <i>Composition (according to Avraham Naton), 2016.</i>	82
Figure 2-15. Larry Abramson, <i>Tag Mechir (Ma Yafim Haleylot III), 2016.</i>	82
Figure 2-16. Avraham Naton, <i>Composition, 1951.</i>	83
Figure 2-17. Joseph Zaritsky, <i>Landscape (Tzuba), 1974.</i>	86
Figure 2-18. Larry Abramson, <i>Tsooba, 1993-1994.</i>	87
Figure 2-19. Larry Abramson, <i>Tsooba, 1993-1994.</i>	87

Figure 2-20. Larry Abramson, <i>From Tsooba</i> , 1993-1994.	89
Figure 2-21. Larry Abramson, <i>Chovevei Zion, Return of the Black Square XXI</i> , 2015.	96
Figure 3-1. Michal Rovner, <i>Makom II and Makom IV</i> , 2011.	103
Figure 3-2. Michal Rovner, <i>Fragments</i> , 2011.	104
Figure 3-3. Michal Rovner, <i>Restoration of Louvre</i> , 2011.	105
Figure 3-4. Michal Rovner, <i>Retzef</i> , 2006.	106
Figure 3-5. Michal Rovner, <i>Imprint</i> , 2007.	115
Figure 3-6. Michal Rovner, <i>Outside #1, #2, #7</i> , 1990-1.	124
Figure 3-7. Yitzhak Danziger, <i>The Sheep of the Negev</i> , 1963.	125
Figure 4-1. Subodh Gupta, <i>Three of Them</i> , 1984.	138
Figure 4-2. Subodh Gupta, <i>Tea Time</i> , 1987.	139
Figure 4-3. Subodh Gupta, <i>Local Passenger</i> , 1990.	139
Figure 4-4. Subodh Gupta, <i>29 Mornings</i> , 1996.	140
Figure 4-5. Subodh Gupta, <i>Ray</i> , 2012.	141
Figure 4-6. Subodh Gupta, <i>My Mother and Me</i> , 1997.	142
Figure 4-7. Subodh Gupta, <i>Pure (I)</i> (performance), 1999.	144
Figure 4-8. Subodh Gupta, <i>Pure (I)</i> (detail), 1999/2014.	145
Figure 4-9. Piero Manzoni, <i>Artist's Shit (Merda d'artista)</i> , 1961.	147
Figure 4-10. Piero Manzoni, <i>Artist's Breath (Fiato d'artista)</i> , 1960.	148
Figure 4-11. David Hammons, <i>Bliz-aard Ball</i> , 1983.	151
Figure 4-12. Chris Ofili, <i>Painting with Shit on It</i> , 1993.	152
Figure 4-13. Chris Ofili, <i>The Holy Virgin Mary</i> , 1996.	153
Figure 4-14. Subodh Gupta, <i>Bihari</i> , 1999.	156
Figure 4-15. Subodh Gupta, <i>How to Spell Cow in Hindi I</i> , 1999.	159
Figure 4-16. Henri Cartier-Bresson, <i>Ahmedabad (Gujarat, India)</i> , 1966.	160
Figure 4-17. Lonely Planet cover.	162
Figure 5-1. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Untitled</i> , 1972.	180
Figure 5-2. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Untitled</i> , 1975.	181
Figure 5-3. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Untitled</i> , 1974.	181
Figure 5-4. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Riders</i> , 1968.	182
Figure 5-5. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Lotus</i> , 1982.	182

Figure 5-6. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Kiss</i> , 1968.	182
Figure 5-7. Constantin Brâncuși, <i>The Kiss</i> , 1907-8.	183
Figure 5-8. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Cage</i> , 1970.	184
Figure 5-9. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Untitled</i> , 1970.	184
Figure 5-10. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Father's House 1898-1994</i> , 1994.	185
Figure 5-11. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Dividing Line</i> , 2001.	186
Figure 5-12. Zarina Hashmi, <i>...these Cities Blotted into the Wilderness, Jenin</i> , 2003.	187
Figure 5-13. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Ghar, Home is a Foreign Place</i> , 1999.	188
Figure 5-14. Sigalit Landau, <i>Barbed Hula</i> , 2000.	190
Figure 5-15. Shilpa Gupta, <i>1:14.9</i> , 2011-12.	190
Figure 5-16. Shilpa Gupta, <i>100 Hand Drawn Maps of my Country (Tel Aviv and Jerusalem)</i> , 2008 - ongoing.	191
Figure 5-17. Abanindranath Tagore, <i>Bharat Mata</i> , 1905.	192
Figure 5-18. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Atlas of My World IV</i> , 2001.	194
Figure 5-19. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Abyss</i> , 2013.	195
Figure 5-20. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Travels with Rani</i> , 2008.	196
Figure 5-21. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Mapping the Dislocation</i> , 2003.	197
Figure 5-22. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Fence</i> , 1980.	198
Figure 5-23. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Homecoming</i> , 1981.	198
Figure 5-24. Zarina Hashmi, <i>House with Four Walls</i> , 1991.	199
Figure 5-25. Zarina Hashmi, <i>A Map without A City</i> , 2013.	218
Figure 5-26. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Paris 1963-1967, Homes I Made/ A Life in Nine Lives</i> , 1997.	221
Figure 5-27. Toshar Joag, <i>Peeling the Onion</i> , 2016.	222
Figure 5-28. Zarina Hashmi, <i>Atlas of My World III</i> , 2001.	224
Figure 6-1. Gal Weinstein, <i>Attached to the Ground</i> , 1999.	228
Figure 6-2. N.L.Tallur, <i>Veni, Vidi, Vici</i> , 2012.	230