The fingerprint of an old master: on connoisseurship of Dutch and Flemish seventeenth-century paintings: recent debates and seventeenth-century insights

Tummers, J.C.

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

Preface

0.1 Caspar Netscher (formerly attributed to Ter Borch), *Soldiers Carousing in an Inn*, 1658, Philadelphia Museum of Art

Ch. 1

1.1. Han van Meegeren, *Christ and his Disciples at Emmaus*, c. 1937, Museum Boymans-van Beuningen


1.4. Johannes Vermeer, *Christ in the House of Martha and Mary*, c. 1655, National Gallery of Scotland

1.5. Johannes Vermeer, *Diana and her Companions*, c. 1655-56, Royal Picture Gallery Mauritshuis, The Hague

1.6 Johannes Vermeer, *Young Lady at a Virginal*, c.1670, Private Collection

1.7 Attributed to Johannes Vermeer, *Girl with A Flute*, c. 1665-1670, National Gallery of Art, Washington D.C.


1.11 Anonymous, *Laughing Man*, twentieth-century pastiche in the style of Frans Hals, current location unknown

1.12 Drawings by Giovanni Morelli for his *Kunstkritische Studien über italienische Malerei*, 1890, I (published under the pseudonym Ivan Lermolieff).


1.14 a & b Examples of spontaneous (a) and copied (b) lines, after Maurits van Dantzig, *Pictology, an analytical method for the attribution and evaluation of pictures*, Leiden 1973.


1.17 fig. Infrared reflectograph showing Fabritius' signature, after Duparc 2006

1.18 Rembrandt van Rijn, *Samson and Delilah*, c. 1629/1630, Gemäldegalerie Berlin


1.20 Rembrandt van Rijn, *Self-Portrait*, 1630, National Museum, Stockholm

1.21 Rembrandt van Rijn, *Old woman praying*, c. 1629/1630, Salzburger Landessammlungen, Residenzgalerie

1.22 Rembrandt van Rijn, *Portrait of a Man, probably a Member of the Van Beresteyn Family*, 1632, Metropolitan Museum, New York

1.23 Rembrandt van Rijn (?), *Portrait of a Woman, probably a Member of the Van Beresteyn Family*, 1632, Metropolitan Museum, New York

1.24 Rembrandt van Rijn, *Portrait of Anna Six-Wymer*, 1641, Six Collection, Amsterdam
1.25 Malcolm Gladwell (portrait photograph from the author's website http://www.gladwell.com)


1.27 Rembrandt van Rijn (?), *Portrait of Rembrandt with Gorget*, c. 1629, Royal Cabinet of Paintings Mauritshuis, The Hague

1.28 Rembrandt van Rijn, *Self-Portrait with Gorget*, 1629, Landesmuseum, Nuremberg

1.29 Peter Paul Rubens, *Christ, John and Two Angels*, c. 1615-1620, Wilton House, Salisbury

1.30 Carel Fabritius, *Man in a Helmet*, 1648/1649, Groninger Museum

**Ch. 2**

2.1 a, b & c Annibale Caracci, *Landscape with Bathing Figures* (drawing) and two copies, Van Gelder 1958, figs. 1-3


2.3 Hendrick ter Bruggen, *Singing Lute Player*, c. 1624, Kremer Collection

2.4 Raffaello Sanzio, *Portrait of Leo X with Two Cardinals*, c. 1518-1519, galleria degli Uffizi, Florence (before restoration)

2.5 Andrea del Sarto (after Raffaello Sanzio), *Portrait of Leo X with Two Cardinals*, 1624, Museo di Capodimonte, Naples

**Ch. 3**

3.1 Rembrandt van Rijn, *The Shipbuilder and His Wife*, 1633, The Royal Collection, Her Majesty Queen Elisabeth II, London

3.3 Rembrandt van Rijn, *Portrait of the Remonstrant Minister Johannes Uyttenbogaert*, 1633, Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam

3.4 Gerrit van Honthorst, *Allegory on the Marriage of Frederick Henry and Amalia van Solms*, 1651, Oranjezaal, Huis ten Bosch

3.5 Gerrit van Honthorst, *William II’s Reception of Mary Stuart upon her Arrival in the Netherlands*, 1649, Oranjezaal, Huis ten Bosch

3.6 Gerrit van Honthorst, *Frederick Henry’s Steadfastness*, after 1649, Oranjezaal, Huis ten Bosch

3.7 Jan Steen, *Merry Family* (*So de Oude Songen, Pijpen de Jonge*) (detail of the drapery), 1668, Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam

3.8 Albrecht Dürer, *Melencolia* (detail of the drapery), 1514, Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam

3.9 detail of: Lucas van Leyden, *The Holy Family* (detail of the drapery), c. 1506-1510, Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam

3.10 Hans Holbein, Henry VIII, (detail of the hair), c. 1536, Thyssen-Bornemisza Collection, Madrid

3.11 Jacob van Ruisdael, *Forest Scene* (detail of the foliage), ca. 1655, National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C.

3.12 Meindert Hobbema, *Farm in the Sunlight* (detail of the foliage), c. 1668, National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C.


3.14 Peter Paul Rubens and Frans Snyders, *Prometheus*, c. 1611-1612, completed by 1618, Philadelphia Museum of Art, Philadelphia
Ch. 4

4.1 Anthony van Dyck, *Madonna and Child with Donors*, 1641, Louvre, Paris

4.2 Tiziano Vecellio, *Youth with Dogs*, 1575-76, 100 x 117 cm, Museum Boijmans Van Beuningen, Rotterdam


4.3.b Rembrandt, *Self Portrait with Beret and Up Turned Collar* (detail), 1659, National Gallery of Art, Andrew W. Mellon Collection

4.4 Willem Isaacsz. van Swanenburg, naar Michiel van Mierevelt, *The Judgment of Paris* (engraving), 1609 (photograph RKD)

4.5 Anthonie van Montfoort, called Blocklandt, *Joseph and the Farao*, Centraal Museum, Utrecht

4.6 Michiel van Mierevelt, *Portrait of Maurits (1567-1625), Prince of Orange*, 1613, Rijksmuseum Amsterdam

4.7 Frans Hals, *An Elderly Woman known as 'Malle Babbe'* , c. 1633-1635, Gemäldegalerie, Berlin

4.8 Gerrit Dou, *Self-portrait*, c. 1645, Kremer Collection

4.9 Albrecht Dürer, *Portrait of a Young Man*, 1500, Alte Pinakothek Muchen


4.11. Willem Key, *Saint Hieronymus*, c.1550-1560, Alte Pinakothek, Munich


4.13 Frans Snyders, *Still Life with Dead Game, Fruits, and Vegetables in a Market*, 1614, Art Institute of Chicago


4.16 Cornelis Cornelisz. van Haarlem, *Followers of Cadmus devoured by a Dragon*, 1588, National Gallery London


4.19 Aelbert Cuyp, *Evening Landscape*, late 1650s, The Royal Collection, Her Majesty Queen Elizabeth II, London

4.20 Dirck Barendszoon, *Triptych with the Life of Mary*, c. 1665, Sint Janskerk, Gouda


4.22 Aelbert Cuyp, *Orpheus Charming the Animals*, 1639, Private Collection, Boston


4.26 & 4.27 Gabriel Metsu, *A Man Writing a Letter* and *A Woman Reading a Letter*, 1664-1666, National Gallery of Ireland, Dublin

4.28 Gerrit Dou, *Lady at her Toilet*, 1667, Museum Boijmans van Beuningen, Rotterdam

4.30 Pieter de Grebber, *Triumphal Procession, with Spoils of War*, 1648, Oranjezaal, Huis ten Bosch

4.31 Pieter de Grebber, *Triumphal Procession, with Sacrificial Bull*, 1650, Oranjezaal, Huis ten Bosch

4.32 Pieter de Grebber, *The Ascension of Frederick Henry into Heaven*, 1650, Oranjezaal, Huis ten Bosch

4.33 detail of fig. 4.31

4.34 detail of fig. 4.32

4.35 Peter Paul Rubens, *Saints Gregory the Great, Maurus and Papia*, 1606-1608, Church of Santa Maria in Vallicella, Rome

4.36 Peter Paul Rubens, *Portrait of a Lady and her Dwarf*, 1606, Kingston Lacy, National Trust


4.38 David Teniers, *Christ Carrying the Cross*, Private Collection, Belgium

4.39 Francesco Bassano, *Christ Carrying the Cross*, c. 1592, Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna, inv. nr. 1869


4.41 Hendrick Goltzius (in the manner of Albrecht Dürer), *The Circumcision* (engraving), 1593-1594, Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam

4.42 Fig. Nicolas Poussin, *The Baptism (from the series The Seven Sacraments)*, 1647 National Gallery of Scotland, Edinburgh

4.44 (1.21) Rembrandt van Rijn, *Old Woman Praying*, 1629/1630, Salzburger Landessammlungen, Residenzgalerie

4.45 (1.20) Rembrandt van Rijn, *Self-Portrait*, 1630, National Museum, Stockholm


4.47 Carel Fabritius, *Man in a Helmet*, 1648/1649, Groninger Museum


4.50 (4.7) Frans Hals, *An Elderly Woman known as 'Malle Babbe’*, c. 1633-1635, Gemäldegalerie Berlin

4.51 Frans Hals, *Portrait of Cornelia Claesdr Vooght*, 1631, Frans Hals Museum, Haarlem

4.52 (1.24) Rembrandt van Rijn, *Portrait of Anna Six-Wymer*, 1641, Six Collection, Amsterdam

4.53 (5.4) Tintoretto, *Crucifixion*, 1565, Scuola Grande di San Rocco, Venice

4.54 Rembrandt van Rijn, *Woman with a White Cap*, c. 1640, Private Collection

4.55 Rembrandt van Rijn, *Woman Weeping*, mid to late 1640s, Detroit Institute of Arts

**Ch. 5**

5.1 Jan Breughel the Elder and Hieronymus Franken II, *The Archduke Albert and*
Archduchess Isabella in a Collector’ Cabinet, c. 1621-1623, Walters Art Gallery, Baltimore

5.2 Pieter Codde Art-Lovers in a Painter’s Studio, c. 1630, Staatsgalerie, Stuttgart

5.3 David Vinckboons, Forest Scene with Robbery (drawing), c. 1612, Private Collection

5.4 (4.53) Tintoretto, Crucifixion, 1565, Scuola Grande di San Rocco, Venice

5.5 (4.41) Hendrick Goltzius (in the manner of Albrecht Dürer), The Circumcision (engraving), 1593-1594, Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam

5.6 Pieter Breughel the Elder, The Painter and the Connoisseur, mid-1560s, Grafische Sammlung Albertina, Vienna

Ch. 6

6.1 From Roger de Piles, Balance des Peintres, Paris 1708


6.3 Frans Floris, The Painter Rijk met de Stelt as Saint Luke painting the Virgin, 1556, Museum voor Schone Kunsten, Antwerp

6.4 Rembrandt School, A Painter’s Studio, c. 1630, Kremer Collection

6.5 Johannes Vermeer, The Milk Maid, 1660, Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam

6.6 Rembrandt van Rijn, Study of an Old Man with a Beard, c. 1659, Private Collection, U.S.A.

6.7 Adriaen Brouwer, Peasants Fighting, c. 1631-35, Alte Pinakothek, Munich

6.8 Rembrandt van Rijn, Diana Surprised by Acteon and the Discovery of Callisto’s Pregnancy, 1634, Museum Wasserberg Anholt, collection Fürst zu Salm-Salm, Anholt
6.9 Bartholomeus Spranger, *Venus and Adonis*, 1597, Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna

6.10 Peter Paul Rubens and Frans Snyders, *Medusa Head*, ca. 1617-1618, Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna


6.12 Adriaen van de Werff, *Children Playing before a Hercules Group*, 1687, Alte Pinakothek, Munich


6.15 Dirck van Baburen, *The Procuress*, 1622, Museum of Fine Arts, Boston

6.16 Jacob Cuyp, *Shepherdess and child in a landscape with sheep*, 1627, Dordrechts Museum

6.17 Aelbert Cuyp, *Shepherds and Shepherdesses*, c. 1643-1645, Private Collection, Belgium


6.20 Rembrandt van Rijn, *History Painting*, 1626, Museum Lakenhal, Leiden

6.21 Nicolaes Maes, *The Eaves Dropper*, 1657 Dordrechts Museum, on loan from Instituut Collectie Nederland


6.23b Gerard de Lairesse, *Allegory of the Five Senses*, 1668, Kelvingrove Art Gallery and Museum, Glasgow


6.25 frontispiece of Philips Angel, *Lof der Schilderkonst*, Leiden 1642


6.27 From Gerard de Lairesse, *Groot Schilderboek*, Haarlem 1740 [Amsterdam, 1707], p. 215

6.28 Willem van de Velde the Younger, *Ships at Sea*, c.1658, Royal Cabinet of Paintings, The Mauritshuis, The Hague

6.29 Anthony van Dyck, *Portrait of a Father and His Son, Also Known as Guillaume Richardot*, c.1618-1619, Musée du Louvre, Paris

6.30 Tiziano Vecellio, *Bacchanal of the Andrians*, 1523-24, Museo del Prado, Madrid

6.31 From Roger de Piles, *Cours de peinture par principes*, Paris 1708, 382


6.34 Rembrandt van Rijn, *Judas Repentent, Returning the Pieces of Silver*, 1629, Private Collection, England

6.35 Jan van Vliet (after Rembrandt), *Judas Repentent* (engraving), 1634, British Museum, London

6.37 From Charles le Brun, *Conférence de Monsieur Le Brun sur l'expression générale et particulière*, Paris 1667 [cited ed. London 1734], fig. 35 "Astonishment with Fright"

6.38a & b Jacob Jordaens, *Allegory of Fertility* (entire painting and detail), c. 1623, Musées Royaux des Beaux-Arts, Brussels


6.40 Dirck van der Lisse, *Arcadian Landscape*, c. 1635, Kremer Collection

**Epilogue**

7.1 Rembrandt van Rijn, *David and Jonathan*, 1642, The State Hermitage Museum, Saint Petersburg

7.2 Rembrandt van Rijn, *The Company of Frans Banning Cocq and Willem van Ruytenburch, known as the 'Night Watch'*, 1642, Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam


BIBLIOGRAPHY

AHK
Archief Haagsche Kunstkring, Haags Gemeente Archief

Ainsworth et al. 1982
Maryan Wynn Ainsworth et al., Art and Autoradiography: insights into the genesis of paintings by Rembrandt, Van Dyck, and Vermeer, New York 1982

Alpers 1988

Angel 1642
Philips Angel, Lof der schilder-konst, Leiden 1642

Aono 2008
Junko Aono, ‘Reproducing the Golden Age: Copies after Seventeenth-Century Dutch Genre Painting in the First Half of the Eighteenth Century,’ Oud Holland 121 (2008), 1-34

Bakker 1995

Bakker 2008
Piet Bakker, Gezicht op Leeuwarden. Schilders in Friesland en de markt voor schilderijen in de Gouden Eeuw, Amsterdam, 2008 (Ph.D. diss., University of Amsterdam)

Baldinucci 1681-1728 [ed. 1974]
Notizie de' professori del disegno da Cimabue in qua, 6 vols, Florence 1681-1728, ed. Ferdinando Ranalli, Florence 1974

Baldinucci 1686
Filippo Baldinucci, Cominciamento, e Progresso dell’arte, Florence 1686

Baldinucci/Matteoli 1975
Francesco Saverio Baldinucci, Vite di artisti dei secoli XVII–XVIII (Florence 1725–30), ed. by A. Matteoli, Rome 1975
Balis 1993

Balis 2007

Barasch 1985
Moshe Barasch, *Theories of Art: from Plato to Winckelmann*, New York 1985

Bauman/Liedtke 1992

Baxandall 1971
Michael Baxandall, *Giotto and the Orators: humanist observers of painting in Italy and the discovery of pictorial composition 1350-1450*, Oxford 1971

Baxandall 1972
Michael Baxandall, *Painting and Experience in Fifteenth-Century Italy*, Oxford 1972

Bechara/Damasio/Tranel/Damasio 1997
Antoine Bechara, Hanna Damasio, Daniel Tranel, and Antonio R. Damasio, ‘Deciding Advantageously Before Knowing the Advantageous Strategy’, *Science* 275 (February 1997), 1293-1295

Becker 1998

Bellori 1672

Van Berge-Gerbaud 1997