The fingerprint of an old master: on connoisseurship of Dutch and Flemish seventeenth-century paintings: recent debates and seventeenth-century insights

Tummers, J.C.

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

UvA-DARE is a service provided by the library of the University of Amsterdam (http://dare.uva.nl)
# Table of Contents

**Preface**

**Chapter 1. The Fingerprints of Dutch and Flemish Old Masters: Research since 1945**
- Introduction
- The Van Meegeren Scandal – A Turning Point
- Two Types of Connoisseurs
- Pictology and the Search for Objectivity
- Rembrandt Research and the Integration of Scientific Techniques
- Thinking without Thinking
- An Ongoing Debate

**Introduction to the Chapters 2-6. A Closer Look at Seventeenth-Century Sources**

**Chapter 2. Original or Copy**
- A Crucial Distinction
- Practical Methods to Distinguish Originals from Copies
  - Resolution versus Inhibition
  - Defining Originals
  - Non-Originals and Various Types of Copies
  - Parallels between Theory and Practice
- The Reputation of the Copy

**Chapter 3. ‘By His Hand’: The Paradox of Seventeenth-Century Connoisseurship**
- Introduction
- The Debate: Autograph Pictures, The Holy Grail of Present-Day Connoisseurs?
- The Master’s Name and Its Implications
- Distinctions in Seventeenth-Century Inventories and Notarial Deeds
- Master, Pupil or ‘Retouched’
- Further Distinctions: A Preference for Autograph Pictures?
• Quality Distinctions Reflected in the Signature 102
• Seventeenth-Century Insights as to Attributing Pictures 105
  - Manner 105
  - The Paradox of Seventeenth-Century Connoisseurship 108
  - Masterly Passages 110
  - Beyond the Paradox 113
  - Collaborations 115

Chapter 4. ‘Without Changing his Manner’: Seventeenth-Century Views on Style
• Introduction 123
• Style or Manner 124
• Developing a Style 126
• Style and Individual Character 130
• Style: Artful or Artificial 132
• Stylistic Changes over Time 135
• Alternating and Adjusting Styles 140
  - Style and Pricing 141
  - Style and Location 144
  - Style and Country 148
  - Style and Subject 151
  - Style and Function 156
  - Variation and Virtuosity 159

Chapter 5. The Painter versus the Connoisseur? The Best Judge of Pictures in Seventeenth-Century Theory and Practice
• Introduction 163
• Painters and Art Experts (schilders en konstverstandigen) 166
• Ideal Judgements and Pretentious Comments 171
• The Best Judge – The Painter? 175
• The Best Judge – The Connoisseur? 178
• Judging Pictures in Practice 181

Chapter 6. The Essence of Seventeenth-Century Connoisseurship
• The Riddle of Quality 185
• Categories of Quality: Genres, Nations and Periods 191
• Criteria of Quality 199
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- ‘Painterly’ Topics and Motifs 199
- Invention, Composition and Design 204
- Colours, Light and Brushwork 215
- Expression 222
- The Sum of the Parts 228

**Epilogue. A Disputed Rembrandt** 237

**Summary in English** 253

**Summary in Dutch** 259

**List of Illustrations (see enclosed CD)** 267

**Bibliography** 281