



## UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

### Countering universalism

*Decolonisation and the order of art*

Anzi, A.

### Publication date

2022

[Link to publication](#)

### Citation for published version (APA):

Anzi, A. (2022). *Countering universalism: Decolonisation and the order of art*.

### General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

### Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

## Bibliography

- "7000 Museums: A Project For The Republic Of India." *Dr. Bhau Daji Lad Mumbai City Museum*, 11 December 2014, <https://www.bdlmuseum.org/exhibitions/2014/atul-dodiya.html>. Accessed 25 October 2020.
- Abrams, M.H. "Art-as-Such: The Sociology of Modern Aesthetics." *Bulletin of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences*, vol.38, no. 6, 1985, pp. 8-33. *JSTOR*, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/20171773.pdf>.
- Abramson, Larry. "The Allegory of the Pile." *Take Painting*. Petach Tikva Museum of Art, 2016, pp. 56-52.
- . "Message from the Underground." *Larry Abramson: Paintings 1975 - 2010*. Tel Aviv Museum of Art, 2010, pp. 310-308.
- . "The Art of the Camouflage." *Larry Abramson: Paintings 1975-2010*. Tel Aviv: Tel Aviv Museum, 2010, pp. 307-305.
- . "The Eye Always Wants to Touch." Interview by Yaara Shehori. Translated by Einat Adi. *larryabramson.com*, October 2007, <http://larryabramson.com/pages/writings.php>. Accessed 13 January 2017.
- . "We are All Felix Nussbaum." *Larry Abramson: Painting 1975-2010*. Tel Aviv: Tel Aviv Museum, 2010, pp. 301-299.
- . "What does Landscape Want? A Walk in WJT Mitchell's Holy Landscape." *Culture, Theory & Critique*, vol. 50, no. 2-3, 2009, pp. 275-288. *Taylor & Francis Online*, <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/10.1080/14735780903240315>.
- Adorno, Theodor W. *Prisms*. Translated by Samuel Weber and Shierry Weber. MIT P, 1997.
- Alexander, Edward P., and Mary Alexander. *Museums in Motion: An Introduction to the History and Functions of Museums*. AltaMira Press, 2008.
- Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. Verso Books, 2006.
- Ankori, Gannit. "Larry Abramson's Archeology of Trauma." *Larry Abramson: Paintings 1975-2010*. Edited by Ellen Ginton. Tel Aviv Museum, 2010, pp. 400-380.
- Anzi, Achia. "Abstraction De-Constructed through the Lens of Post-Colonialism." *Asia Contemporary Art Week*, 2016, [http://www.acaw.info/?page\\_id=28292](http://www.acaw.info/?page_id=28292). Accessed 12 July 2022.
- Baadj, Nadia. "A World of Materials in a Cabinet without Drawers: Reframing Jan van Kessel's The Four Parts of the World." *Netherlands Yearbook for History of Art/Nederlands Kunsthistorisch Jaarboek*, vol. 62, 2013, pp. 202-237. *Academia*, [https://www.academia.edu/4140681/A\\_World\\_of\\_Materials\\_in\\_a\\_Cabinet\\_without\\_Drawers\\_Reframing\\_Jan\\_van\\_Kessel\\_s\\_The\\_Four\\_Parts\\_of\\_the\\_World](https://www.academia.edu/4140681/A_World_of_Materials_in_a_Cabinet_without_Drawers_Reframing_Jan_van_Kessel_s_The_Four_Parts_of_the_World). Accessed 25 October 2020.
- Bann, Stephen. *The Clothing of Clío: A Study of the Representation of History in the Nineteenth Century Britain and France*. Cambridge UP, 1984.

- . “The Return to Curiosity: Shifting Paradigms in Contemporary Museum Display.” *Art and Its Publics: Museum Studies at the Millennium*. Edited by Andrew McClellan. Blackwell, 2004. 117-130.
- Bar Or, Galia. “‘We Are All Felix Nussbaum’: On Larry Abramson’s Pile.” *larryabramson.com*, 2005, <http://larryabramson.com/pages/essays.php>. Accessed 31 August 2017.
- “Barbed Hula.” *Sigalit Landau*, <https://www.sigalitlandau.com/barbedhula>. Accessed 03 May 2020.
- Barthes, Roland. “The Structuralist Activity.” *Critical Essays*. Translated by Richard Howard. Northwestern UP, 1972, pp. 213-220.
- Barzel, Amnon. “The Landscape as a Work of Art” (Hebrew). *Haaretz*, 22 June 1977.
- Bateson, Gregory. *Steps to an Ecology of Mind: Collected Essays in Anthropology, Psychiatry, Evolution, and Epistemology*. U of Chicago P, 2000.
- Bauman, Zygmunt. “From Pilgrim to Tourist - or a Short History of Identity.” *Questions of Cultural Identity*. Edited by Stuart Hall and Paul Du Gay. SAGE, 2003, pp. 18-36.
- Bazin, Germain. *The Museum Age*. Universe Books, 1967.
- Belting, Hans. *Likeness and Presence: A History of the Image before the Era of Art*. U of Chicago P, 1994.
- Benjamin, Walter. *The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction*. Translated by J.A. Underwood. Penguin Books, 2008.
- Benjamin, Walter. *Das Kunstwerk im Zeitalter seiner technischen Reproduzierbarkeit*. Suhrkamp, 1977.
- Bennett, Tony. *The Birth of the Museum: History, Theory, Politics*. Routledge, 2009.
- Berlin, Isaiah. *The Roots of Romanticism*. Princeton UP, 2013.
- Bhabha, Homi K. *The Location of Culture*. Routledge, 2004.
- . *The Third Space*, interview by Jonathan Rutherford. Lawrence & Wishart, 1990.
- Bhattacharya, K.C. “Svaraj in Ideas.” *Indian Philosophy in English: From Renaissance to Independence*. Edited by Nalini Bhushan and Jay L. Garfield. Oxford UP, 2011, pp. 103-111.
- Borges, Jorge Luis. *Collected Fictions*. Translated by Andrew Hurley. Penguin, 1998.
- Boudriaud, Nicolas. “On Cultural Precarity: A Letter to Subodh Gupta.” *Subodh Gupta: Gandhi’s Three Monkeys*. Translated by Miles Hankin. New York: Jack Shaiman Gallery, 2008.
- Bowry, Stephanie Jane. *Re-thinking the Curiosity Cabinet: A Study of Visual Representation in Early and Post Modernity*. 2015. *ResearchGate*, [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/305641285 Re-thinking the Curiosity Cabinet A Study of Visual Representation in Early and Post Modernity](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/305641285_Re-thinking_the_Curiosity_Cabinet_A_Study_of_Visual_Representation_in_Early_and_Post_Modernity). Accessed 25 October 2020.
- Breckenridge, Carol A. “The Aesthetics and Politics of Colonial Collecting: India at World Fairs.” *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, vol. 31, no. 2, 1989, pp. 195-216.

- Bryson, Norman. "Art in Context." *The Point of Theory: Practices of Cultural Analysis*. Edited by Mieke Bal and Inge E. Boer. U of Amsterdam P, 1994, pp. 66-78.
- Busbridge, Rachel. "Israel-Palestine and the Settler Colonial 'Turn': From Interpretation to Decolonization." *Theory, Culture & Society*, vol. 35, no. 1, 2018, pp. 91-115.
- Butler, Judith. *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. Routledge, 2002.
- Carroll, Noël. "Essence, Expression, and History Arthur Danto's Philosophy of Art." *Danto and His Critics*. Edited by Mark Rollins. John Wiley, 2012, pp. 118-145.
- Césaire, Aimé. *Discourse on Colonialism*. Translated by Joan Pinkham. Monthly Review Press, 2000.
- Chatterjee, Partha. *Nationalist Thought and the Colonial World: A Derivative Discourse*. Zed Books, 1986.
- Ciotti, Manuela. "Post-colonial Renaissance: 'Indianness', Contemporary Art and the Market in the Age of Neoliberal Capital." *Third World Quarterly*, vol. 33, no.4, 2012, pp. 637-655.
- "Cities I Called Home." *Zarina*, <https://www.zarina.work/cities-i-called-home>. Accessed 2 November 2020.
- "Context." *Online Etymology Dictionary*, <https://www.etymonline.com/word/context>. Accessed 28 October 2020.
- Cook, Ian M. "Mud Marine: The Rise and Fall of Mangalore Tiles." *Sharpening the Haze: Visual Essays on Imperial History and Memory*, edited by Giulia Carabelli et al., Ubiquity Press, 2020, pp. 111–25, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctv11cvx5b.10>.
- Cosentino, Donald J. "Hip-Hop Assemblage: The Chris Ofili Affair." *African Arts*, vol. 33, no. 1, 2000, pp. 40-51.
- Crampton, Jaramy, and John Krygier. "An Introduction to Critical Cartography." *ACME: An International Journal for Critical Geographies*, vol. 4, no. 1, 2006, pp. 11-33, <https://www.acme-journal.org/index.php/acme/article/view/723>. Accessed 31 October 2020.
- "Creation of Israeli Stones in the Louvre." *Channel 2*, 20 May 2011, <http://www.mako.co.il/news-channel2/Friday-Newscast/Article-c4904c9a29e0031004.htm>. Accessed 6 June 2016.
- Culler, Jonathan D. *Framing the Sign: Criticism and Its Institutions*. U of Oklahoma P, 1988.
- D'Mello, Rosalyn. "Subodh Gupta: Still Cooking the World." *Open*, 09 December 2016, <https://openthemagazine.com/art-culture/subodh-gupta-still-cooking-the-world/>. Accessed 28 March 2019.
- Damisch, Hubert. "A Conversation with Hubert Damisch." Interview with Yve-Alain Bois et al. *October* vol. 85, 1998, pp. 3-17. *JSTOR*, [https://www.jstor.org/stable/779179?seq=1#metadata\\_info\\_tab\\_contents](https://www.jstor.org/stable/779179?seq=1#metadata_info_tab_contents).
- Danto, Arthur C. *After the End of Art: Contemporary Art and the Pale of History*. Princeton UP, 1997.

- . “The End of Art: A Philosophical Defence.” *History and Theory*, vol. 37, no. 4, 1998, pp. 127-143.
- . *The Transfiguration of the Commonplace: A Philosophy of Art*. Harvard UP, 1981.
- . *What Art Is*. Yale UP, 2013.
- Danziger, Itzhak. *Makom*. Hakibbutz Hameuchad Publishing House, 1982.
- Daston, Lorraine, and Katharine Park. *Wonders and the Order of Nature 1150-1750*. Zone Books, 1998.
- “Definition.” *Online Etymology Dictionary*, <https://www.etymonline.com/word/definition>. Accessed 3 November 2020.
- Delbourgo, James. “Slavery in the Cabinet of Curiosities: Hans Sloane’s Atlantic World.” *SCRIBD*, <https://www.scribd.com/document/118192719/The-Whip-in-the-Coffee-House>. Accessed 25 October 2020.
- Deleuze, Gilles, and Felix Guattari. *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia*. Translated by Brian Massumi. U of Minnesota P, 2005.
- . *Kafka: Toward a Minor Literature*. Translated by Dana Polan. U of Minnesota P, 2003.
- “Department of Near Eastern Antiquities: History of the Collection.” *Louvre.fe*, <https://www.louvre.fr/en/departments/near-eastern-antiquities#:~:text=The%20collection%20of%20the%20Department,the%20roots%20of%20European%20culture>. Accessed 12 August 2020.
- Deranty, Jean-Philippe. “Regimes of the Arts.” *Jacques Ranciere: Key Concepts*. Edited by Jean-Philippe Deranty. Acumen, 2010, pp. 116-130.
- Derrida, Jacques. “Structure, Sign, and Play in the Discourse of the Human Sciences.” *Writing and Difference*, Routledge, 2005, pp. 351-370.
- Desai, Phalguni. “Atul Dodiya Imagines a Museum for the Common Man.” *Elle*, 16 December 2014, <https://elle.in/article/atul-dodiya-imagines-a-museum-for-the-common-man/>. Accessed 25 October 2020.
- Dreyfus, Hubert L. *Background Practices: Essays on the Understanding of Being*. Oxford UP, 2017.
- . “Being and Power: Heidegger and Foucault.” *International Journal of Philosophical Studies*, vol. 4, no. 1, 1996, pp. 1-16.
- . “Heidegger and Foucault on the Subject, Agency and Practices.” *Dept of Philosophy, University of California*. URL (consulted May 2006): [http://ist-socrates.berkeley.edu/~hdreyfus/html/paper\\_heidandfoucault.html](http://ist-socrates.berkeley.edu/~hdreyfus/html/paper_heidandfoucault.html) (2004).
- . “Heidegger’s Critique of Husserl’s (and Searle’s) Account of Intentionality.” *Social Research*, vol. 60, no. 1, 1993, pp. 17-38. *JSTOR*, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40970727>.
- Dodiya, Atul. “I Play with Time.” Interview by Nancy Adajania. *Atul Dodiya*. Edited by Ranjit Hoskote. Prestel, 2013, pp. 114-137.

- Dvir, Nimrod. "The Quarrel's Stones: The Artist Michal Rovner Will Exhibit at the Louvre Museum" (Hebrew). *nrg*, 17 May 2011, <http://www.nrg.co.il/online/47/ART2/241/541.html>. Accessed 08 January 2018.
- Enactments and Each Passing Day*. Curated by Roobina Karode and Akansha Rastogi. 9 September 2016 - 8 February 2017, Noida.
- Fabian, Johannes. *Time and the Other: How Anthropology Makes Its Object*. Columbia UP, 2014.
- Fanon, Frantz. *Black Skin, White Masks*. Translated by Charles Lam Markmann. Pluto Press, 2008.
- Findlen, Paula. *Possessing Nature: Museums, Collecting, and Scientific Culture in Early Modern Italy*. U of California P, 1996.
- Fiorani, Francesca. "The Lure of Antiquity and the Cult of the Machine: The Kunstkammer and the Evolution of Nature, Art and Technology." *Renaissance Quarterly*, vol. 51, no. 1, 1998, pp. 268-270.
- Flynt, Henry. "Essay: Concept Art." *Museo Tamayo*, <http://museotamayo.org/uploads/publicaciones/1.ConceptArt-HenryFlint.pdf>. Accessed 23 August 2018.
- Foucault, Michel. "Of Other Spaces: Utopias and Heterotopias." Translated by Jay Miskowiec, *Diacritics*, Vol. 16, No. 1, 1986, pp. 22-27. *JSTOR*, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/464648>.
- . *The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences*. Routledge, 2002.
- Freud, Sigmund. *The Unconscious*. Penguin UK, 2005.
- Fusco, Coco. "Captain Shit and Other Allegories of Black Stardom: The Work of Chris Ofili." *Nka Journal of Contemporary African Art*, vol. 10, no. 1, 1999, pp. 40-45. *MUSE*, [https://muse.jhu.edu/article/422584/summary?casa\\_token=fLxh\\_dizSE0AAAAA:X0nJjpF-Q6bL-f1LeDv-oy9UPu0jllx6z3bBT8eH10kXsWFSHgFlaXjW67nn1IFmvO2l8olotV9N](https://muse.jhu.edu/article/422584/summary?casa_token=fLxh_dizSE0AAAAA:X0nJjpF-Q6bL-f1LeDv-oy9UPu0jllx6z3bBT8eH10kXsWFSHgFlaXjW67nn1IFmvO2l8olotV9N). Accessed 30 October 2020.
- Gadamer, Hans-Georg. *Truth and Method*. Translated by Joel Weinsheimer and Donald G. Marshall. Bloomsbury, 2013.
- Gandhi, Mohandas Karamchand. *Hind Swaraj and Other Writing*. Edited by Anthony J. Parel. Cambridge UP, 1997.
- George, Alan. "'Making the Desert Bloom': A Myth Examined." *Journal of Palestine Studies*, vol. 8, No. 2, 1979, pp. 88-100. *JSTOR*, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/2536511>.
- Gillerman, Dana. "Dialogue Between Roof and Earth" (Hebrew). *Haaretz*, 13 March 2002, <https://www.haaretz.co.il/misc/1.779667>. Accessed 27 December 2021.
- Gilroy, Paul. *The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness*. Verso, 1993.
- Ginton, Ellen. "Zoreach / Gorea: Beginning and End, Light and Shadow in Larry Abramson's Painting." *Larry Abramson: Paintings 1975-2010*. Edited by Ellen Ginton. Tel Aviv



- Museum, 2010, pp. 410-402. *larryabramson.com*,  
<http://larryabramson.com/pages/essays.php>.
- Gombrich, E.H. *The Story of Art*. Phaidon, 1951.
- Goodman, David. "Fear of Circuses: Founding the National Museum of Victoria." *Journal of Media & Cultural Studies*, vol. 3, no. 1, 1990, pp. 18-34.
- Greenberg, Clement. "Modernist Painting." *Modern Art and Modernism: A Critical Anthology*. Edited by Francis Frascina and Charles Harrison. Harper & Row Publishers, 1982, pp. 5-10.
- Grossman, David. "Histories/ Histoires." Steidl, 2011.
- Guha, Ranajit. *Dominance without Hegemony: History and Power in Colonial India*. Harvard UP, 1997.
- Gupta, Subodh. *Everything Is Inside*. Edited by Aveek Sen. Penguin, 2014.
- . "My Mother and Me." *Home Spun*. Devi Art Foundation, 2011, pp. 13-14. *Leila Heller Gallery*,  
<http://www.leilahellergallery.com/attachment/en/5570913907a72ca707c6918d/News/56291ca1c4aa2ce4781bba7d>. Accessed 30 October 2020.
- . "Subodh Gupta and Hans Ulrich Obrist in Conversation." *Subodh Gupta: Common Man*. Ringier, 2009.
- Hall, James. *The Self-portrait: A Cultural History*. Thames & Hudson, 2015.
- Hall, Stuart. "Cultural Identity and Diaspora." *Identity: Community, Culture, Difference*. Edited by Jonathan Rutherford. Lawrence & Wishart, 1990, pp. 222-237.
- . "From Scarman to Stephen Lawrence." *History Workshop Journal*, no. 48, 1999, pp. 187–197. *JSTOR*, [www.jstor.org/stable/4289641](http://www.jstor.org/stable/4289641). Accessed 25 June 2021.
- . "Introduction: Who Needs 'Identity'?" *Questions of Cultural Identity*. Edited by Stuart Hall and Paul Du Gay. SAGE, 2003, pp. 1-17.
- . "New Ethnicities." *Critical Dialogues in Cultural Studies*. Edited by David Morley and Kuan-Hsing Chen. Routledge, 2005, pp. 442-451.
- . "The Question of Cultural Identity." *Modernity and its Futures*. Edited by Stuart Hall et al. Polity Press, 1992, pp. 273 - 326.
- Harley, J.B. *The New Nature of Maps: Essays in the History of Cartography*. Edited by Paul Laxton, JHU Press, 2001.
- . *The New Nature of Maps: Essays in the History of Cartography*. Johns Hopkins UP, 2002.
- Hartog, François. *Regimes of Historicity: Presentism and Experiences of Time*. Translated by Saskia Brown. Columbia UP, 2015.
- Hashmi, Zarina. *A Conversation with Zarina in New York with Geeti Sen*. Gallery Espace, 2006, pp. 8-16.
- Hedge, Rajaram. "The Ancient and Medieval Roof-tiles from Karnataka." *Purātattva*, vol. 31, 2001, pp. 123-127.
- Heidegger, Martin. *Being and Time*. Translated by John Macquarrie and Edward Robinson. Blackwell, 2001.

- . “Building, Dwelling, Thinking.” *Academia*, Translated by Adam Bobeck, [https://www.academia.edu/34279818/Building\\_Dwelling\\_Thinking\\_by\\_Martin\\_Heidegger\\_Translation\\_and\\_Commentary\\_by\\_Adam\\_Bobek](https://www.academia.edu/34279818/Building_Dwelling_Thinking_by_Martin_Heidegger_Translation_and_Commentary_by_Adam_Bobek). Accessed 04 May 2020.
- . “Letter on Humanism.” *Basic Writings* by Martin Heidegger. Edited by David Farrell Krell. Harper Collins, 1993, pp. 217-265.
- . *Poetry, Language, Thought*. Translated by Albert Hofstadter. HarperCollins, 2001.
- Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Aesthetics Lectures on Fine Art*, Vol. 1, Oxford UP, 1988.
- Hirschfeld, Ariel. *Local Notes*. Am Oved, 2000.
- Hoskote, Ranjit. “Atul Dodiya: The Encyclopaedist’s Desire for the World.” *Atul Dodiya*. Edited by Ranjit Hoskote. Prestel, 2013, pp. 12-87.
- Howarth, Sophie. “Artist’s Shit.” *Tate*, 2000, <https://www.tate.org.uk/art/artworks/manzoni-artists-shit-t07667>. Accessed 23 August 2018.
- “India/Israel.” *Theory and Criticism*, edited by Eitan Bar-Yosef, vol. 44, 2015.
- Jasanoff, Maya. *Edge of Empire: Lives, Culture, and Conquest in the East, 1750-1850*. Alfred A. Knopf, 2005.
- Juncosa, Enrique. “Painted Words.” *Atul Dodiya*. Edited by Ranjit Hoskote. Prestel, 2013, pp. 88-99.
- Kapur, Geeta. “When Was Modernism in Indian Art?” *When was modernism: Essays on Contemporary Cultural Practice in India*. Tulika, 2000.
- . “On Dialogic Exhibition-Making: In Conversation with Natasha Ginwala.” *Academy Lectures*, <http://academylectures.khio.no/wp-content/uploads/2014/09/on%E2%80%93dialogic-exhibition-making.pdf>. Accessed 23 October 2020.
- Katznelson, Yitzhak. “Ma Yafim Ha-lelot Bi-Canaan.” *Shironet*, <https://shironet.mako.co.il/artist?type=lyrics&lang=1&prfid=1097&wrkid=4297>. Accessed 27 October 2020.
- Kher, Bharti. “When Soak Becomes Spill.” *Everything is Inside*. Edited by Aweek Sen. Penguin, 2014. *Critical Collective*, <https://criticalcollective.in/ArtistInner2.aspx?Aid=147&Eid=516>. Accessed 1 November 2020.
- Kögler, Hans-Herbert. *The Power of Dialogue: Critical Hermeneutics after Gadamer and Foucault*. MIT P, 1999.
- Konopny-Decleve, Livnat. “Colonial Mimicry” (Hebrew). *Maftē'akh: Lexical Review of Political Thought*, vol. 13, 2018, pp. 25-42. <https://mafteakh.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/%d7%97%d7%99%d7%a7%d7%95%d7%99-%d7%a7%d7%95%d7%9c%d7%95%d7%a0%d7%99%d7%90%d7%9c%d7%99.pdf>.
- Korzybski, Alfred. “A Non-Aristotelian System and its Necessity for Rigour in Mathematics and Physics.” *Science and Sanity: An Introduction to Non-Aristotelian Systems and General Semantics*. Institute of General Semantics, 2000, pp. 747–61.



- Koselleck, Reinhart. *Futures Past: On the Semantics of Historical Time*. Translated by Keith Tribe. Columbia UP, 2004.
- Kosuth, Joseph. "Art after Philosophy." *Conceptual Art: A Critical Anthology*. Edited by Alexander Alberro and Blake Stimson. MIT P, 1999.
- Krieger, Leonard. *Ranke: The Meaning of History*. U of Chicago P, 1977.
- Lakhe, Amruta, "Atul Dodiya's Latest Work Reflects the Importance of Museums." *The Indian Express*, 17 December 2014, <https://indianexpress.com/article/lifestyle/atul-dodiyas-latest-work-reflects-the-importance-of-museums/>. Accessed 25 October 2020.
- Legg, Stephen. "'Political Atmospheric': The India Round Table Conference's Atmospheric Environments, Bodies and Representations, London 1930–1932." *Annals of the American Association of Geographers*, vol. 110, no. 3, 2020, pp. 774-792.
- Levinas, Emmanuel. *Totality and Infinity: An Essay on Exteriority*. Translated by Alphonso Lingis. Duquesne UP, 2007.
- Lewitt, Sol. "Paragraphs on Conceptual Art." *Sol Lewitt Conceptual Art: A Critical Anthology*. Edited by Alexander Alberro and Blake Stimson. MIT P, 1999.
- Livneh, Neri. "The Roof is Israeli, the Land Palestinian." *Haaretz*, 8 May 2002, <https://www.haaretz.co.il/misc/1.793098>. Accessed 27 December 2021.
- Lurie, Benzion. "And I Will Send the Tzir'a before You." *Beit Mikra: Journal for the Study of the Bible and Its World*, vol. 47, no. 4, pp. 494-497. *JSTOR*, [https://www.jstor.org/stable/23502891?seq=1#metadata\\_info\\_tab\\_contents](https://www.jstor.org/stable/23502891?seq=1#metadata_info_tab_contents).
- "Making of MAKOM." Directed by Francois Combin. *URUBU Films*, 2011, <https://vimeo.com/58539710>. Accessed 18 May 2018.
- Maldonado-Torres, Nelson. "On the Coloniality of Being." *Cultural Studies*, vol. 21, no. 2-3, 2007, pp. 240-270.
- Malevich, Kasimir. "From Cubism and Futurism to Suprematism: The New Realism in Painting." *Art in Theory 1900-1990: An Anthology of Changing Ideas*. Edited by Charles Harrison and Paul Wood. Translated by Larissa Zhadova. Blackwell, 1999, pp. 166-176.
- . "Non-Objective Art and Suprematism." *Art in Theory 1900-1990: An Anthology of Changing Ideas*. Edited by Charles Harrison and Paul Wood. Translated by Larissa Zhadova. Blackwell, 1999, pp. 290-292.
- Malraux, André. *The Voices of Silence*. Translated by Stuart Gilbert. Paladin, 1974.
- Manor, Dalia. *Art in Zion: The Genesis of Modern National Art in Jewish Palestine*. Routledge, 2005.
- McEvelley, Thomas. "Atul Dodiya: Almost Infinite Regress." *Atul Dodiya*. Edited by Ranjit Hoskote. Prestel, 2013, pp. 103-113.
- Merlan, Francesca. "Reply to Patrick Wolfe." *Social Analysis: The International Journal of Social and Cultural Practice*, vol. 41, no. 2, 1997, pp. 10–19. *JSTOR*, [www.jstor.org/stable/23171716](http://www.jstor.org/stable/23171716). Accessed 28 October 2020.

- Mignolo, Walter D. "Delinking: The Rhetoric of Modernity, the Logic of Coloniality and the Grammar of De-coloniality." *Cultural Studies* vol. 21, no. 2-3, 2007, pp. 449-514.
- . "Epistemic Disobedience and the Decolonial Option: A Manifesto." *Transmodernity*, vol. 1, no. 2, 2011, pp. 44-66. *Academia*, [https://www.academia.edu/26280395/Epistemic Disobedience and the Decolonial Option A Manifesto](https://www.academia.edu/26280395/Epistemic_Disobedience_and_the_Decolonial_Option_A_Manifesto). Accessed 24 October 2020.
- . "The Geopolitics of Knowledge and the Colonial Difference." *The South Atlantic Quarterly*, vol. 101, no. 1, 2002, pp. 57-96.
- Mignolo, Walter D., and Catherine E. Walsh. *On Decoloniality: Concepts, Analytics, Praxis*. Duke UP, 2018.
- Mitchell, WJT "Bi-National Allegory: Israel–Palestine and the Art of Larry Abramson." *Larry Abramson: Paintings 1975-2010*. Edited by Ellen Ginton. Tel Aviv Museum, 2010, pp. 378-365.
- . *Landscape and Power*. U of Chicago P, 2002.
- Mitter, Partha. *Art and Nationalism in Colonial India, 1850-1922: Occidental Orientations*. Cambridge UP, 1994.
- . *Indian Art*. Oxford UP, 2001.
- . *The Triumph of Modernism: India's Artists and the Avant-garde 1922-47*. Reaktion Books, 2007.
- Mondrian, Piet. "Dialogue on the New." *Art in Theory 1900-1990: An Anthology of Changing Ideas*. Edited by Charles Harrison and Paul Wood. Blackwell, 1999, pp. 282-287.
- . "Neo-Plasticism: the General Principle of Plastic Equivalence." *Art in Theory 1900-1990: An Anthology of Changing Ideas*. Edited by Charles Harrison and Paul Wood. Blackwell, 1999, pp. 287-290.
- . "Plastic Art and Pure Plastic Art." *Art in Theory 1900-1990: An Anthology of Changing Ideas*. Edited by Charles Harrison and Paul Wood. Blackwell, 1999, pp. 368-374.
- Mufti, Aamir R. *Enlightenment in the Colony: The Jewish Question and the Crisis of Postcolonial Culture*. Princeton UP, 2007.
- . "Zarina Hashmi and the Arts of Dispossession." *Lines of Control: Partition as a Productive Space*. Edited by Iftikhar Dadi and Hammad Nasar. Herbert F. Johnson Museum of Art, 2012, pp. 87-100. *Academia*, [academia.edu/10615321/Lines\\_of\\_Control\\_Partition\\_as\\_a\\_Productive\\_Space\\_co\\_edited\\_](https://www.academia.edu/10615321/Lines_of_Control_Partition_as_a_Productive_Space_co_edited_). Accessed 1 November 2020.
- . "Zarina's Language Question." *Marg: A Magazine of the Arts*, vol. 68, no. 1, 2016, pp. 26-33.
- Muir, Diana. "A Land without a People for a People without a Land." *Middle East Quarterly*, vol. 15, no. 2, 2008, pp. 55-62. <https://www.meforum.org/1877/a-land-without-a-people-for-a-people-without>. Accessed 20<sup>th</sup> October 2020.
- Murray, David. *Museums: Their History and their Use*. James MacLehose and Sons, 1904.

- Nagy, Peter. "Transitory Indecisions and Fluctuating Monuments." *Subodh Gupta*. Nature Morte Gallery & Sakshi Gallery, 2000.
- Nancy, Jean-Luc. *The Creation of the World, or, Globalization*. Translated by Francois Raffoul and David Pettigrew. Suny Press, 2007.
- Nardi, Isabella. *The Theory of Citrasutras in Indian Painting: A Critical Re-Evaluation of Their Uses and Interpretations*. Routledge, 2007.
- Nietzsche, Friedrich Wilhelm. *The Will to Power*. Translated by Walter Kaufmann, R.J. Hollingdale, Vintage, 1968.
- Ofrat, Gideon. "Lawrence of Jehuda or Larry Son of Abraham." Ofrat, Gideon. *The Return to the Shteitel*. The Bialik Institute, 2011, pp. 189-198.
- . *One Hundred Years of Art in Israel*. Translated by Peretz Kidron. Westview Press, 1998.
- . "Physical Light and Metaphysical Light in Israeli Art." *The Storeroom of Gideon Ofrat*, 17 January 2011, <https://gideonofrat.wordpress.com/2011/01/17/%D7%90%D7%95%D7%A8-%D7%A4%D7%99%D7%96%D7%99-%D7%95%D7%90%D7%95%D7%A8-%D7%9E%D7%98%D7%90%D7%A4%D7%99%D7%96%D7%99-%D7%91%D7%90%D7%9E%D7%A0%D7%95%D7%AA-%D7%94%D7%99%D7%A9%D7%A8%D7%90%D7%9C%D7%99%D7%AA/>. Accessed 26 October 2020.
- . "Place, Despite All?!" *The Storeroom of Gideon Ofrat*, 23 February 2014, <https://gideonofrat.wordpress.com/2014/02/23/הכּוּל-למרות-מקוּם/>. Accessed 16 May 2018.
- Omer, Mordechai. "Introduction." *Makom*. Hakibbutz Hameuchad Publishing House, 1982.
- "Outside #7." *Met Museum*, <https://www.metmuseum.org/art/collection/search/282882>. Accessed 16 February 2020.
- Penslar, Derek J. *Israel in History: The Jewish State in Comparative Perspective*. Routledge, 2007.
- Place for People*. Curated by Geeta Kapur. 1981, Bombay and New Delhi.
- Pratt, Frederick G. "The Indian Round Table Conference: Second Session." *Pacific Affairs*, vol. 5, no. 2, 1932, pp. 151-167. *JSTOR*, [https://www.jstor.org/stable/2749987?seq=1#metadata\\_info\\_tab\\_contents](https://www.jstor.org/stable/2749987?seq=1#metadata_info_tab_contents).
- Pollock, Sheldon. "Introduction: An Intellectual History of Rasa." *A Rasa Reader*. Columbia UP, 2016.
- Pomian, Krzysztof. *Collectors and Curiosities: Paris and Venice, 1500-1800*. Translated by Elizabeth Wiles-Portier. Polity Press, 1990.
- Quijano, Aníbal. "Coloniality and Modernity/rationality." *Cultural Studies*, vol. 21, no. 2-3, 2007, pp. 168-178.
- Rancière, Jacques. *The Politics of Aesthetics: The Distribution of the Sensible*. Translated by Gabriel Rockhill. Bloomsbury, 2013.

- . “Documentary Fiction: Marker and the Fiction of Memory.” *Film Fables*, Berg, 2006, pp. 157-170.
- . *The Future of the Image*. Verso, 2019.
- Ratnam, Niru. “Chris Ofili and the Limits of Hybridity.” *New Left Review*, 1999, vol. 235, no. 1, pp. 153-159. Brown University, <https://blogs.brown.edu/hiaa-1810-s01-fall-2017/files/2017/08/Ratnam.pdf>. Accessed 30 October 2020.
- . “Performance Art in India.” *ArtReview*, 21 July 2014, <https://artreview.com/ara-springsummer-2014-feature-performance-art-in-india/>. Accessed 1 November 2020.
- Rauchwarger, Daniel. “Michal Rovner conquered the Louvre.” *Haaretz*, 20 May 2011, <http://www.haaretz.co.il/gallery/1.1174596>. Accessed 31 May 2016.
- Reinhardt, Ad. “Abstract Art Refuses.” Reinhardt, Ad. *Art as Art: The Selected Writings of Ad Reinhardt*. Edited by Barbara Rose. U of California P, 1991, pp. 50-51.
- Ricoeur, Paul. *Time and narrative*. Translated by Kathleen McLaughlin and David Pellauer. Vol. 3, U of Chicago P, 1990.
- Rodinson, Maxime. *Israel: A Colonial-settler State?* Translated by David Thorstad. Monad Press, 1973.
- Rockhill, Gabriel. “Introduction: Through the Looking Glass: The Subversion of the Modernist Doxa.” *Mute Speech*, by Jacques Rancière. Columbia UP, 2011, pp. 1-28.
- Rosello, Mireille, and Stephen F. Wolfe. “Introduction.” *Border Aesthetics: Concepts and Intersections*. Edited by Johan Schimanski and Stephen F. Wolfe. Berghahn Books, 2017, pp. 1-24.
- Rosello, Mireille, and Timothy Saunders. “Ecology.” *Border Aesthetics: Concepts and Intersections*. Edited by Johan Schimanski and Stephen F. Wolfe. Berghahn Books, 2017, pp. 25-49.
- Rovner, Michal. *Histoires/Histoires*. Steidl, 2011.
- . The Archaeology of the Present. Interview by Dana Gilerman. *Calcalist*, 08 June 2016, <http://newmedia.calcalist.co.il/buzz0806/rovner/>. Accessed 16 February 2020.
- Sabbagh-Khoury, Areej. “Settler Colonialism, the Indigenous Perspective, and the Sociology of Knowledge Production in Israel.” *Theory & Criticism*, vol. 50, 2018, pp. 391-418.
- Safranski, Rüdiger. *Martin Heidegger: Beyond Good and Evil*. Translated by Ewald Osers. Harvard UP, 1998.
- Said, Edward. *Orientalism*. Penguin Books, 2003.
- Scharfstein, Ben-Ami. “From Conversation with the Artist.” *Makom*. Hakibbitz Hameuchad Publishing House, 1982.
- “Sensation Sparks New York Storm.” *BBC*, 1999, <http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/entertainment/455902.stm>. Accessed 12 April 2019.
- Shamir, Moshe. *Bemo Yadav [With His Own Hands]*. Am Oved, 1951.
- . *He Walked Through the Fields*, Sifriyat Po’alim, 1966.

- Shohat, Ella. "Notes on the 'Post-Colonial.'" *Social Text*, no. 31/32, 1992, pp. 99-113. *JSTOR*, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/466220>.
- Shohat, Ella and Robert Stam. *Unthinking Eurocentrism: Multiculturalism and the Media*. Routledge, 2014.
- . "Whence and Whither Postcolonial Theory?" *New Literary History*, vol. 43, no. 2, 2012, pp. 371-390. *JSTOR*, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/23259381>.
- Shohat, Ella, et al. "'Brazil is not Traveling Enough': On Postcolonial Theory and Analogous Counter-Currents." *Portuguese Cultural Studies*, vol. 4, no. 1, 2012, pp. 13-40. *Academia*, [https://www.academia.edu/3628926/Brazil\\_is\\_Not\\_Travelling\\_Enough\\_On\\_Postcolonial\\_Theory\\_and\\_Analogous\\_Counter\\_Currents\\_An\\_Interview\\_with\\_Ella\\_Shohat\\_and\\_Robert\\_Stam](https://www.academia.edu/3628926/Brazil_is_Not_Travelling_Enough_On_Postcolonial_Theory_and_Analogous_Counter_Currents_An_Interview_with_Ella_Shohat_and_Robert_Stam). Accessed 23 October 2020.
- Singh, Kavita. "Material Fantasy: The Museum in Colonial India." *Art and Visual Culture in India, 1857-2007*, Marg Publications, 2009, pp. 40-57. *Academia*, [https://www.academia.edu/7309195/Material\\_Fantasy\\_the\\_Museum\\_in\\_Colonial\\_India](https://www.academia.edu/7309195/Material_Fantasy_the_Museum_in_Colonial_India). Accessed 10 November 2020.
- Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty. "The Rani of Sirmur: An Essay in Reading the Archives." *History and Theory*, Vol. 24, No. 3, 1985, pp. 247-272.
- Tallur N.L., "Veni, Vidi, Vici." *Tallur.com*, <http://tallur.com/projects/2013/vvv/>. Accessed on 27 December 2021.
- Tzur, Uzi. "Youth-Shelf-Plant-Moon." *Haaretz*, 24 September 2010, <https://www.haaretz.co.il/literature/1.1222403>. Accessed 17 August 2017.
- van Alphen, Ernst. "Destroyed House Gaza: Transforming Trauma into Memory." *marjanteeuwen.nl*, 2017, <https://www.marjanteeuwen.nl/2017-ernst-alphen-destroyed-house-gaza-transforming-trauma-into-memory/>. Accessed 08 March 2020.
- Vasari, Giorgio. *The Lives of the Artists*. Oxford UP, 1998.
- Veracini, Lorenzo. *Israel and Settler Society*. Pluto Press, 2006.
- Vishnudharmottara (part III): A Treatise on Indian Painting and Image-Making*. Translated by Stella Kramrisch, Calcutta University Press, 1928.
- Walzer, Michael. "Preface." *Anti-Semite and Jew*. By Jean-Paul Sartre. Schocken Books, 1995, pp. v-xxvi .
- Wrathall, Mark A. "Introduction: Background Practices and Understandings of Being." *Background Practices: Essays on the Understanding of Being*, by Hubert L. Dreyfus, Oxford UP, 2017, pp. 1-15.
- Williams, Raymond. "Dominant, Residual, and Emergent." *Marxism and Literature*, Oxford UP, 1977, pp. 121-127.
- . "When was Modernism?" *New Left Review*, vol. 175, no. 1, 1989, <https://newleftreview.org/issues/175/articles/raymond-williams-when-was-modernism>.

- Wolfe, Patrick. "History and Imperialism: A Century of Theory, from Marx to Postcolonialism." *The American Historical Review*, vol. 102, no. 2, 1997, pp. 388-420.
- . "Nation and miscegenation: discursive continuity in the post-Mabo era." *Social Analysis: The International Journal of Social and Cultural Practice*. Vol. 36, 1994, pp. 93-152.
- . "Recuperating Binarism: A Heretical Introduction." *Settler Colonial Studies*, vol. 3, no. 3-4, 2013, pp. 257-279.
- . *Settler Colonialism and the Transformation of Anthropology: The Politics and Poetics of an Ethnographic Event*. Cassell, 1999.
- Wood, Denis. "Map Art." *Cartographic Perspectives*, no. 53, 2006, pp. 5-14, <https://cartographicperspectives.org/index.php/journal/article/view/cp53-wood-featured-article>. Accessed 09 June 2020.
- . *Rethinking the Power of Maps*. Guilford Press, 2010.
- Yap, June. "1:14.9." *Guggenheim*, <https://www.guggenheim.org/artwork/31237>. Accessed 17 April 2019
- Zalmona, Yigal. *A Century of Israeli Art* (Hebrew). Jerusalem, Lund Humphries, 2013.
- Zreik, Raef. "When Does a Settler Become a Native? (With Apologies to Mamdani)." *Constellations*, vol. 23, no.3, 2016, pp. 351-364.
- Zerubavel, Yael. *Desert in the Promised Land*. Stanford UP, 2018.
- Zilcosky, John. "Poetry after Auschwitz? Celan and Adorno Revisited." *Dtsch Vierteljahrsschr Literaturwiss Geistesgesch*, vol. 79, 2005, pp. 670–69.
- Zytaruk, Maria. "Cabinets of Curiosities and the Organization of Knowledge." *University of Toronto Quarterly*, vol. 80, no. 1, 2011, pp. 1-23.



## Summary

### Countering Universalism: Decolonisation and the Order of Art

This study explores the relation between colonialism and art, and analyses decolonial practices of contemporary Indian and Israeli artists. Adopting a discursive and historicist framework, I contour the emergence of a new approach to what came to be known as “art” in the eighteenth century. Designated in this study as the *order of art*, this new mode of distributing artefacts was responsible for several developments which are usually understood as separate phenomena: the establishment of the modern museum, the emergence of the discipline of aesthetics, the consolidation of art as an autonomous field, and the appearance of artistic styles such as Neoclassicism, Romanticism, Realism, and Impressionism. This study argues that these developments were linked to colonial expansion and the coloniser’s endeavour to universalise the domains of knowledge and culture. It distinguishes between two colonial devices which were designed to facilitate the operation of the colonial matrix of knowledge: while the *differential apparatus* functions through the construction of differences and binary oppositions, the *uniformal apparatus* creates a smooth space of universal sameness.

The analysis of the order of art and its relation to colonialism serves as a background to explore decolonial art practices. One of the central arguments of this study is that the order of art began to decline in the last century; this watershed enabled artists from non-Western societies to question the order’s premises. Each of the chapters of this study delves into the convolution of art and coloniality, and examines artistic strategies that attempt to delink the two.

The first chapter reviews the Indian artist Atul Dodiya’s exhibition *7000 Museums: A Project for the Republic of India* (2015, Mumbai). Dodiya transforms the space of the Dr Bhau Daji Lad Museum into a cabinet of curiosities, thus questioning the artistic order’s approach to art. Previously known as the Victoria & Albert Museum, the BDL Museum, along with other nineteenth-century colonial establishments, epitomises the colonial organisational mode of knowledge. Apart from contributing to the expansion of the “imperial archive,” it was established with the intention of enhancing colonialism’s civilising

mission. By evoking the cabinet of curiosities' eclectic form of organising artefacts, Dodiya challenges the scientific appearance of the museum. The taxonomic scheme of the cabinets of curiosities and its emphasis on wonder and otherness, I show in my analysis, challenge the aesthetic logic of the modern museum and its universalising operation.

While Dodiya examines the relationship between colonialism and aesthetic pigeonholing in the context of imperial colonialism and from the perspective of a postcolonial artist, Larry Abramson, the Israeli artist at the centre of the second chapter, explores colonial artistic practices in the context of Zionism and from the perspective of the settler. In accordance with Patrick Wolfe's argument regarding settler colonialism's logic of elimination, Abramson describes the Zionist effort to hide the presence of the Palestinians as the art of camouflage. His analysis of the politics of abstraction, however, is narrowly invested in the Israeli case and ignores the colonial motives and political ramifications of the order of art. His attention to the disappearance of the Palestinian village from Joseph Zaritsky's canvases, I argue, not only reflects Abramson's political awakening, but also a transformation in the approach to art. With the disintegration of the artistic order and the collapse of the essentialist category of the work of art, the latter can no longer be isolated from the world.

In a similar manner to Dodiya, Israeli artist Michal Rovner's exhibition *Histories*, discussed in Chapter III, challenges the operation of the museum, and proposes an alternative museal practice. While Dodiya criticises aesthetics, Rovner attempts to overcome the historical distance between the viewer and the exhibits that the museum imposes. By erasing the information normally provided about museum exhibits, Rovner enables viewers to see the exhibits as part of their present. Nonetheless, the erasure of data entails its own complications as it undermines the contexts from which the artefacts emerge. This strategy enables Rovner to appropriate images and objects from the Palestinian arena, without the risk that the native's presence will challenge the justification for the Zionist settler project. Thus, while the imitation of the Palestinian strengthens the settler's links with the territory, Rovner mitigates the threat of the Palestinian presence by abstracting the "provenance" of her artworks and universalising her visual sources.

The first three chapters of this study thus outline some of the central features of the order of art and its relation to colonialism. Furthermore, they explore how different artists

attempt to decolonise the museum and the domain of art: Dodiya challenges the universalism of the artistic order, Abramson unfolds the political ramification of its abstraction, and Rovner undermines the distance that it creates between the viewer and the artefacts. These strategies subvert the apparatus of the order of art, but they do not squarely address the cultural differences that the colonial uniformal apparatus suppresses. The last two chapters engage more directly with the articulation of cultural particularity and show how the Indian artists Subodh Gupta and Zarina Hashmi foreground particularism without employing essentialism and without triggering differential devices.

While the settler's claim to particularity passes through the appropriation of the native culture, in the ex-colony of India the interaction between the artwork and the world allows artists such as Gupta to express their unique world. Nonetheless, since Gupta's artworks interact with other cultural settings, they are susceptible to what this study designates as *transworlding*, i.e., to being perceived and interpreted according to the codes of dominant cultures. By insisting on the untranslatability of his objects, however, Gupta is able to counter this new form of appropriation. This chapter also deals with the modern notion of identity and offers an alternative framework to articulate cultural specificity which does not essentialise ways of being in the world through representative registers. In this manner, it challenges both the colonial uniformal apparatus that projects universal sameness, and the differential apparatus that constructs binary oppositions between the coloniser and the colonised.

The fifth and final chapter explores the link between colonialism and cartography through the prints of Zarina. While underscoring both the differential and uniformal apparatuses of colonial mapping, this chapter analyses these prints as attempts to decolonise cartography. Zarina's approach to the expression of particularism through art is markedly different from that of Gupta. While Gupta intentionally produces opaque and impervious objects that cannot be translated into alien syntax, Zarina charts maps that do not represent her culture, but enable the viewer to navigate through her world. Furthermore, as distinct from the widespread critical tendencies within contemporary map art, Zarina underscores the productive side of cartography and its crucial contribution to those who are physically and culturally dispossessed. While some postcolonial theories

maintain a critical approach to map making that resonates with their suspicious attitude towards signifying practices, Zarina uses her maps to trace the blueprint of her world.

The artistic strategies described in this study challenge some of the features of the artistic order and underline its entanglement with colonialism, but they do not escape its framework nor offer all-encompassing decolonial solutions. To make "art" nowadays is to advance a social practice whose logic and parameters are the expression of a colonial worldview. Thus, while this study is oriented towards decolonisation, it also acknowledges its complexity. Since coloniality shapes our horizon and the way in which the world is perceived, decolonialisation cannot be understood as a mere adoption of or openness to non-Western social practices and traditions of knowledge. It also necessitates a discourse analysis of modernity that probes our theoretical premises. While these premises enable us to carry out this critical endeavour, decolonisation must be understood as moving back and forth between them and the conclusions emerging from the discourse analysis of coloniality and modernity.

## Samenvatting

### Tegen het universalisme: Dekolonisatie en de orde van kunst

Deze studie onderzoekt de relatie tussen kolonialisme en kunst, en analyseert de dekoloniale artistieke praktijken van hedendaagse Indiase en Israëliëse kunstenaars. Ik schets vanuit een discursief en historicistisch perspectief de achttiende-eeuwse opkomst van een nieuwe benadering van wat “kunst” werd genoemd. Deze nieuwe wijze van het verspreiden van artefacten, hier benoemd als de *orde van kunst (order of art)*, was verantwoordelijk voor een aantal ontwikkelingen die meestal als afzonderlijke fenomenen worden gezien: de oprichting van het moderne museum, de opkomst van esthetiek als discipline, de consolidatie van kunst als een autonoom veld, en de ontwikkeling van artistieke stijlen zoals het neoclassicisme, de romantiek, het realisme, en het impressionisme. Dit onderzoek betoogt dat deze ontwikkelingen verbonden waren met koloniale expansie en met het streven van de kolonisator om de domeinen van kennis en cultuur te universaliseren. Het onderzoek maakt onderscheid tussen twee koloniale apparaten die de werking van de koloniale kennis-matrix faciliteren: waar het *differentiële apparaat (differential apparatus)* verschillen en binaire opposities construeert, creëert het *uniforme apparaat (uniformal apparatus)* een vlakke, universele gelijkvormigheid.

De analyse van de orde van kunst en haar relatie met het kolonialisme dient als achtergrond om dekoloniale kunstpraktijken te verkennen. Een van de centrale argumenten van dit onderzoek is dat de orde van kunst in de afgelopen eeuw in verval begon te raken; dit keerpunt maakte het mogelijk voor kunstenaars uit niet-westerse samenlevingen om de uitgangspunten van de orde in twijfel te trekken. Elk hoofdstuk van deze studie gaat in op de verwikkeling van kunst en kolonialiteit, en onderzoekt artistieke strategieën die proberen deze twee dingen te ontkoppelen.

Het eerste hoofdstuk behandelt de tentoonstelling *7000 Museums: A Project for the Republic of India* (2015, Mumbai) van de Indiase kunstenaar Atul Dodiya. Dodiya transformeert de ruimte van het Dr Bhau Daji Lad Museum in een rariteitenkabinet en stelt zo de benadering van kunst door de artistieke order ter discussie. Het BDL museum, voorheen bekend als het Victoria & Albert Museum, belichaamt samen met andere

negentiende-eeuwse koloniale instellingen de koloniale organisatorische modus van kennis. Naast de bijdrage die het museum leverde aan de uitbreiding van het 'imperiale archief' werd het opgericht met het doel om de beschavingsmissie van het kolonialisme te bevorderen. Door de eclecticische organisatie van het rariteitenkabinet op te roepen, doorbreekt Dodiya de wetenschappelijke uitstraling van het museum. Mijn analyse laat zien hoe het taxonomische schema van het rariteitenkabinet, en de nadruk die het legt op verwondering en andersheid, de esthetische logica en universaliserende werking van het moderne museum in vraag stellen.

Waar Dodiya de relatie tussen kolonialisme en esthetisch hokjesdenken onderzoekt in de context van imperiaal kolonialisme en vanuit het perspectief van een postkoloniale kunstenaar, verkent Larry Abramson, de Israëliische kunstenaar die centraal staat in het tweede hoofdstuk, koloniale artistieke praktijken in de context van het zionisme en vanuit het perspectief van de vestigingskolonist. In overeenstemming met het argument van Patrick Wolfe met betrekking tot de eliminatielogica van het vestigingskolonialisme beschrijft Abramson de zionistische poging om de aanwezigheid van de Palestijnen te verbergen als de kunst van camouflage. Zijn analyse van de politiek van abstractie is echter nauw gefocust op de Israëliische casus en negeert de koloniale motieven en politieke implicaties van de orde van kunst. Zijn aandacht voor de verdwijning van het Palestijnse dorp van de doeken van Joseph Zaritsky, betoog ik, weerspiegelt niet alleen Abramsons politieke bewustwording maar ook een transformatie in hoe kunst wordt benaderd. Door de desintegratie van de artistieke orde en de ineenstorting van het kunstwerk als essentialistische categorie kan het kunstwerk niet meer van de wereld worden geïsoleerd.

De tentoonstelling *Histories* van de Israëliische kunstenaar Michal Rovner, onderwerp van hoofdstuk drie, ondervraagt de werking van het museum op een vergelijkbare manier als Dodiya, en stelt een alternatieve museale praktijk voor. Waar Dodiya de esthetiek bekritiseert, probeert Rovner om de chronologische afstand te overbruggen die het museum creëert tussen de kijker en de exposities. Door de informatie uit te wissen die normaal gesproken over museumexposities wordt verstrekt, stelt Rovner bezoekers in staat om de exposities als onderdeel van hun heden te zien. Niettemin brengt het wissen van gegevens ook complicaties met zich mee, omdat het de contexten waaruit de artefacten voortkomen ondermijnt. Deze strategie maakt het mogelijk voor Rovner om zich beelden en



objecten uit de Palestijnse arena toe te eigenen, zonder het risico dat de aanwezigheid van de oorspronkelijke bewoners de rechtvaardiging van het zionistische vestigingskoloniale project in twijfel trekt. Terwijl de nabootsing van het Palestijnse de band van de kolonist met het grondgebied versterkt, vermindert Rovner dus de dreiging van de Palestijnse aanwezigheid door de herkomst van haar kunstwerken te abstraheren en haar visuele bronnen te universaliseren.

De eerste drie hoofdstukken van dit onderzoek schetsen op deze manier enkele centrale kenmerken van de orde van kunst en haar relatie met het kolonialisme. Ze onderzoeken bovendien hoe verschillende kunstenaars het museum en het domein van kunst proberen te dekoloniseren: Dodiya betwist het universalisme van de artistieke orde, Abramson ontvouwt de politieke implicaties van de abstractie van de orde, en Rovner ondermijnt de afstand die de orde creëert tussen de kijker en de artefacten. Deze strategieën ontwrichten het apparaat van de orde van kunst, maar ze richten zich niet rechtstreeks op de culturele verschillen die het koloniale uniforme apparaat onderdrukt. De laatste twee hoofdstukken gaan directer in op de articulatie van culturele particulariteit en laten zien hoe de Indiase kunstenaars Subodh Gupta en Zarina Hashmi particularisme op de voorgrond plaatsen zonder essentialisme aan te wenden of het differentiële apparaat te activeren.

Waar de vestigingskolonist specificiteit claimt door de toe-eigening van de oorspronkelijke cultuur, stelt in de voormalige kolonie India de interactie tussen het kunstwerk en de wereld kunstenaars zoals Gupta in staat hun unieke wereld uit te drukken. Niettemin zijn de kunstwerken van Gupta, doordat ze interactie hebben met andere culturele contexten, gevoelig voor wat deze studie aanduidt als *transworlding*, wat wil zeggen dat ze worden waargenomen en geïnterpreteerd volgens de codes van dominante culturen. Door aan te dringen op de onvertaalbaarheid van zijn objecten kan Gupta deze nieuwe vorm van toe-eigening echter tegengaan. Dit hoofdstuk behandelt ook het moderne begrip van identiteit en biedt een alternatief kader om culturele specificiteit te articuleren zonder manieren van in de wereld zijn te essentialiseren door middel van representatieve registers. Op deze manier stelt het zowel het koloniale uniforme apparaat dat uniforme gelijkvormigheid projecteert ter discussie als het differentiële apparaat dat binaire tegenstellingen creëert tussen kolonisator en gekoloniseerde.

Het vijfde en laatste hoofdstuk verkent de link tussen kolonialisme en cartografie aan de hand van de prenten van Zarina. Hoewel dit hoofdstuk zowel de differentiële als uniforme apparaten van koloniale kaarten onderstreept, worden deze prenten geanalyseerd als pogingen om cartografie te dekoloniseren. De manier waarop Zarina de expressie van particularisme in kunst benadert, verschilt duidelijk van die van Gupta. Waar Gupta opzettelijk ondoorzichtige en ondoordringbare objecten produceert die niet vertaald kunnen worden naar een andere syntax, maakt Zarina kaarten die haar cultuur niet vertegenwoordigen maar de kijker in staat stellen om door haar wereld te navigeren. Bovendien benadrukt Zarina, in tegenstelling tot de wijdverbreide kritische tendensen binnen hedendaagse kaartenkunst, de productieve kant van cartografie, en de cruciale bijdrage die cartografie levert aan diegenen die fysiek en cultureel ontheemd zijn. Hoewel sommige postkoloniale theorieën vasthouden aan een kritische benadering van cartografie die resoneert met hun wantrouwende houding ten opzichte van betekenisgeving, gebruikt Zarina haar kaarten om een blauwdruk van haar wereld te schetsen.

De artistieke strategieën beschreven in dit onderzoek betwisten een aantal kenmerken van de orde van kunst en onderstrepen haar verstrengeling met het kolonialisme, maar ze ontsnappen niet aan het raamwerk van deze orde en bieden ook geen alomvattende dekoloniale oplossingen. Vandaag de dag betekent het maken van “kunst” het bevorderen van een sociale praktijk waarvan de logica en parameters een koloniaal wereldbeeld uitdrukken. Hoewel dit onderzoek dus gericht is op dekolonisatie erkent het ook de complexiteit hiervan. Omdat kolonialiteit vormgeeft aan onze horizon en aan de manier waarop de wereld wordt waargenomen, kan dekolonisatie niet worden opgevat als louter de adoptie van, of openheid tegenover, niet-westerse sociale praktijken en kennistradities. Het vereist ook een discoursanalyse van moderniteit die onze theoretische uitgangspunten ondervraagt. Hoewel deze uitgangspunten ons in staat stellen om zulke kritiek uit te voeren, moet dekolonisatie worden begrepen als iets dat heen en weer beweegt tussen die uitgangspunten en de conclusies die voortvloeien uit de discoursanalyse van kolonialiteit en moderniteit.

## Acknowledgements

Many people have contributed to the completion of this manuscript directly and indirectly. First, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my PhD supervisors who led me through this long and uneven path. To Professor Ernst van Alphen for extending a generous intellectual hospitality to a stranger and for supporting me throughout the process. You navigated me firmly through the maze of cultural theory, and the breadth and clarity of your scholarly vision was the model of my humble endeavour. Dr Noa Roei became a close friend and at times an intellectual opponent. I'm grateful for the time you spent commenting on my drafts and debating my arguments. I am particularly indebted to you for elucidating the methods of cultural analysis and for introducing me to decolonial theory which is central to my thesis. Professor Esther Peeren joined at a later stage, yet her contribution was immense and decisive. Your sharp comments help me to bring this project to conclusion even if at times we agreed to disagree.

Professor Daniel Raveh has been a dear friend and mentor since the time I was an art student at the University of Rajasthan, Jaipur. His friendship enlivened my intellectual quest and encouraged me to take on this project. Dr Sonia Stein Weiner read and commented on the first version of this thesis generously and patiently, and I am deeply thankful to her for guiding me through the process of writing and making academic arguments. I began this journey while teaching at Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi. Those years were formative in terms of my exposure to contemporary philosophy and shaping my theoretical concerns. I would like to thank Professor Franson Manjali and Professor Saitya Brata Das for their stimulating intellectual companionship.

I wrote the lion share of this thesis while teaching at OP Jindal Global University. I am thankful to this splendid institute and its dynamic Vice Chancellor Professor Raj Kumar for providing the faculty with an ideal environment to teach, learn, and research. My students at OP Jindal Global University and Shiv Nadar University were the first to engage with my ideas about the order of art and its entanglement with colonialism and I am highly appreciative for their openness and criticism.

My family was a great support in this endeavour. I would like to thank my wife Chana and children, Ayan and Ilyad, for giving me the time to research, and for being in my life as they are, sweet, lively, and mischievous. My academic interest was shaped by my parents Rabbi Haim Anzi and Nava Anzi for whom the pursuit of knowledge is one of the highest spiritual values. My older brother Dr Menashe Anzi was always one of my main sources of inspiration and his advice guided me from the initial stages of this project. I owe him the exposure to postcolonial theory and our conversations helped me to position myself in relation to issues of identity, particularism, and coloniality. I wrote my PhD in parallel to my sister Dr Rachel Anzi Levi who supported me both morally and academically.

Several people helped me while researching on contemporary Indian and Israeli artists. I would like to thank Renu Modi, Gargi Gupta, Vidya Shivadas, and Peter Nagy. I would also like to express my gratitude to Tuntty Chauhan of Threshold Art Gallery who has been supporting my art practice and research for over a decade. The time spent in India had a decisive impact on my thinking and fashioned the ideas expressed in this project. This thesis is thus dedicated to those who made this journey possible, first and foremost and with utmost love and respect to Mian.